

Gender Issues in Technical Training and Vocational Education Programs

Caroline S. Fawcett
and
Sarah Howden

Washington, D.C.
October 1998—N° WID-103

About the authors:

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

1

Introduction

3

Background Information on Women
in the Latin American and Caribbean Workforce

4

Issues, Lessons Learned and Recommendations
Regarding Women's Participation in Training Programs

9

Addressing Gender Issues
throughout the Project Cycle

26

Executive Summary

Although women's labor force participation rates have risen dramatically in Latin America and the Caribbean over the past decade, it is not as high as would be expected by their educational and demographic characteristics. In addition, women in the labor force face a situation of pay inequity, occupational segregation and gender discrimination. Cultural stereotypes regarding appropriate occupations for women continue to affect firms' recruiting and promotion practices. Women themselves respond to this situation by self-selecting into traditional occupations. Under- and unemployment rates are higher for women, who are also over-represented in the informal sector. This inefficient use of female labor wastes human resources, affecting the region's growth.

Given the large number of women now entering the labor market, the need is especially urgent to expand employment opportunities for low-income and young women, and to adapt their skill levels and areas of expertise to the current demands of the market. Technical training projects play a key role in the adjustment of labor supply to meet market demands. However, to be more successful, such projects must address the limited range of occupations in which women currently receive training, as well as the quality of the training. In addition, they must introduce parallel activities which address barriers to effective female participation in training programs.

There is a critical need to strengthen the quality of the training that women receive:

C First, *the technical level of the training offered in traditionally female occupations must be increased* in order to improve women's productivity and the applicability of the training to labor market needs in such areas as textiles, tourism, office work and health care.

C Second, *new training courses and methodolo-*

gies need to be developed to address changing market needs to increase women's employment options (for example, in telecommunications, computer repair, telephone installation).

C Third, *the curricula for traditionally male-dominated occupations (such as plumbing, welding, electricity installation, carpentry, etc.) should be revised*, or pre-training courses should be designed, to ensure that women also have access to those areas.

While there still may be a need in some circumstances to design special programs or components to address the training needs of a particular population of women, the greater need is to develop an integrative strategy whereby women are enrolled alongside men in training courses. At the same time, support activities should be designed to promote women's effective participation and to meet the specific training needs of the female audience. This strategy includes:

C information and promotion campaigns to encourage women to apply;

C pre-training programs for women in order to familiarize them with the basic concepts, terminology and tools of specialized training;

C curricula and materials revision from a gender perspective;

C private sector linkages and outplacement activities targeted to women;

C training of trainers and staff in, gender issues;

C job readiness classes and outplacement activities geared to women's workplace needs, in-

cluding issues on occupational stereotyping,

assertiveness, managing stress and discrimination, self-confidence building, interpersonal skills, and child care issues.

The integrative approach is particularly effective in existing, well-established training institutions, in which new activities can be introduced to complement the specialized technical training activities that are already provided. In such a situation, the specific needs of both men and women can be addressed in the design of the training program.

To ensure that gender issues are addressed during the design of a project, and that its objectives (including the effective participation of women) are met during execution the project team should carry out a gender analysis throughout the project preparation cycle. This Resource Book has been written to assist project officers in this task.

In summary, it is suggested that during the identification stage:

- C *a gender-disaggregated statistical analysis of the target population be conducted;*
- C *the responsiveness of the current institutional structure to gender issues be analyzed; and*
- C *the necessary targeting procedures to ensure women's participation be suggested.*

During orientation:

- C *specific training approaches and support activities should be developed through feasibility studies to increase the number of women enrolling and participating in the training program;*
- C *the necessary resources to effectively implement these activities should be determined; and*
- C *the different agencies that could be involved in project implementation, as well as the possible inter-institutional coordination schemes, should be identified and considered.*

During analysis, the main issues to be examined are:

- C *the size of the project in relation to the target population (defined also by gender);*
- C *the cost of specific women's activities to promote the project objectives, and the appropriate level of cost-sharing between beneficiaries, training institutions and the public and private sectors;*
- C *the inclusion of institutional arrangements to promote women's participation in the project;*
- C *the gender target indicators for the monitoring and evaluation of the project; and*
- C *legal obligations required to achieve the effective participation of women.*

Introduction

The overall goal of the Bank's Women in Development (WID) Policy is to improve the socioeconomic situation of women in Latin America and the Caribbean, and to improve the performance of Bank projects by enhancing women's contributions. To achieve these goals, the 1991 WID Action Plan developed an integrative strategy, whereby gender issues would be incorporated into all Bank operations to promote the equal participation of women in project activities, and to ensure that women, as well as men, benefit from these projects. To assist project officers in this task, gender guidelines, or resource books, are being prepared in specific sectors and sub-sectors of Bank activity. These resource books provide project officers with a tool to assist them in ensuring that future Bank projects take into account gender-related factors that will affect the project's outcome, and make adequate provision for women's participation.

The WID Policy identifies technical training, labor market services and vocational education as priority areas of action since:

- C women make up 30 percent of the workforce in Latin America and over 40 percent in the Carib-

bean;

- C increasing urbanization in the region leads an ever growing number of women to join the labor force; and
- C the number of households dependent on women's income is steadily increasing in the region.

Moreover, in order to compete in the global economy, it is critical for the countries of the region to have a better trained, more productive and flexible labor force that is able to respond to changing economic structures and markets (IDB, 1994c). It is particularly important that the quality and relevance of the training that is provided to women be improved so that they can be active participants in and beneficiaries of the development process, and are not further marginalized during this process of economic transformation. The information in this resource book is focused primarily on training issues regarding skills acquisition in the urban manufacturing and service sectors. Forthcoming resource books will focus on agriculture (including extension services) and microenterprise.

Background Information on Women in the Latin American and Caribbean Workforce

FACTORS INFLUENCING FEMALE LABOR FORCE PARTICIPATION

Increasing Participation of Women in the Workforce

Population census information from 19 Latin American countries shows that from 1960 to 1990 the number of economically active women increased by 211 percent, an increase far greater than that reported by other regions, whereas the number of economically active men increased by 84 percent (FLACSO, 1995).

- C This means that overall, the activity rate for women rose from 18.1 percent in 1960 to 27.2 percent in 1990. At the same time, the male activity rate fell from 77.5 percent to 70.3 percent, respectively (See Table 3).
- C Women's activity rate varies widely throughout the region, with a reported low of 15.6 percent in Guatemala to a high of 39.5 percent in Uruguay (FLACSO, 1995). The activity rates of women in the Caribbean are generally much higher, with a rate of 61 percent in Barbados and 68 percent in Jamaica (United Nations, 1995).
- C During the same period, the percentage of the entire economically active population (EAP) in Latin America that is female grew from 19.1 percent to 28.1 percent, according to census data (see Table 3). Taking into account census-related underreporting and using more recent estimates from household surveys, it is revealed that one out of every three economically active persons in Latin America is a woman (FLACSO, 1995). In some Caribbean countries, 46 percent of the EAP are women (United Nations, 1995).

Lower Fertility and Higher Urbanization Rates

Several factors, an important one being demographics, explain the significant growth in female labor force participation. The average number of children per woman declined in Latin America to an average of three in the early 1990s from an average of five in the early 1970s, although there are wide variations among and within countries (see Table 1) [FLACSO, 1995; United Nations, 1995]. Lower fertility rates have reduced child bearing and rearing responsibilities, although child care tasks still fall almost entirely upon women. Higher rates of urbanization during the past two decades have also affected female labor force participation rates. Urban women constitute 24 percent of the labor force in the region, but are 81 percent of the economically active female population. Urban women's reported labor force participation rate for the region is 32 percent, as compared to 21.1 percent for rural women¹ (CELADE, 1992; Buvinic and Lycette, 1994).

Level and Quality of Education

The rise in labor force participation by women has also resulted from the increased educational access and achievement of women in the region, particularly at the secondary level, during the past two decades.²

¹ When comparing economic participation in rural and urban areas, it is necessary to recognize that the manner in which people become active differs enormously, particularly in the case of women. For instance, women's involvement in rural areas is frequently linked to production for family consumption and not to market activities (FLACSO, 1995). Additionally, agricultural censuses often show women's activity rates to be two or more times as high as indicated by population censuses (Dixon-Mueller, 1985 in IDB, 1995), a finding which is supported by the results of a recent study by the Inter-American Institute for Cooperation on Agriculture (IICA) and the IDB on women food producers (IICA, 1994).

² Although most country studies confirm that women's decision to participate in the labor market depends on education and other demographic characteristics such as the number

On average, the educational attainment of Latin American and Caribbean women is much higher than that of women in other developing regions. Educational enrollment levels have reached near gender parity in many countries. Yet, the situation is very heterogeneous among and within countries of the region. In 1990, 90 percent of the pertinent female age group was enrolled in primary school, except in Bolivia, El Salvador, and Panama (World Bank, 1993). Female illiteracy rates continue to be high in many countries; Bolivia, Dominican Republic, El Salvador, Guatemala, Haiti, Honduras and Peru all have female illiteracy rates above 25 percent, while illiteracy rates for men in these countries are 2 to 21 percentage points lower than those for women (see Table 2) [FLACSO, 1995; United Nations, 1995].

The region can be divided into two different groups, reflecting the relative weight that needs to be given to educational access and achievement versus quality issues. First, there are the countries that still have marked gender differences in enrollment and educational attainment, such as Guatemala, Haiti, Bolivia and Peru (see Table 2). A second category includes countries where access is roughly equal, but there is a problem of gender differences in educational choice and achievement. Girls, for example, tend to have lower achievement levels in math, the sciences, and technical subjects. This is particularly true in vocational and technical education where women are generally enrolled in areas of traditional female employment that are already saturated and are characterized by low productivity and pay (for example, sewing and cosmetology). There is a lack of effective career guidance and counselling in schools and a lack of exposure to employment opportunities for females in technical fields, which gives little incentive for girls to excel in these areas

of children, these variables are much less important in labor market participation decisions in countries with high levels of informal sector participation. In Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru, for example, the probability of a woman participating in the labor force does not change much with increases in education level. In these countries, the impact of higher levels of educational attainment is more on the type of employment (self-employed or wage and salaried sector) than on participation per se (Psacharopoulos and Tzannatos, 1992; Birdsall and Behrman, 1991).

of study.

Falling Incomes

The deterioration of real incomes during the 1980s also contributed to the dramatic increase in the percentage of women in the labor force (see Tables I and 3) [ECLAC, 1992]. Under these conditions, women have been “pushed” into the labor force in an attempt to compensate for the decrease in the household budget resulting from the unemployment, falling wages or absence of males in the household. Interestingly, as the economic situation has improved in the region, women’s labor force participation has continued to grow.

Increase in Female Headship

An important feature of households and another factor in women’s labor force participation is the growing incidence of female heads of household in Latin America and the Caribbean. Currently, the percent of female-headed households ranges between 18 percent in Costa Rica to 44 percent in Barbados (UNESCO, 1991). One factor contributing to this change in family structure is the high number of adolescent mothers, who are increasingly single. In Chile, for example, the number of births to unmarried women between the ages of 15 to 19 rose from 29 percent in 1960 to 61 percent in 1990 (Valenzuela, 1993).

Being a head of household was one of the strongest determinants of female labor force participation in all of the countries considered in the 1992 *Women’s Employment and Pay* study coordinated by Psacharopoulos and Tzannatos. For example, in Colombia, for a female head of household the probability of being in the labor force is 47 percent, as compared to 21 percent for a woman who is not a head of household. The comparable probabilities in Panama are 57 and 20 percent, respectively, and 66 and 34 percent, respectively, in Uruguay. The following characteristics make issues regarding

training, employment, productivity, and pay all the more important for this group of women:

- C Female heads of household tend to have less mobility in entering the job market due to their multiple household responsibilities, which leads to their employment in lower paid jobs, often in the informal sector, and to a higher unemployment rate (Psacharopoulos and Tzannatos, 1992; Birdsall and Behrman, 1991).
- C Women's lower average earnings, fewer assets, and more restricted access to productive resources, such as land, capital and technology, as compared to men, is particularly burdensome for female heads of household since they provide the main economic support for their families.
- C Female heads of household usually have fewer, or no, other adult family members available to assist in sustaining a household, and generally have to support comparatively more dependents than male heads. Empirical evidence shows a strong relationship between female-headed households and poverty (Buvinic, 1991; PREALC, 1991; Bonilla, 1990).

GENDER DIFFERENCES IN THE LABOR MARKET

Although women's participation rates have risen dramatically over the past decade, they continue to be relatively low in most countries of the region as compared to other regions of the world, and when considering that women now have as much, and sometimes more, formal education than men. Several recent studies have analyzed why the role of women in the workforce differs significantly from that of men (Psacharopoulos and Tzannatos, 1992; Birdsall and Sabot, 1991; PREALC, 1992; Winter, 1994). These studies found that pay inequity, occupational segregation, and gender discrimination are all important characteristics of women's participation in the labor force. This inefficient use of female labor wastes human resources and affects the region's growth (Winter, 1995).

Pay Inequity

As can be seen in Table 2, in most countries of the

region, more women than men are now enrolled in secondary school. Yet, these educational gains over past decades notwithstanding, working women typically earn between 60 and 85 percent of men's wages, and in Chile they earn less than half (see Table 3). Although greater levels of education and training reduce the gender wage differential, there are other social and labor market factors which work to maintain it. The Psacharopoulos and Tzannatos study found that, for the region, only about one-third of the observed difference in female and male weekly labor earnings could be explained by differences in education, experience and number of hours worked. The discriminatory recruitment and promotion practices of firms, self-selection of women out of higher-paying occupations, and the interrupted career pattern of women due to child bearing and rearing contribute to pay inequity. Occupational segregation is also an important factor; when relatively few occupations are assigned to women, the consequent crowding leads to a monopsonistic situation (Birdsall and Fox, 1991).

Occupational Segregation

There is a high degree of occupational segregation in the region, whereby women and men are generally employed in different sectors of the economy and in different occupations within the same sector. For example, 62 percent of women work in the service sector, compared to 29 percent of men (ECLAC, 1993). Within this sector, in the area of information processing for example, women hold almost all of the word-processing jobs, while men are employed in the more highly-skilled and better remunerated positions of data-processing (ECLAC, 1989). One measure of occupational segregation within a country is the Duncan Occupational Dissimilarity Index. Several countries have indices greater than .50, including Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Guatemala, Honduras, Jamaica, and Panama (see Table 3). The higher the incidence of occupational segregation, the higher the value of the index³ (Tzannatos, 1991).

³ This index evaluates the sex employment ratio *within* each occupation and calculates their sum *across* occupations, making the index sensitive to sex-ratios within occupations as well as the occupational structure of the labor force as a whole.

Economic labor demand and supply theories can be employed to attempt to explain the high rates of occupational segregation. Under a demand analysis, for such occupational dissimilarity to exist, women must have a comparative advantage over men in certain occupations. Yet such an explanation only begs the question of what these advantages are, and ignores the possibility of misallocated labor due to rigidities and barriers to entry in the labor market. From an economic perspective, if male and female workers are actually substitutes, high levels of occupational segregation are associated with high percentages of misallocated workers. This would indicate an inefficient labor market. The acute sex differentials which are still observed in many countries cannot be explained only by differences in endowments; discriminatory practices in recruitment and job promotion are also generally important explanations. The percentage of the region's labor force in sex-stereotyped employment has actually increased over time, as women's share in the total labor force has risen. In this respect, employment differentials that are due to inefficiency will have increasingly adverse effects on economic performance in the region (Tzannatos, 1991).

An analysis of the labor market using labor supply theory would suggest that women maximize their income or well-being under constraints by choosing employment within a limited range of traditional, generally lower paying occupations. However, this analysis does not delve into the underlying social and labor market factors influencing women's decisionmaking which could lead them to selfselect out of more lucrative occupations. Women's access to the full range of occupations in the labor market is restricted by discriminatory labor market practices and by social, cultural and demographic factors which lead them to limit their labor market options to the traditional occupations.

Informal Sector

The sector of employment—formal or informal—is also a significant explanatory variable of wage differences. The importance of the informal sector to low-income women has been well documented in Latin America; according to survey information,

between 30 and 60 percent of women in the labor force work in the informal sector, the majority in services, including domestic service, commerce or light manufacturing (Buvinic and Berger, 1989; Bonilla, 1990; PREALC, 1991). Employment opportunities are particularly limited for women from poor households and young women. For these two groups, the informal sector, which is characterized by low productivity and earnings and a lack of job stability, is the main path to employment. Women's high levels of participation in the informal sector is linked to its flexible work schedules, low entry and exit requirements, and the ability to integrate other household responsibilities with informal sector work.

Higher Unemployment

Female unemployment rates are also generally higher than men's, which at times is another indicator of discrimination and segregation in the labor market.⁴ A high percentage of the unemployed are new entrants to the labor force, which negatively affects women and young people the most (ECLAC, 1992). For example, in the Dominican Republic, between 1981 and 1990, female unemployment rose from 19.9 percent to 35.1, and 96.7 percent of the unemployed women in 1990 were new entrants to the labor force (Baez, 1991). Ecuador, Panama, Trinidad and Tobago, and Uruguay all demonstrate large gender gaps in youth unemployment rates, and are experiencing high youth unemployment rates (see Table 3) [PREALC, 1992b].

Given the large number of women now entering the labor market, the need is especially urgent to expand employment opportunities for low-income and young women and to adapt the skill levels and areas of expertise of these women to the current technical demands of the market. Technical training projects have a key role to play in the adjustment of labor

⁴ In some situations, the higher unemployment rate of women may reflect the fact that they can at times "afford" to be unemployed or that they have a reservation wage above what the available employment options are offering because of their other household responsibilities.

supply to meet market demands. However, to be more successful, such projects must address the limited range of occupations in which women currently receive training, and the quality of this train-

ing. It must also introduce parallel activities which address the barriers to effective participation in training programs faced by women.

Issues, Lessons Learned And Recommendations Regarding Women's Participation in Training Programs

The Bank has funded many different types of training and vocational education projects through loans and technical assistance programs. Traditionally, the Bank has funded formal, long-term vocational education programs, offered at the formal secondary or postsecondary levels. These programs generally last at least one academic year, and academic certification is conferred upon successful completion. However, recent loans, such as Chile's Worker-Training Program (CH-0024), El Salvador's INE Post-Secondary Program (ES0035), and Argentina's Worker Reconversion Training Program (AR-0062) have offered short-term, basic, and specialized training courses and internship components (see Box 1). Also, the Multilateral Investment Fund has recently financed demonstration projects that include short-term training and a wide range of labor market and support services geared toward women (TC-94-03-50-2; TC-94-04-37; TC-95-0703-1). The MIF is also developing a training model for women heads of household (TC-93-0810-8). There are important gender implications in the different types of vocational education and technical training projects which should be recognized in order to improve women's employment opportunities and the economic productivity of the regional workforce. This section identifies key issues and lesson learned from past training projects in Latin America and the Caribbean, and presents some strategies and new initiatives for responding to these issues.

In recent years, international development agencies have developed a number of initiatives in specific training projects for women: informal sector and microenterprise training, technical skills training in non-traditional occupations, gender awareness in training curricula and facilities, and the performance of needs analyses to better address women's needs in training projects. New strategies and approaches for achieving greater success have been developed based

on the lessons learned from the implementation of these projects.

NEW STRATEGIES: THE INTEGRATIVE APPROACH

While it may still be necessary to design special programs or components to address the training needs of particular populations of women, the general approach now being adopted is an integrated one. Under this integrative strategy, women are enrolled alongside men in training courses; however, support activities promote the participation of women and meet their specific training needs (see Box 2). For example:

- C Promotional material contains an explicit message that the courses are accessible to women and do not evoke an image of being appropriate only for men.
- C Pre-training programs can be offered to women in order to familiarize them with the basic concepts, terminology and tools of specialized training.
- C Job readiness classes and outplacement activities are geared toward the workplace needs of women, and include issues on occupational stereotyping, assertiveness, managing stress and discrimination, building self-confidence, interpersonal skills, and child care issues.

The integrative approach is particularly effective in existing, well-established training institutions, where new activities can be introduced to complement the specialized technical training already provided. In such a situation, the specific needs of both men and women can be addressed in the design of the training program.

Box 1**CHILE'S YOUTH TRAINING PROGRAM**

Chile's Worker-Training Program (CH-0024)—*Chile Joven*—for which IDB cofinancing was approved in 1992, provides short-term training and internships to youth and new entrants to the labor market. The program aims to address the problem of high unemployment—double the national average—among these groups. The target population of 100,000 participants has been exceeded during the execution period. Courses are provided by training institutions which compete through the presentation of project proposals for the opportunity to be involved in the program. To be eligible, the institute must demonstrate that it has secured the sponsorship of private firms for internships, thereby providing on-the-job experience for the trainees and ensuring that the training is offered in areas where there is a need for skilled labor. The institute provides basic job skills training for up to six months before the internship.

Women represent around one-half of the target population, and by the midterm evaluation, 48.6 percent of the participants in the largest training subprogram were women (up from 32.7 percent of the first group of trainees). Courses provided in traditionally female occupations trained women almost exclusively, and only about 10 percent of the trainees in traditionally male-dominated areas were women. Nevertheless, most female trainees were trained in skills that the program considers gender-neutral (Ministerio de Trabajo, Chile, 1994).

Several activities were included in the project's design to facilitate female participation. These included:

- C Promotion and agreements with employer's association to encourage internship placements for women.
- C The provision of child-care options for mothers participating in the program.
- C Gender awareness workshops to trainers and administrative staff.
- C Specific outreach programs to ensure the effective participation of women, including promotion/counseling and screening activities, widening the types of internships offered, and employment services offered to female participants.

Key to the incorporation of gender issues in the design of this program were the studies and consultancies that were completed in the planning stages of the project. A focus group pre-feasibility study was conducted, counterpart consultants advised the project regarding women's issues, the Bank's Women in Development Advisor participated in planning missions, and the entire Project Team assisted in the design and was committed to women's participation (IDB, 1992b).

DEFINING THE TARGET POPULATION

Since different target populations have different training needs and face different barriers to participation, defining the target population and analyzing its characteristics is fundamental to the successful design of the training program, and should be done before the particular activities of the project are planned. This is a critical step for improving women's access to and demand for technical training, particularly within an Integrative approach. The age, education, labor market, and household characteristics of the female and male target population will determine the type, duration, recruitment methods and particular activities of the training program. For example, a training program for women from marginal groups will be significantly different from one that addresses the needs of women from a working class background with incomplete secondary education. Successful models of training programs for the most marginal groups of women are integrated with community services, such as health, housing or other educational activities. They also offer training in the

community for self-employment / microenterprise development (Goldberg, 1992). For women with a working-class background, training can be provided away from the community (for example at the training institute), and a higher skills level of training can be conducted.

The Bank is increasingly supporting training programs that decentralize and privatize much of the actual training services, in order to improve the efficiency of the programs and their match to current labor market needs while reducing the amount of labor market information needed at the central level. However, even in these schemes, basic information about the target population is needed in order to adequately design the project selection criteria, promotional activities and support services. This is particularly true in the face of gender discrimination, pay inequity and occupational segregation in the prevailing labor market, factors which the Bank should be dedicated to reducing in order to improve the efficiency of the labor market and the socio-economic status of women.

Box 2**INTEGRATIVE STRATEGY IN ACTION**

Recently, the national training institutes of nine Latin American countries developed a comprehensive, integrative strategy geared toward addressing the training needs of women.* This strategy includes:

- C information and promotion campaigns to encourage women to apply;
- C revision of curricula and materials from a gender perspective;
- C private sector linkages and outplacement activities targeted to women; and
- C training of trainers and staff in gender issues.

The national action plans for implementing this strategy aim to transform the training institutions to address the occupational and social needs of female participants (CINTERFOR, 1992). The advantages of focusing on existing institution-based training (modifying certain procedures to ensure female participation) rather than on small pilot women's programs, are the continuity major training institutions offer over time, the legitimacy and credibility they can provide, and the facilities and resources they can make available for training courses and research (Fluitman, 1989). With the nine institutions training approximately 2.5 million students a year, the impact of this strategy can be significant.

To assist in this effort, the Bank is in the final stages of preparing the Regional Technical Cooperation Program for Strengthening Technical and Vocational Training for Low-Income Women (TC-04-03-50-2-RG) that will build on the national action plans. The Program will work the main training institutes in four countries (Argentina, Bolivia, Cost Rica, and Ecuador) and CINTERFOR, a regional research and dissemination center for vocational and technical training. The program's objectives are to improve the productivity and employment opportunities of low-income women by designing, testing and disseminating new methodologies for training institutes to improve the way in which they work with women, and by designing and revising curricula and materials to improve the technical level and range of opportunities of the training that is offered to women.

Private Sector Advisory Committees and market studies will help identify the labor skills needed in each country. New curricula will be designed for these areas in order to make them responsive to the trainability level of low-income women. Curricula and materials will also be revised for training courses in traditionally female-dominated skills, in order to raise their technical levels and their relevance to the labor market. The instructors will be trained in the use of the new curricula, and internships and on-the-job training will be provided as an integral part of the training. In addition to these activities, the administrative and training staff and the men and women trainees will receive gender-awareness training. A promotional campaign will be conducted to present the economic opportunities available to women and to counter gender stereotypes, and will be directed to potential trainees, training centers and to the private sector. The women trainees will also be provided with support services, such as personal development training, counseling and professional orientation services, and those with young children will receive a stipend for child care expenses.

(*) Nine Latin American countries and their respective national training institutions evaluated their Women in Training initiatives in a series of workshops and a five-week course during 1991-1992, sponsored by the International Labor Organization-Turin Training Center and the Italian government (CINTERFOR, 1992). Subsequently, action plans were prepared and approved by the Board of Directors of the institutes in the nine countries.

*Recommendation 1:
Gender Analysis⁵*

The purpose of gender analysis is to identify the key determinants of effective female participation in

⁵ A careful analysis of the gender issues needs to be done on a country or regional basis. This resource book can highlight issues that the project officer should be aware of and ideas for approaches to be taken, but with the great variety of labor market situations across the region, it is impossible for one set of general guidelines to fit every situation. For example, in countries like Argentina and Chile the target population has a relatively higher education level and the issues revolve more around retraining and technification of skills. In Bolivia and Peru, lower levels of schooling and large informal sectors make microenterprise strategies more prominent.

training programs. Using data disaggregated by sex, the following are some of the demographic, economic and social indicators that need to be considered in the analysis:

- C geographic location, age, number of children, age of youngest child, sex of head of household;
- C labor market participation rate, occupational status and sector, income level (individual and household); and
- C years of schooling, and drop-out rates.

This information can be used to analyze the special

needs of the female audience and specific approaches and activities to address them can be introduced into the project. The gender analysis is an integral part of the exercise to identify and characterize the target population.

*Recommendation 2:
Setting Gender Targets*

The information gathered in the gender analysis can be used to set an objective for the desired percentage of women participants. This is particularly useful in the planning stage of a program. As discussed in the second section, occupations are highly segregated in the Latin American and Caribbean workplace. *The greater the degree of occupational segregation in the labor market, the greater the need for specifically targeting the participation of women in non-traditional occupations in the design of any training program.* Existing rigidities in the education system and labor market will preclude gender parity if positive interventions are not included in the program. The promotion of women in nontraditional occupations begins with encouraging women to train in these fields and supporting them in job placement, which will, in turn, reduce occupational segregation and the misallocation of labor resources.

*Recommendation 3:
Self-Selection through Training Level*

The type of education and training offered essentially defines the type of individual who will choose to participate in the program. This targeting method relies on self-selection; only participants of specific characteristics (e.g. low education) will choose to participate in the program. Literacy training, basic skills training, and specialized training courses offered at a level appropriate for trainees with a primary or incomplete secondary school education are examples of programs which reach lower-educated, lower-income groups. These types of programs tend to reach more women.

Recommendation 4:

Complementary Information

In addition to gender and education levels, other demographic characteristics of the target population should be considered. Geographical information will identify the physical location of groups of specific income levels or working in specific productive sectors. Age targets are essential to the type of training offered. These include, for example, youth training, new employee training, on-the-job training, or retraining. Household characteristics, including sex of the head of household, number of children, and basic living standards, along with geographical information, is particularly effective in targeting groups at or below the poverty line. For example, one possible target is single, female heads of households living in abject poverty. Unemployment and under-employment rates are also useful in identifying the areas with greatest needs.

PROJECT DESIGN ISSUES

Outdated Curricula

Female enrollment in training institutions averages 38 percent in the region. *Yet, most of the training takes place in traditional occupational areas (such as food processing, cosmetology, secretarial skills, and sewing) that are characterized by low wages and little potential for advancement.* In contrast, industrial courses in electronics, metallurgy, and mechanics, which represent approximately 75 percent of all course offerings at training institutions in the region, have female enrollment rates of only around 5 percent (CINTERFOR, 1992). Clearly, there is a critical need to strengthen the quality of the training that women receive (see Box 3).

- C *The technical level of the training offered in traditionally female occupations must be improved to raise female productivity and the applicability of the training to labor market needs in such areas as textiles, tourism, office work, and health care.*

Box 3**RAISING FEMALE PRODUCTIVITY AND JOB OPTIONS
IN TRADITIONAL AND NONTRADITIONAL SKILLS**

To improve women's skills and productivity in areas in which they are already working, CIPAF, a nongovernmental organization in the Dominican Republic, conducts training courses for women in traditional occupations, which aim to improve their level of skill and productivity. For example, skills upgrading for public sector typists has included courses to acquaint them with computers and teach them word processing. To raise the productivity and earning potential of domestic workers, CIPAF has offered training in cooking and nutrition (Pineda, 1994). To improve and increase women's job options, CIPAF has also sponsored training in nontraditional areas, such as plumbing and repair of small electronic appliances. It is currently planning to expand into woodworking for furniture production.

Programs in other countries have also provided innovative training opportunities for women. For instance, in the 1980s, a vocational training and adult education center in Bahia, Brazil, offered courses in metalworking. In Lima, Peru, a cooperative of female taxi drivers, *Ladiescar*, was formed and given training to provide service to the local low-income community. In Chile, the *Chile Joven* program offered young women courses in the installation and repair of telephones, fiberglass reinforced plastics, and printing (Goodale, 1989; Ministerio de Trabajo, Chile, 1994; Pineda, 1994).

- C At the same time, new training courses and methodologies need to be developed to address changing market needs and emerging sectors of the economy to increase the employment options available to women (for example, in telecommunications, computer repair, and telephone installation).
- C *The curricula for traditionally male-dominated occupations (such as plumbing, welding, electrical installation, carpentry, etc.) should be revised, or pre-training courses should be designed to ensure that women also have access to the courses.*

*Recommendation 1:
Revision of Curricula and Materials*

In many of the region's training institutions, curricula and materials relate to traditional occupational patterns which often do not reflect the new occupations open to women in the growing sectors of the economy. The revision of training materials should incorporate and reflect positive images of women in the workplace, the ability of women to perform the tasks of different occupations, interaction between peers (female and male) in the workplace, emerging labor market patterns, and the readiness level of female trainees. The curricula review process in the institution should also be strengthened to support the process of eliminating gender stereotypes.

*Recommendation 2:
Integrated Revision*

In many training projects in developing countries, there has been concern regarding the materials developed for instructional purposes (USAID, 1986; CIDA, 1989). While many projects have rewritten materials, these same projects have not funded other institutional changes, such as curricula reform or gender training of trainers and counselors. Materials development is only one aspect of the institutional change needed to encourage women to participate and succeed in training. *For that reason, materials development must be integrated with other activities, and not be an isolated component (See Box 2).*

*Recommendation 3:
Stepwise Approach to New Markets*

One component of curricula revision is the identification of new, marketable areas for training, an activity which is central to the growing number of labor retraining programs supported by the Bank (for example, Argentina's Worker Reconversion Training Program—*Proyecto Joven*). Previous innovative training projects for women in Latin America and the Caribbean have focused on incorporating women into the most difficult areas of the nontraditional occupations, such as in mechanics and electronics.

A new technique in developing new courses for women is the *stepwise approach* which relates similarities in the occupational background and existing skills of the participants with the skill needs in more productive sectors in order to identify possible new training areas. With this approach, training programs can identify and incorporate more technical skills into traditional women's training curricula. For example, cooking classes can become more technical in orientation, and include food preparation and storage, and food processing. This “*technification*” of traditional women’s curriculum upgrades the quality of training as well as increases the placement prospects for women (CINTERFOR, 1992). Box 4 provides examples of successful stepwise approaches for widening employment opportunities for women through training.

*Recommendation 4:
Private Sector Assistance to Identify Emerging Markets*

Another approach to curriculum development is the identification of new, emerging markets that are not yet gender stereotyped, with private sector assistance. Private sector advisory committees and market studies can help to identify areas where skilled labor is lacking and employers would be interested in

hiring skilled trainees (for example, computer repair, telephone installation, etc.). The *benefit of training women for new, emerging markets* is that they will have fewer negative stereotypes to confront as compared to training in traditionally male-dominated occupations. Likewise, in existing gender-stereotyped occupations, it is easier for women to enter if the market for that occupation is growing and there are few persons with the required training. For example, in the *Chile Joven* program, a project to train paraprofessional veterinarians was successfully able to train and place women trainees—even though veterinarians are traditionally male—because the paraprofessionals were in such high demand.

*Recommendation 5:
Retraining Programs*

Retraining programs are fertile ground for the application of new techniques for curriculum development, as they attempt to widen the occupational choices of workers—as a basis their current skills—by upgrading their technical knowledge, identifying related industries, and supporting the development of small enterprises. Retraining programs often have very significant gender implications, particularly when they are targeting

Box 4

THE STEPWISE APPROACH TO OCCUPATIONAL TRAINING

Two stepwise projects are the self-employment program in Colombia and the Step-Up program in the United States. In Colombia, two highly successful projects trained women in graphic arts and jewelry manufacturing. These occupational fields are related to more traditional employment in sewing, handicrafts, and garment manufacturing. Conducted by the national training institute, SENA, these projects identified growth-oriented, export sectors and provided technical assistance to women to establish small manufacturing operations (CINTERFOR, 1992).

Project Step-Up conducted by Women Ventures in the United States has supported a variety of stepwise programs which increase women’s job skills and employment opportunities. One of their most popular programs involves the upgrading of the skills of housekeeping and food service staffs to match those of maintenance workers for large plant facilities. Basic skills in industrial maintenance, plumbing and carpentry are taught to the women and a pre-apprenticeship course familiarizes them with the basic equipment, tools and concepts used in the profession. Additional orientation includes a two-week course on personal effectiveness to empower the women to act positively in their social and work environment.

A second type of program at Women Ventures relates to Stepwise Training for female high school graduates. Most women with no work experience begin their training at a low-level of skills acquisition, which usually prepares them for the lowest wage jobs. Once completing this phase of development and working for several years, the woman is encouraged to return for more skilled training through more formal instruction channels. This model of continuing education envisions the women’s labor market participation as progressing through several steps, gradually working towards greater skill levels and productivity (Women Ventures, 1992).

gender segregated occupational sectors that are undergoing privatization or other significant adjustments. For example, the retraining of mining workers in Bolivia mainly affects men (although the subsequent relocation of the workers can have profound effects on the employment needs of other family members, which should also be addressed), while the retraining of textile industry workers in Peru primarily affects women. The design of the program will depend on the gender and other characteristics of the target population, and the lessons shared throughout this resource book can be applied.

Recommendation 6:

Considerations when Decentralizing through the Market

Much of the new curriculum development is being done in a market-oriented, decentralized institutional framework, with service providers putting forth proposals for funding of training courses, linked with on-the-job training opportunities. One of the advantages of this approach is that it should ensure that the training that is offered is relevant to current labor market demands. While this framework can expand the occupational choices open to women by expanding the type of course offerings, particularly in new market areas, proactive measures are still necessary to make sure that women have full access to these courses (see also the section on Promotion and Job Placement), so that gender stereotypes which are deeply entrenched in the labor market are not perpetuated. For example:

- C In Argentina's *Proyecto Joven* (AR-0062), a criteria in the technical evaluation of all proposals was the identification of any discriminatory conditions that exclude either of the sexes from participating, such as unnecessary conditions related to physical strength requirements or inadequate infrastructure conditions. The course evaluators are given training in the identification of these situations.
- C Both the Argentina and the Chile *Joven* programs incorporated the development of demonstration projects for women in nontraditional areas (in telephone installation and repair, printing, and fiberglass plastics in the case of Chile), and activities to disseminate information about

successful cases to employers.

Barriers to Enrollment

In some countries, women are not allowed to enroll in some technical or vocational training schools. In many cases where they are now able to do so, the change has come relatively recently, and women are often not encouraged to apply. For example, in Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic, of the three main vocational training schools, one opened its doors to women about seven years ago, another began accepting female students in 1994, and the third still bars women from enrolling (Pineda, 1994).

Another type of barrier to enrollment is the multiple responsibilities that women have, both in and outside of the home. Additional support services for women are needed to assist them in balancing these responsibilities.

Recommendation 1:

Identify Infrastructural or Legal Barriers

Lack of facilities to accommodate women trainees, such as separate lodging facilities in boarding institutions or appropriate sanitary facilities, can exclude or hinder women's participation in technical training courses, particularly in traditionally male-dominated fields. Legal barriers to women's training and employment in nontraditional areas are also important factors in some cases. For example, legislation—concerning night work, shift work and other types of work which are considered dangerous or physically demanding—designed to protect women can also act as a barrier to their employment opportunities in technical fields.

Recommendation 2:

Critical Mass

Another factor is the need for a "critical mass" of female students in non-traditional training courses. Past projects have demonstrated the need for a group of women to participate in the training course, rather than a single, isolated female trainee in an all-male training class.

Recommendation 3:

Training Duration

Vocational education refers to a long-term program which usually includes courses in general and specialized skills training. Technical training can be short- or long-term in nature, and is oriented to occupation-specific training. *The duration of the training program is an Important factor for women's participation.* Because of the dual household/child care and work responsibilities of most female participants, the time costs of the women trainees, particularly in long apprenticeship and vocational education programs, can be extremely high, which in turn leads to high desertion and absenteeism rates (CINTERFOR, 1992). Therefore, the shorter the duration of the class, the higher women's participation rates and the lower the drop-out rates during the program. However, this can also create a trade-off between the number of women reached and the quality of the product. Shorter courses may mean lower quality, and may leave the trainees less prepared for the work world and with fewer employable skills. In the Argentina *Proyecto Joven*, it was found that the course proposals that were targeted primarily for women were the cheaper courses, which is worrisome if that serves as a proxy for quality and future productivity. Project activities can help alleviate this trade-off, by including:

- C information and selection activities to counsel trainees on the time commitment of the program;
- C financial assistance and scholarships for women, particularly those with small children;
- C the provision or facilitation of access to child care services;
- C counseling to assist the trainees in the organization of their household responsibilities to allow them to participate in the course for its full duration; and
- C course schedules and locations that are compatible with women's other responsibilities.

*Recommendation 4:
Child Care*

Any serious effort to increase women's participation in training programs, particularly for young mothers, has to address the need for child care. It must be decided in the project design whether the project should provide or subsidize child care; and, if it is to be provided, the appropriate model for its provision (see Box 5). Some training programs pro-

Box 5

MODELS OF CHILD CARE SUPPORT FOR TRAINING PROGRAMS

There are several excellent models of child care service support; the appropriateness of the various strategies and approaches depends on the country context and the overall project goals. One approach is the Colombia model of home-based child care—*hogares comunitarios*—which uses a system of granting credits to the trainee. The *madre comunitaria* who provides the child care in her home is reimbursed by a central service organization. Similarly, the IDB-financed Argentina *Proyecto Joven* provides a modest stipend to women with children under the age of five to assist in covering the costs of alternative child care arrangements (IDB, 1994). There are many variants of this model and the specific organizational structure depends on the location of the training, the social service institution involved, and the ability for inter-institutional cooperation between the service and training institutions (World Bank, 1989).

Another important model of effective training and child care provision is the community-based model. One example is a project funded by ORT/Uruguay in low-income areas of Montevideo, Uruguay. Community centers receive funding to provide training, health, and education programs at the local level. This training is particularly effective for women, since child care is provided and the courses are held during evening hours. One limitation of this model is that specialized skills training is difficult to provide at all community locations. However, coordination between the community-based group and the larger national training centers offer an avenue for promoting specialized skills training (Fawcett, 1992).

Another interesting program is one that combined the need for child care with training for youth. The SERVOL program in Trinidad and Tobago began as a training project for youth at risk, and expanded to provide child care, and then training in child care for the youth in the center with the practicum carried out with the children in daycare (Doherty, 1995).

vide child care services at the training institute, while others provide a modest stipend to female trainees

with small children to partially cover the cost of alternative child care arrangements. Should no child

care provision be included in the project, personal orientation seminars can address child care issues.

There are two views on the provision of child care in training programs. One view is that child care responsibilities are the major reason for high desertion rates among women, and therefore some form of child care assistance is required to ensure full participation of female trainees. A second viewpoint is that any form of provision or subsidy of child care would be terminated once the training is completed, which in turn would act as a disincentive for the woman to search for employment. However, it is to be expected that the woman's income should be higher after participating in the training course, so she should be better able to absorb the cost of future child care. The more significant issue is whether there will be alternative child care arrangements available to the woman while she is looking for a job and then when she is employed.

Programs where the child care services are provided directly by the training institute can lead to a child care crisis after the course ends and the provision is terminated—making it difficult for the woman to find employment. For this reason, the Argentina *Proyecto Joven* opted for providing a child care stipend during the course, so that the women would have to make their own child care arrangements from the beginning. The Chile *Proyecto Joven* secured enrollment spots for the trainees' children in a government child care program, which is separate from the training program, and to which the women can continue to have access once the training is finished. Several difficulties with this arrangement were, however, that the child care and training course schedules were incompatible for some women, the child care services were far from the women's home and the training center, and there

were no services available for children under the age of two, which particularly affected young women (Gantt, 1995).

*Recommendation 5:
Family Support Networks*

One of the more successful models for assisting women to balance their multiple responsibilities is the "Family Support Networks" program (Women Ventures, 1992). In this model, the woman trainee identifies her family support network which will sustain her during the training period. Family members are urged to attend specific events sponsored by the program, such as family workshops, counseling sessions, and graduation ceremonies. Child care issues are therefore placed in the larger context of the family/ social support network for the individual's participation in the program.

Social Images

Twenty years of project experience has shown that the negative stereotyped image of women in the workplace, held by both men and women, is extremely damaging to women's participation in training programs. Some women's low levels of education, traditional stereotypes of what are appropriate activities for women, lack of role models, and limited family support promote the notion that women are not eligible for training programs and that they will not succeed. This prejudice inhibits women from applying and successfully completing training programs (see Box 6). Gender analysis should qualitatively examine this image problem and assess its seriousness in undermining the participation of women in training programs.

Box 6**SENAI/BRAZIL'S PROMOTION CAMPAIGN**

To promote greater access of women to training opportunities, particularly in nontraditional areas, the Brazilian National Training Institute, SENAI, conducted an information and communication campaign, funded in part by the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), to promote women's participation in technical training in the States of Bahia and Pernambuco in 1991-92. The first stage of the project was a gender analysis of the qualitative and quantitative factors influencing women's participation in existing training and employment programs. The study found that the main problem was the attitude among both employers and unemployed women that women were not qualified for industrial training, and that they would be unable to find jobs in industry after completing the training. In addition, the analysis found that traditional program promotion and information dissemination channels were largely through current students providing information about registration to primarily male family members and friends. During one of the program's planning missions, it was suggested that for the centers that use formal advertisement, the wording of the newspaper ad should be changed to include "for both sexes." The change was made and during the following term's registration period the female participation rate doubled.

A communication campaign was designed, targeting both unemployed women and future private sector employers, to address the above issues on a larger scale. The objectives were two-fold: (i) to inform women of their qualifications to apply for training, and their job possibilities after skills training; and (ii) to educate private sector employers on the technical abilities of female trainees. The promotion campaign utilized both posters and pamphlets, showing female students in courses where they were severely underrepresented, as well as showing women already working in trades and technical occupations. Although the materials were originally developed for Bahia and Pernambuco, the interest in the materials developed resulted in a national distribution within the SENAI system. The campaign has had a large positive impact, with a doubling of women applicants, and a largely successful job placement of women after the training (Lalonde, 1992).

*Recommendation 1:
Promotional Activities*

Promotional activities to encourage women to enroll and participate in training, including the use of appropriate messages, images and mediums, are extremely important (see Box 7). If posters advertising the program only show men, women may assume that they may not apply, or if radio spots are not also used on stations heard by women at times when they listen, the entire target population will not be reached. In particular, promotional activities should present a more updated image of gender roles where both men and women enjoy a full range of employment options. Exposure to technical career opportunities should begin in primary school and continue through secondary school for both boys and girls, presenting a wide range of opportunities for both genders.

*Recommendation 2
Labor Market Services-Screening and Counseling*

Past evaluations have shown that the greater the level of screening and counseling services (which lead to informed and guided self-selection) the more effective the training course (Dougherty, 1989). Screening activities can include student diagnostic exercises

and testing, orientation classes, information workshops and counseling. Screening activities have important gender implications since they are the participant's first contact with a training program. It is extremely important, at this early stage, to present women and men with the full range of courses in which they can enroll, providing them with proper support and information while they are making their decision. In particular, career counselors should avoid prejudices such as women have less need of career guidance than men because they will not work outside the home, or will do so for only a limited time. The range of careers presented to women should not be restricted to skills related largely to women's traditional domestic roles, nor should they be restricted on the mistaken assumption that women do not have the physical or mental capacity for certain types of jobs (Borcelle, 1985). Counseling should also provide men and women with a realistic idea about what course activities and employment in different skills entail (training and working conditions, pay scales, etc.), and about employment opportunities in different occupations. An experimental regional technical cooperation (TC-94-03-50-2) to improve training services for women will provide training to counselors who will accompany the trainees from the start of the course selection process through to the job search process.

Box 7**POSITIVE IMAGES**

Positive images and role models are powerful tools for increasing women's participation in training programs and expanding their horizons. For example, in the Dominican Republic, a training program for women in nontraditional areas found that their interest in taking mechanics course had increased. When the program's staff inquired into why the women were interested in becoming mechanics, they discovered that a female character on a popular daytime television show was a mechanic, and was thus serving as a positive role model for women (Pineda, 1994).

The *Chile Joven* program also found it to be quite effective to use advertising that showed women receiving training in a variety of types of occupations. The format that they employed was a brief interview with male and female trainees expressing their apprehensions before joining the training and their experiences during and after the training course. These messages were targeted to potential trainees, but also to the community at large and to business owners who could then join the program in the internship portion.

Recommendation 3:
Level of Readiness

Another concern relates to the level and aptitude of the female participant to begin a training course. In the past, training projects have assumed a high level of readiness, or *trainability* of the student, often with little regard for the participant's gender and income. Women participants, in particular, often lack the basic math and reading skills, and knowledge of basic concepts and terminology to benefit from the specific skills training offered in highly technical classes (World Bank, 1991). Pre-testing and screening of applicants and general educational indicators (e.g. literacy rates and completion of formal education disaggregated by sex) can indicate the readiness of beneficiary population for technical training, and the level and type of interventions necessary, such as pre-training courses (see Box 8).

Recommendation 4:
Gender Training of Instructors and Administrative Staff

The effectiveness of the teaching staff depends on a variety of factors: ability to communicate and interact with female trainees; sensitivity to the multiple obstacles facing women trainees; ability to diagnose the skill acquisition level of the trainees; and the ability to adjust the curriculum to reach the particular audience. Women faculty members provide excellent role models for female trainees, yet so may male teachers. Gender training is important to educate trainers of both sexes about gender issues. It

is also important to provide gender training for the staff conducting the training center's registration process and providing orientation and counseling services, so that they are capable of and motivated to present women with all of their available options.

To a large degree, the teaching staff reflects the general attitude of the institution, which is set by the leadership of the organization. The director and deputy directors of the training institutes establish the level of concern and commitment to gender issues. Without administrative support, trainers have no incentive or support to establish women's support activities or training methods that address gender issues.

Finding Employment

A major issue is women's decision and ability to join the labor market after receiving training. One overriding concern is the lack of opportunities for women to participate in on-the-job learning activities, such as apprenticeships, internships and other firm-based training activities, which are important for increasing the job placement possibilities of the trainee. This is an issue to be considered in the new vocational training programs which focus on decentralized provision of training services and employer's demands for labor. In situations where there are labor market failures, such as gender discrimination, the provision of training through the private sector requires that other proactive measures be taken to ensure that women have access to training in growing sectors and occupations.

Box 8**APPLICANT SCREENING DETECTS TRAINING READINESS**

Most programs targeted to training women in nontraditional skills find that they need to provide the participants with some general skills training in math, measurements, and basic machinery concepts. As part of the initial screening process, the Tools for Tomorrow: Women in the Trades Program, in Madison, Wisconsin, conducts a math assessment. If participants need additional preparation in that area before beginning the trades course, free math review courses are offered at the same training center, and applied math, mechanical reasoning and spatial relations are all taught as part of the specialized skills training program (Tools for Tomorrow, 1994). Likewise, in CESUN's metalworking training program for women in Brazil and in the plumbing and electronic appliance repair training program supported by CIPAF in the Dominican Republic, courses in math, measurements and design are provided as needed (Pineda, 1994; Goodale, 1989). By looking at the trainability of the potential beneficiaries, programs can be designed to address barriers to participation and successful course completion.

*Recommendation 1:**Private Sector*

Linkages. A variety of mechanisms can be used to promote private sector linkages with women's training programs:

- C *Private Sector Advisors* assisted female trainees in their placement in the private sector as part of a non-traditional skills training project in Colombia, and are a part of the design of the IDB-financed Regional Technical Cooperation Program for Strengthening Technical/Vocational Training for Low-Income Women, which is in the final stage of the project cycle (CINTERFOR, 1992; IDB, 1994).
- C *Agreements between firms in the industry and training institutions* can promote training placements for women in the private sector, as was done in the *Chile Joven* youth training program (IDB, 1992).
- C *Promotion campaigns* directed towards private sector industry and union organizations to promote women in the workplace have been conducted in several countries, including Brazil (Lalonde, 1992). As part of the *Argentina Proyecto Joven*, seminars and meetings will be held, brochures disseminated and a promotion campaign conducted to promote female labor among private sector employers (IDB, 1994).
- C *Technical evaluation criteria* can be incorporated into the review of course proposals, in decentralized service provision programs, like

Argentina Proyecto Joven, to identify potentially discriminatory conditions (IDB, 1994).

*Recommendation 2**Labor Market Services-Job Placement*

A wide range of activities can follow the formal instruction period in a training course, such as job placement activities, career counseling, internships, apprenticeships, and other firm-based learning activities. The most effective activities are those that expose the trainee to the actual workings of the firm. Activities that link training with the private sector are extremely effective in promoting women's participation by providing them with a better understanding of their options, and improving their employment opportunities after the conclusion of the course, particularly in non-traditional areas. Services which support women during the job search process (with job interview skills, information about improving their appearance to look more professional, etc.) are also important, since women tend to have lower self-esteem than men, particularly when attempting to enter nontraditional areas. These supplemental activities are instrumental in reducing drop-out rates, promoting job placement, and transforming the expectations of the participants, the training institutions, and the firms (see Box 9).

*Recommendation 3:**Role Model and Mentoring Programs for Women*

One of the most effective strategies for training women, particularly in non-traditional skills, is a role model program, where women mentors in rela-

Box 9**NONTRADITIONAL TRADES: IMPORTANCE OF JOB PLACEMENT ACTIVITIES**

Various projects have funded training for women in nontraditional areas; some have had greater success than others, with one of the determining factors being the level of job placement activities. The Kingston Construction Collective in Jamaica, which began in 1983, chose to provide training to women in construction skills since, at the time of the program's inception, construction was a booming industry, and wages were generally double or more what is earned in traditional female occupations. A major feature of the Jamaican construction industry is that between 70 and 100 percent of the trade work on each site is carried out by subcontractors on a task basis, most of whom through informal trade "gangs," making it a very difficult network into which to enter. The balance of building work, however, is done by direct hire, on a day-rate basis by the main contractor. The program decided to focus on that market as an area of entry, which then could provide the women with access to the subcontractors' network. The collective developed a strategy for finding placements through "job auditions" which are offers by the trainees to work on-site on a trial basis at no cost to the employer. If the employer was impressed and offered a long-term job, the auditioner would be paid for the time already worked. If, on the other hand, the auditioner did not perform satisfactorily, the contractor would be under no obligation to pay her. This approach proved to be successful; the program has had placement rates of over 90 percent in such occupations as plumbing, carpentry, masonry, electrical installation, industrial painting, and steelworking (McLeod, 1989; USAID, 1987).

In contrast, the CENAM project in the Dominican Republic, which was designed to provide vocational training and employment services to poor urban women, exemplifies a "problem project." Nontraditional skills training was to be provided in graphic arts and maintenance of small electrical appliances. However, a mid-term evaluation showed that only 25 percent of the female participants had been trained in nontraditional areas. Moreover, 90 percent of these women trainees were unemployed one month following the training. The project's failure to reach its objectives was due both to the weak institutional support that existed for the project, and the lack of support services for the female trainees, both during and following the training course (USAID, 1987).

lated fields are identified as role models for the trainees (CIDA, 1989). These women meet regularly with an individual or group of female trainees to discuss job possibilities, useful communication skills, workplace awareness, and to have general discussions addressing the trainees' concerns. In some instances, the women trainees sign a contract with the mentor on specific goals and objectives to be fulfilled during the training program, and the women mentors serve as the primary counselors and promoters for the women trainees. This model has been developed in Canada, USA, and many European countries and has reduced desertion and absenteeism rates in formal training programs. In Brazil, a communication campaign used women already employed in the field as role models (see Box 6). In the Kingston Women's Construction Collective, women professionals were invited to participate in the training program as instructors and proved to be formidable role models and potential employers (McLeod, 1989).

*Recommendation 4:
Entry Through Self-Employment*

The biggest challenge for institutions providing

training for women in nontraditional areas is job placement. In many countries, occupational stereotyping constrains opportunities for on-the-job training, apprenticeship and other firm-based training for women. As an alternative employment strategy, several training programs have promoted the creation of self-employment opportunities in growth-oriented, export sectors (see Box 4). The training includes microenterprise management, export promotion, and specific skills training. In other programs in the region, training has been provided for women-owned microenterprises or cooperatives that provide local services, such as housing construction (see Box 10), small-scale domestic repairs, production of hand water pumps, and transportation services (Massey, 1992; IDB, 1991; McLeod, 1989). These approaches require a broad range of project support, including credit, training in technical skills and in management and marketing, technical assistance, and support services (including personal effectiveness training), so that these women have the skills, resources and confidence to start enterprises in new areas (CINTERFOR, 1992; Fluitman, 1989; Antrobus and Rogers, 1980).

Ongoing training for microentrepreneurs that are

already in the sector, and training for the establish

Box 10 WOMEN'S CONSTRUCTION FIRM PROVIDES EMPLOYMENT AND LOCAL SERVICE

CEFEMINA, a women's NGO based in San José, Costa Rica, recently began a credit and training program, with the assistance of an IDB technical cooperation and loan, to support the formation of women-owned housing construction companies, a program which emerged from the organization's earlier involvement in community self-help housing construction programs that had high female participation. Through the women's involvement with the housing committees and in the self-help construction process, they gained experience and skills in the areas of warehouse and inventory control, purchasing, supervising workers and coordinating construction activities, and in different building skills. As a result of these new skills, the women's self-esteem also increased, as did their aspirations as they felt more capable of entering new occupations. However, many of the women became frustrated because although they had learned important construction skills, they were not able to apply them in the labor market due to discrimination within the construction sector.

Therefore, in order to be able to capitalize on their skills, and to have a source of income from a sector that yields higher returns than the traditional areas of female microentrepreneurial activity, CEFEMINA, the women participants, and the IDB decided to support this innovative business endeavor. The women, after receiving additional training, technical assistance, legal support, and credit began to build houses—similar to the ones they had built in the self-help construction process—for low-income clients, but have recently expanded into the more lucrative middle-class market (Howden, forthcoming; IDB, 1992).

ment of new microenterprises should be distinguished since the two populations have different needs, experiences and capabilities. The former generally need more specific, applied training that directly responds to their particular problems for it to be useful. Training for new entrants needs to support the women in exploring issues related to the risks and benefits of self-employment and accessing credit. For example, the *Chile Joven* program, which had a subproject aimed at training for self-employment, found that after receiving the technical training, some women—particularly single heads of household—did not feel secure enough about their possibilities for success to access credit, and thus did not use their training to form a microenterprise. This highlights the need for follow-up support services after the initial training period (Gantt, 1995).

Institutional Structure

Gender issues need to be addressed not only during the targeting exercises, but also as pan of the institutional analysis (Floro and Howden, 1994). A major concern with regards to past projects is that the institutions with the greatest experience and knowledge of training are often not the ones conducting the training for women. For example, projects for women are often executed by the borrowing country's Women's Bureau, which generally has little experience in vocational training projects. The

ability to enlist the resources of the strongest training institution in the country greatly enhances the effectiveness of the training program, but only if this institution has the incentive and ability to ensure that the training needs of the targeted female participants are actually met.

*Recommendation 1:
Gender-Based Institutional Analysis*

Institutional analysis needs to assess the institutional strength of various institutions which could potentially be involved in the execution of the training project. This includes formal and informal education institutions, Women's Bureaus and associations, firms and their respective associations, and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs). Institutional strength in terms of gender issues is measured by a variety of indicators:

- C level and area of female enrollment;
- C existence of screening and orientation services that present women with a large range of training options;
- C the responsiveness and flexibility of the curriculum to female trainees' needs;
- C the quality of the inputs (such as the education

- of the faculty and their experience in training women, equipment and space, appropriate facilities for both men and women); and
- C job placement and on-the-job training programs for women trainees, course certification, and interinstitutional cooperation.

In addition, *institutional commitment to women's issues* is critical. Leadership is demanded at all levels during project implementation, including, among others, from the executing agency which coordinates the project, the specific training institutions, and the support organizations.

Ideally, this analysis should also consider the position of other stakeholders in the design and execution of the project, including subsequent job placement. For this reason, strategies for creating constructive links with the private sector and labor unions to promote quality training for women and men in areas that are in demand, and which facilitate subsequent employment need to be carefully studied. The need for promotional and informational activities geared to the private sector need to be evaluated when labor market discrimination, not skills levels, exclude women from certain occupations.

*Recommendation 2:
Replicability*

The larger, more well-established training organizations have historically trained women in traditional occupations. Their programs are usually designed for participants with a secondary education. The smaller organizations, including community groups and women's NGOs, have focused on providing training in nontraditional areas through pilot projects, often to participants with much lower levels of education. The replicability of a training project in a cost-effective manner is a major indicator of its long-term viability, and should be analyzed in the institutional assessment of the project. Problems often arise during attempts to replicate small, pilot project models in a larger training environment. Different mechanisms and design features may have to be introduced when moving a program from a small NGO to a large training institute. For example, women's NGOs often have prior experience working with the trainees as participants of their other pro-

grams. Through the mutual knowledge and confidence that such a relationship engenders, the participants may be more willing and interested in participating in a training program for a nontraditional occupation. In addition, the NGO often has complementary programs and services that address the women's development in other areas, such as self-confidence and the balancing of domestic responsibilities like child care. By carefully analyzing what aspects of the small program were essential in making it a success, the program can be adapted to the needs of a larger environment. This can be done, for example, by addressing the women's other personal development needs for success in the job market, or providing orientation/promotion services which increase the information available to the women so they feel less insecure about entering a training program in a nontraditional skill.

*Recommendation 3:
Interinstitutional Coordination*

Past projects have often been understaffed and ill-equipped to deal with the special labor market and training needs of female participants. Moreover, specific women's training activities have traditionally been small, isolated projects within each country, and have often not been integrated with other training institutions and labor market activities, thereby marginalizing the efforts. This approach is often inefficient since training programs tend to have fairly high fixed costs for the necessary equipment. The involvement of women's organizations and networks in coordination with training institutions, both within the country and the region, solves these organizational concerns. Women's networks and organizations can be instrumental in promoting gender awareness in training institutions, providing specialized services to the formal training institutions and in exchanging information on effective techniques and curricula materials. This type of interinstitutional coordination can increase women's effective participation in mainstream training programs by increasing the executing agency's incentive to address barriers to female participation. Barriers are reduced by lowering the institution's information costs and raising their accountability through collaboration with organizations that have more information about and incentive to reach women participants

(see Box 11).

Box 11

WOMEN'S NETWORK FOR EFFECTIVE TRAINING IN THE TRADES

The following two projects highlight some of the main lessons learned in offering nontraditional training to women, including the importance of building on the strengths of women's organizations, while at the same time relying on experienced training institutions to provide the technical training. The United Women's Woodworking and Welding Project in Jamaica is an excellent example of effective *interinstitutional coordination* between a women's bureau and a country's main specialized training institution. The Jamaica Women's Bureau designed, coordinated and administered the innovative training program, and conducted gender awareness training for administrators and faculty at the Vocational Training Division of the Ministry of Youth. The newly-trained faculty then provided skills training in the trades for self-employment and the formation of a production and marketing cooperative to a female audience with low literacy levels. The Women's Bureau also enlisted the involvement of other relevant ministries and programs in the execution of the program to provide support and training in the execution of the program to provide support and training in other areas key to the women's personal and professional development. The Bureau of Health Education provided family life education in areas such as child care and family planning, which addressed the women's requests for information on how to balance their different family roles. The Cooperative Division of the Ministry of Agriculture provided training in cooperative skills, and the government's Special Employment Programme provided stipends during the training period. This project is one of the first such training programs, having started in the late 1970s, and is one of the most successful (Abadzi, 1989; Antrobus and Rogers, 1980).

Another example of the successful use of interinstitutional coordination and networking techniques is that of Women Ventures, a women's nongovernmental organization in St. Paul, Minnesota. Since 1981, this women's group has provided pre-training, counseling and placement activities for its female participants to complement the specialized training courses offered by local training and apprenticeship courses. The six-week personal readiness and pre-apprenticeship program offered prior to the formal specialized training includes such activities as: a promotion campaign geared to women; screening and self-selection activities through testing, self-evaluation and empowerment techniques, literacy and math skills improvement, pre-tests for trade certification, group support meetings, and a contract between the trainee and the training organization regarding her participation and commitment. The project also assists in the placement of women trainees and has developed a network of private firms that hire the trainees (Women Ventures, 1992).

Cost-Sharing

There are differing viewpoints on cost-sharing of specific women's training activities. Often, development agencies view activities targeted to facilitate women's participation and increase their benefits from the program as related to poverty alleviation efforts. From this viewpoint, costs—particularly start-up costs—are funded through nonreimbursable grant funds.

Recommendation 1:

User Fee

The problem in such a funding approach is the sustainability of the project, once nonreimbursable monies have been spent. Additionally, the training fee (similar to any user fee) often reveals the preferences of and value to the trainees of the program, as well as the benefit they receive from the training. For that reason, it is strongly encouraged that the beneficiaries contribute some percentage of the cost. The

exact amount should be negotiated with the country borrower and the training institutions during the analysis mission (Dougherty, 1989; World Bank, 1991).

Recommendation 2:

Firms' Contributions

This same argument can be used in terms of cost recovery from firms, particularly in programs that include an on-the-job training component. If the firms are not required to cover some part of the costs, the program is really subsidizing part of the firm's production costs. In addition, if the firms do not have to contribute financially to the training course costs, the willingness to provide on-the-job training may not reveal the private sector's true demand for trained labor in that area, since a firm may be willing to accept free apprentices, but may not be willing to hire trained people in the same occupations. However, if a program is attempting to overcome the skepticism of private sector employers

to hire women in nontraditional occupations, some subsidy at the start might be necessary, until the workers have proved their worth (see Box 9).

Information for Analysis, Monitoring and Evaluation

Monitoring and evaluation components make the project accountable to its stated objectives and goals, and are therefore very important aspects for ensuring that gender/Women in Development objectives are met. Common indicators that should be included in the logical framework and the monitoring and evaluation system, and that *must be disaggregated by sex*, are:

- C the number of applicants, the number accepted, and the number trained;
- C the education/skill background of the participant;
- C the area in which the participant received training, the type of private sector apprenticeship (type of firm and trainee's position);
- C job placements, employment status and sector, income level measured before completing the training and at various dates thereafter;
- C the percent of participants involved in support activities, the correlation between skills training

and private sector placement; and

- C the dollar cost per trainee, among others.

Tracer studies, which follow selected cohort groups of program participants and nonparticipants throughout the history of the program—before, during, and after implementation—assist the evaluator in estimating these indicators.

Qualitative indicators are also extremely important. Based on past experience, an effective training program does not simply impart specialized skills to a woman; the learning program changes the woman's educational and labor market expectations. This process of change begins at the time of application to the training program. In cultures where women have little expectations of success, few women apply for training, particularly in nontraditional areas. For that reason, a qualitative evaluation must assess the social and cultural constraints on female participation in training and in the labor force, and the ability of the program to change the expectations and motivational/self-esteem level of these women. Various qualitative methodologies can be used, such as attitudinal surveys of applicants/trainees and group workshops in personal empowerment. *The qualitative information or indicators are extremely important for interpreting the quantitative measures and results of the project* (Job Corps, 1992) [see Box 12].

Box 12

INTERPRETING EVALUATION INDICATORS

A central issue in the evolution of women's training projects is the analytical interpretation of gender-disaggregated indicators. Common indicators include applicant/enrollee ratios, drop-out rates, and outplacement and labor market placement rates, disaggregated by sex. These ratios/indicators will vary significantly by gender, age and educational level. In most Latin American and Caribbean countries, the occupational segregation by gender in the labor market and training institutions, the multiple roles of women in society, and the lower educational level of some women are significant constraints and limit their access to and effective participation in training and placement programs (CINTERFOR, 1992).

The evaluation methodology should take into account these gender biases when establishing control groups, constructing the evaluation variables, and interpreting the results. For example, in a highly segregated labor market, the relevant control group would be women similar to those participating in the program, based on age, education and work experience. Gender comparisons, between male and female participants, can lead to spurious conclusions. For example, labor force participation rates of women trainees' after participating in the training program should be compared to other women with similar characteristics in the population, and not only with the men in the program. In addition, comparative rates of return to training can be calculated between male and female participants. However, the existing wage differential between men and women in the economy at-large leads to distortions in the calculation of expected benefits and opportunity costs, which, in turn, can lead to misestimations in rate of return calculations (Fawcett, 1993).

Addressing Gender Issues throughout the Project Cycle

Training projects proceed through the various stages of project preparation, where the final step is the loan agreement between the IDB and the borrowing country. The project concept is presented in Profile I; the objectives and scope of the project are defined in Profile II; and the specific activities, costs, and financial, institutional and legal obligations are established in the Project Report. The purpose of the project preparation process is to detail and refine the project to meet both country and IDB objectives, and to ensure a dialogue between the two parties in the negotiation of the loan agreement. How do these new directions in training for women fit into the Bank's project preparation process? Figure 1 summarizes the project preparation stages, and outlines possible activities during each stage of the preparation process to promote female participation in the training program and address women's needs.

IDENTIFICATION STAGE

As part of project identification, the initial project idea is defined, including a general statement of objectives, the potential target population, and an explanation of how the project will achieve IDB goals and policies. Gender analysis and targeting activities should be incorporated during project identification. A clear statement of the target beneficiaries will allow for the design of specific activities to encourage the participation of these groups, including women.

To assist in the identification stage of the project, a Gender Analyst/Training Specialist or a team member should:

C prepare a gender-disaggregated statistical analysis of the target population,

C analyze the responsiveness of current institutional structures to gender issues, and

C suggest any necessary targeting procedures to ensure women's participation.

Appendix A includes Terms of Reference for this specialist.

ORIENTATION STAGE

The specific training approaches and support activities can be developed during the orientation phase of the project through feasibility studies, with the objective of increasing the number of women enrolling and effectively participating in the training program.

As discussed earlier, a range of activities could include:

C new course development;

C curricula/materials revision;

C design of mentoring programs;

C gender training for the institute's staff;

C private sector linkage activities;

C screening and orientation activities; and

C trainee support services, such as child care and family support activities.

To assist in the design of these activities, a WID Specialist/Training Design Specialist could be hired, if needed. (Appendix B includes the Terms of Reference for this specialist.) During the orientation stage, the specialist or team member should also:

- C *define the resources needed to implement these activities; and*
- C *identify the different agencies that are capable of implementing the above activities and potential interinstitutional coordination schemes.*

ANALYSIS STAGE

The analysis of the project is the final stage in the project preparation cycle, and culminates with the preparation of the project loan document. The analysis stage should identify how the stated WID objectives can be achieved in project implementation and at what cost. The findings of the feasibility studies and the specific design components should be analyzed and finalized at this stage.

The main issues to be examined are:

- C *the size of the project in relation to the target population;*
- C *the cost of specific women's activities, and the appropriate cost-sharing between beneficiaries, training institutions, and the public and private sectors;*
- C *the inclusion of institutional arrangements to promote women's participation in the project;*
- C *the monitoring and evaluation gender target indicators for the project, and*

legal obligations required to achieve women's effective participation.

There are several important areas of project preparation which are worth highlighting:

Area 1: Target Population Analysis

It is critical that the project team analyze the scale of the project, and for this the assumptions about the beneficiaries' (men and women) incentive to partic-

ipate in the program are important. The gender and other analyses undertaken during the identification stage provide the necessary information on the characteristics and size of the potential beneficiary population. The composition of the project beneficiaries by sex can be predicted based on these analyses. It is extremely important that assumptions about the target population and the specific project activities that are designed be consistent. *For example, if 40 percent of the target population are women, the project activities should be scaled to this male/female composition and designed to meet this group's needs.*

Area 2: Institutional Analysis

The interinstitutional coordination of women's groups with specialized training institutions is an important feature of many successful training projects. The availability of qualified women's organizations, both in the private and public sector, varies with the conditions in each country. The institutional analysis, conducted during project identification/orientation, should provide the information necessary to evaluate the possible participation of different women's groups in the project. The evaluation of the possible interinstitutional linkages, and their role in promoting women's participation in the project should be undertaken during project analysis.

Area 3: Monitoring and Evaluation

The project report and loan document, should require the inclusion of indicators within the logical framework and the monitoring/evaluation system that will track and evaluate female and male participation. Throughout the entire project preparation process, the types of indicators required for monitoring and ex-post evaluation should be identified. In most instances, the training institutions and the executing agencies do not have the resources to devote to evaluation. *Should specific evaluation indicators for the project be recommended, it is imperative that*

the project include funding for data collection, processing, and analysis, particularly for the qualitative indicators.

Area 4: Legal Obligations for Gender Objectives

To ensure that the borrowing country fulfills the gender/Women in Development objectives of the project, specific legal obligations must be included in the loan document. *Similar to the monitoring issue, legal obligations are mechanisms to ensure project accountability.* The following are feasible types of obligations:

- C *Selection criteria in the contracting process for the training service providers will include specific targets to include women in the training programs, with the renewal of training contracts based on meeting those targets, as well as special consideration for institutions that have experience in training women.*
- C *Percent of total loan amount targeted to women beneficiaries, institutions and women's support service programs will be monitored during the*

execution of the loan, with mid-term financial disbursement tied to meeting these benchmarks.

- C *Pre-conditions for the first disbursement of the loan can be tied to the financial and institutional strengthening of the governmental women's institution. This pre-condition is particularly important should the women's institution be key in the implementation of the project.*
- C *The hiring of experts to coordinate Women in Development/gender work can be required.*
- C *The mid-term and final evaluation reports should present the distribution of beneficiaries by gender, monitoring the fulfillment of the established targets.*

The legal obligations should be carefully discussed during the analysis of the project with the project team, the country representative and the government counterpart institutions.

Bibliography

- Abadzi, Helen. 1989. *Nonformal Education for Women in Latin America and the Caribbean: Solving the Mystery of the Unreported Trainees*. Washington, DC: World Bank, EDI, Studies and Training Design Division.
- Antrobus, Peggy and B. Rogers, 1980. *Hanover Street: An Experiment to Train Women in Welding and Carpentry*. New York: SEEDS.
- Baez, Clara. 1991. *Mujer y desarrollo en la República Dominicana: 1981-1991*. Prepared for the Inter-American Development Bank. Santo Domingo.
- Berger, Marguerite and Mayra Buvinic, eds. 1989. *Women's Ventures: Assistance to the Informal Sector in Latin America*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.
- Birdsall, Nancy and Jere R. Behrman. 1991. Why do Males Earn More than Females in Urban Brazil: Earnings Discrimination or Job Discrimination? In: Birdsall, N., and R. Sabot, eds. *Unfair Advantage: Labor Market Discrimination in Developing Countries*. World Bank Regional and Sectoral Studies. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Birdsall, Nancy and M. Louise Fox. 1991. Why Males Earn More: Location and Training of Brazilian Schoolteachers. In: Birdsall, N., and R. Sabot, eds. *Unfair Advantage: Labor Market Discrimination in Developing Countries*. World Bank Regional and Sectoral Studies. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Birdsall, Nancy, and Richard Sabot, eds. 1991. *Unfair Advantage: Labor Market Discrimination in Developing Countries*. World Bank Regional and Sectoral Studies. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Bonilla, Elssy. 1990. Working Women in Latin America. In: *Inter-American Development Bank Economic and Social Progress in Latin America. 1990 Report*. Washington, DC: Johns Hopkins UP.
- Borcelle, Germaine. 1985. *Jobs for Women: A Plea for Equality of Opportunity. Technical Education, Vocational Training and Employment*. Switzerland: UNESCO.
- Buvinic, Mayra. 1991. *The Vulnerability of Households Headed by Women: Policy Questions and Options for Latin America and the Caribbean*. Social Development Division, Women and Development Unity, ECLAC. LC/L. 611.
- Buvinic, Mayra, and Margaret A. Lycette. 1994. *Women's Contributions to Economic Growth in Latin America and the Caribbean: Facts, Experiences, and Options*. Prepared for the "Women in the Americas: Participation and Development" Forum sponsored by IDB, ECLAC, and UNIFEM in Guadalajara, Mexico, April 5, 1994.
- CELADE (Centro Latinoamericano de Demografía). 1992. *Demographic Bulletin, Latin America, Economically Active Population 1970-2000*. Santiago, Chile.
- CIDA (Canadian International Development Agency). 1989. *Women in Development: A Sectoral Perspective*.

- CINTERFOR (Centro Interamericano de Investigación y Documentación sobre la Formación Profesional). 1992. Documentation on the Workshop “Promoción de la educación profesional y técnica de la mujer.”
- _____. 1992. *Participación de la mujer en la formación técnica y profesional en América Latina. Síntesis regional*. Montevideo, Uruguay: CINTERFOR/ILO.
- Doherty, Stephen. 1995. Written communication with the authors. InterAmerican Development Bank.
- Dougherty, C. 1989. *The Cost-Effectiveness of National Training Systems in Developing Countries*. Policy, Planning and Research Working Paper WPS No. 171. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- ECLAC (United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean.) 1992. *Major Changes and Crisis: The Impact on Women in Latin America and the Caribbean*. Santiago, Chile.
- _____. 1993. *Statistical Yearbook for Latin America and the Caribbean*. Chile: United Nations.
- Fawcett, C. 1992. An Action Plan for Private Sector Training Initiatives in Uruguay. Prepared for the Inter-American Development Bank, Department of Planning and Programming (DPL).
- _____. 1993. Gender Differences in the Rate of Return to Education: A Methodological Critique. Draft. Prepared for the Inter-American Development Bank, Department of Planning and Programming (DPL).
- FLACSO (Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales) and Instituto de la Mujer, Spain. 1995. *Latin American Women: Compared Figures*. Santiago, Chile: FLACSO.
- Floro, Maria S. and Sarah Howden. Methodological Guide for Gender-Based Institutional Analysis. Draft. Prepared for the Women in Development Unit, Inter-American Development Bank. December, 1994.
- Fluitman, Fred, ed. 1989. *Training for Work in the Informal Sector*. Prepared in collaboration with the International Centre for Advanced Technical and Vocational Training, Turin. Geneva: International Labour Office.
- Gantt, Tahnee. 1995. Ayuda Memoria: Misión de Evaluación. Oficina de Evaluación. Inter-American Development Bank. September 5, 1995.
- Goldberg, M. 1992. Enterprise Support Services for Women. Draft. Washington, DC: World Bank, PHRWD.
- Goodale, Gretchen. 1989. Training for Women in the Informal Sector: The Experience of the Pathfinder Fund in Latin America and the Caribbean. In: Fluitman, Fred, ed. *Training for Work in the Informal Sector*. Geneva: ILO.
- Horton, Susan, et al. 1991. *Labor Markets in an Era of Adjustment. An Overview*. Working Paper Studies and Training Design WPS No. 694. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Howden, Sarah. Forthcoming. Blueprints for Success: A Case Study of Women in Housing Construction in Costa Rica. Women in Development Unit, Social Programs and Sustainable Development Department, Inter-American Development Bank.

- IDB (Inter-American Development Bank). 1994a. Argentina Program in Support of Productive Reconversion. PR-1 976.
- _____. 1992a. *Basic Socioeconomic Data*. Statistics and Quantitative Analysis Section.
- _____. 1992b. Chile: Worker-Training Program. PR-1 842.
- _____. 1991. Costa Rica. Proposed Financing to CEFEMINA, Fundación Mujer, and Credimujer. PR-1813. Special Programs, Microenterprise Division.
- _____. 1994. *Economic and Social Progress in Latin America. 1993 Report*. Washington, DC.: Distributed by the Johns Hopkins UP.
- _____. 1990. El Salvador: Non-University Higher Technical Education Project. Project No. ES-0035.
- _____. 1994b. Programa Regional para el Fortalecimiento de la Formación Técnica y Profesional de Mujeres de Bajos Ingresos. Plan of Operations, TC-94-0350-2-RG.
- _____. 1994c. Report on the Eighth General Increase in Resources. GN-1 763-19.
- IICA (Instituto Interamericano de Cooperación para la Agricultura). 1994. *Productoras de alimentos: Políticas agrícolas frente a las mujeres productoras de alimentos en América Latina y el Caribe*. San José, Costa Rica: IICA.
- Job Corps. 1992. Interview with Gender Administrators of Job Corps programs at AVA conference conducted by C. Fawcett, December, 1992.
- Lalonde, Helene. 1992. *Case-Study: Canada-Brazil Cooperation Program*. Toronto: Pentacle International Consulting.
- Massey, Ruth. *Mexican Women Make Pumps and Mold Their Futures. Source*. Publication of the Division of Public Affairs, United Nations Development Programme. New York. December 1992.
- McLeod, Ruth. The Kingston Women's Construction Collective: Building for the Future in Jamaica. In: Leonard, Ann, ed. *Seeds: Supporting Women's Work in the Third World*. New York: Feminist Press at the City University of New York.
- Ministerio del Trabajo y Previsión Social, República de Chile. 1994. *Informe del Programa de Capacitación Laboral*. Prepared by the Program Coordination Unit for the IDB-UCP Evaluation Meeting in Washington, DC, August 4-5, 1994.
- Morley, Samuel A. *Poverty and Distribution in Latin America: Evidence from the Past, Prospects for the Future*. Washington, DC: Social Agenda Policy Group, Inter-American Development Bank. June, 1994.
- Pineda, Magaly. Interview with M. Pineda, Executive Director of CIPAF (Centro de Investigación para la Acción Femenina), Dominican Republic, conducted by S. Howden, November, 1994.

- PREALC. 1991. Inserción laboral y estratificación socioeconómica de la mujer en el área andina. No. 358, May 1991.
- _____. 1992a. *Género y mercado de trabajo en América Latina: Procesos y dilemas*. Santiago: ILO.
- _____. 1992b. Newsletter. No. 30, October, 1992. World Employment Programme.
- Psacharopoulos, George, and Zafiris Tzannatos, eds. 1992. *Women's Employment and Pay in Latin America: Overview and Methodology*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Psacharopoulos, George, and Zafiris Tzannatos, eds. 1992. *Case Studies on Women's Employment and Pay in Latin America*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Tools for Tomorrow. 1994. Promotional material and conversation with Nancy Nakkoul, Project Director for Tools for Tomorrow: Women in the Trades. A Program of Employment Options, Inc. Madison, Wisconsin.
- Tzannatos, Zafiris. 1992. The Industrial and Occupational Distribution of Female Employment. In Psacharopoulos, G. and Z. Tzannatos, *Women's Employment and Pay in Latin America: Overview and Methodology*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization). 1991, 1992. Statistical Yearbook. Paris.
- United Nations, Department of International Economic and Social Affairs, Statistical Office. 1991. *The World's Women 1970-1990: Trends and Statistics*. New York.
- _____. 1995 *The World's Women 1995: Trends and Statistics*. New York.
- United States Agency for International Development (USAID). 1986. *Gender Issues in Basic Education and Vocational Training*. The Gender Manual Series.
- _____. 1987. *Gender Issues in Latin America and the Caribbean*. Publication No. PN-AAX-043/AID.
- Valenzuela, Maria Elena. 1993. Trends in Adolescent Fertility in Chile. Data presented by Mayra Buvinic, International Center for Research on Women, at the November 10-11, 1994 Gender Symposium, World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Winter, Carolyn. 1994. *Working Women in Latin America: Participation, Pay and Public Policy*. Latin America and the Caribbean Region, Technical Department, World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Women Ventures. 1991. *Annual Report*. St. Paul, Minnesota.
- World Bank. 1989. Hogares comunitarios: El caso de Colombia. Washington, DC.
- _____. 1991. *Vocational Education and Training: A World Bank Policy Paper*. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- _____. 1993. *World Development Report 1993: Investing in Health*. New York: Oxford UP.

FIGURE 1
ADDRESSING GENDER ISSUES THROUGHOUT THE PROJECT CYCLE

PROJECT CYCLE	POSSIBLE ACTIONS TO PROMOTE WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION
<p>Project Identification Mission</p> <p>IDB mission to identify project, including project conceptual framework, objectives, main activities, and risks.</p>	<p>Gender analysis Institutional analysis Gender targeting of training</p> <p>WID project objectives</p>
<p>PROGRAMMING COMMITTEE APPROVES PROFILE I</p> <p>—</p>	
<p>Project Orientation Mission</p> <p>Specification of activities to be included in the project. Prepare PPF to contract short-term consultants.</p>	<p>New training approaches and support activities</p> <p>Conduct studies to propose WID project activities such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> C Promotion campaigns. C New courses/curriculum/materials revision. C Private sector placement/job counseling. C Gender training of faculty and staff. C Multi-service support.
<p>LOAN COMMITTEE APPROVES PROFILE II</p> <p>—</p>	
<p>Project Analysis Mission</p> <p>Preparation of project design and specific activities, financing and costs, technical assistance, and legal obligations of project.</p>	<p>Project appraisal with respect to women's issues</p> <p>Incorporate WID components into various aspects of project.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> C Specific targets for project size/characteristics. C Cost of specific WID activities. C Institutional WID representatives. C Monitoring and evaluation of WID targets. C Legal obligations for meeting WID objectives.
<p>—</p> <p>LOAN DOCUMENT PREPARATION</p>	

TABLE I
SELECTED ECONOMIC AND DEMOGRAPHIC INDICATORS
FOR LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

	Real Urban Minimum Wage ¹ (1980=100)		Urban Population as % of Total ²		Fertility Rate ³	
	1981	1989	1980	1993	1970-75	1990-95
Argentina	98	42	83	87	3,1	2,8
Bahamas	59	66	3,0	2,0
Barbados	40	46	2,7	1,8
Belize	52	48	5,6	5,2 ⁴
Bolivia	76	27	46	59	6,5	4,6
Brazil	99	69	66	76	4,7	2,7
Chile	99	64	81	86	3,6	2,7
Colombia	98	110	65	74	4,7	2,7
Costa Rica	90	119	43	47	4,3	3,1
Dominican Rep.	51	63	5,6	3,3
Ecuador	86	44	47	59	6,1	3,6
El Salvador	51	63	5,6	3,3
Guatemala	121	68	37	41	6,5	5,4
Guyana	31	35	4,9	2,5
Haiti	24	30	5,8	4,8
Honduras	106	74	36	46	7,4	4,9
Jamaica	48	58	5,0	2,4
Mexico	100	47	66	74	6,4	3,2
Nicaragua	53	66	6,8	5,0
Panama	93	100	50	55	4,9	2,9
Paraguay	104	136	42	49	5,7	4,3
Peru	82	25	65	72	6,0	3,6
Suriname	45	41	5,3	2,7
Trinidad and Tobago	57	67	2,5	2,7
Uruguay	103	79	84	86	3,0	2,3
Venezuela	86	77	83	94	5,0	3,1

Sources: ^{1/} Cox Edwards in Morley, 1994; ^{2/} IDB, 1994; ^{3/} United Nations, 1995; ^{4/} Data refer to a year or period within 1985/1990

TABLE 2
EDUCATION INDICATORS FOR LATIN AMERICAN AND THE CARIBBEAN

	Adult Illiteracy			Primary Education			Secondary Education		
	Women		Men	Women ³		Fem/100 Male ¹	Women ³		Fem/100 Men ¹
	1970-74 ¹	1990 ²	1990	1970	1990	1985/87	1970	1990	1985/87
Argentina	9,6	7,5 ⁴	6,4 ⁴	706	114	97	47	...	112
Bahamas	97
Barbados	0,9	94 ⁴	101 ⁴
Belize	11,4	93	118
Bolivia	...	36,6	15,8	62	78	88	20	31	86
Brasil	43,1	24,7	22,2	82	...	95 ⁴	26
Chile	15,0	7,6	6,7	107	97	95	42	77	106
Colombia	28,6	19,0	16,0	110	111	100	24	57	100
Costa Rica	16,1	10,1 ⁴	9,6 ⁴	109	101	94	29	43	104
Dominican Rep.	43,2	31,0 ⁴	29,1 ⁴	100	96	100
Ecuador	37,3	19,0	12,0	95	23	...	98 ⁴
El Salvador	54,0	56,1 ⁵	44,5 ⁵	83	78	99 ⁴	21	26	112 ⁴
Guatemala	66,8	47,8 ⁶	34,2 ⁶	51	...	82	8	...	83 ⁴
Guyana	16,1	96 ⁴
Haiti	88,3	76,0 ⁴	69,4 ⁴	86 ⁴	4
Honduras	55,4	43,0	40,0	87	109	99	13	...	116 ⁴
Jamaica	...	17,3	26,4	119	105	97 ⁴	45	63	120
Mexico	35,9	20,4	12,7	101	110	95	17	53	95
Nicaragua	48,2	24,1 ⁵	23,2 ⁵	81	101	107	17	44	208
Panama	27,1	15,0	13,0	58	88	92	6	53	109
Paraguay	31,5	19,9 ⁴	12,1 ⁴	103	106	92	6	53	109
Peru	47,5	34,6 ⁴	13,2 ⁴	99	...	93	27	...	83 ⁴
Suriname	93 ⁴
Trinidad and Tobago	15,1	5,8	2,4	107	96	99	44	82	101 ⁴
Uruguay	...	5,3	6,6	109	106	95	64	...	112 ⁴
Venezuela	34,8	14,1	10,9	94	94	96	34	41	119

Sources: 1/ United Nations, 1991; 2/ United Nations, 1995; 3/ World Bank, 1993; 4/ The years are 1980- 1984; 5/ The years are 1975-1979; 6/ FLACSO, 1995.

TABLE 3
LABOR FORCE AND LABOR MARKET INDICATORS
FOR LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

APPENDIX 1

	Labor Force Participation			Relative Female-Male Wage Differ. ²	Duncan Occupational Dissimilarity Index ²	Youth Unem- ployment ³ 1989/19 90	
	% of women in lab. force		Women as % of lab. force in 1990			Fem.	Male
	1980	1990					
Argentina	25	26	28	64,5	0,4486
Bahamas	38	39 ⁴	34 ⁴
Barbados	59	61 ⁴	46 ⁴
Belize	28	29 ⁴	26 ⁴
Bolivia	23	29	30	62,3	0,3670
Brazil	27	30	30	61,2	0,4913	7,4 ⁵	6.2 ⁵
Chile	21	27	29	47,1	0,5259	12,4	13.4
Colombia	26	32	33	84,6	0,5177	23,0	21.5
Costa Rica	19	21	22	80,8	0,4981	10,0	7.6
Dominican Rep.	27	30	28
Ecuador	17	19	22	63,7	0,4648	16,8	10.2
El Salvador	23	24	26
Guatemala	13	16	21	76,8	0,5732	6,3	3.1
Guyana	26	29 ⁴	26 ⁴
Haiti	61	54 ⁴	41 ⁴
Honduras	16	21	18
Jamaica	65	68 ⁴	46 ⁴	57,7	0,3182
Mexico	26	29	29	85,6	0,3182
Nicaragua	27	33	34
Panama	24	26	28	79,6	0,5916	42,7	25.9
Paraguay	26	26	24	15,7	15.8
Peru	26	28	29	65,7	0,3289
Suriname	27	31 ⁴	30 ⁴
Trinidad and Tob	31	34 ⁴	30 ⁴	66.6	33.9
Uruguay	32	40	39	57,4	0,4333	30,2	23.7
Venezuela	22	27	29	70,6	0,4708	17,8	17.8

Sources: 1/FLACSO, 1995, for the Latin American countries; United Nations, 1995, for the Caribbean countries; 2/ Psacharopoulos and Tzannatos, 1992; 3/ PREALC, 1992b; 4/ 1994; 5/ 1987..

**TERMS OF REFERENCE:
GENDER ANALYST/TRAINING SPECIALIST**

Qualifications:

Requires at least 5 years of experience in the design and evaluation of training programs, labor market analysis and/or Women in Development (WID) projects, with demonstrated knowledge of training programs, WID institutions, and labor market structures, particularly in the Latin American region. Must have at least two years of experience in gender analysis using socioeconomic statistics and survey data. Must have some experience with development policy formulation, as it pertains to training projects and/or WID issues. Must have excellent research, statistical, writing and presentation skills. Requires at least M.A. and/or Ph.D. in social sciences, with statistical orientation. Must be professionally proficient in English and language of specific country of assignment.

Activities:

The specialist will provide the project team with an evaluation of the Women in Development (WID) issues related to the planning and design of the training project. As part of her/his responsibilities, the consultant will analyze the following issues: the gender aspects of the target population of the project, the labor market conditions which influence women's participation and occupational choice, and the institutional options for the project with reference to gender activities. In conducting this analysis, the specialist will provide in-depth information on these country conditions, as well as any other characteristics which relate to the participation of women in the training program. Based on this assessment, the specialist will rank the significance of these various conditions, and recommend specific WID objectives that must be addressed in the project. The specialist will prepare a report of the analysis which must include the following points:

- C Analysis of potential beneficiaries based on gender-disaggregated data.
- C Institutional assessment with discussion of programming alternatives and recommendations.
- C Labor market diagnostic with analysis of employed and inactive population, employment and recruitment patterns of firms, and growth potential of various sectors, distinguished by gender considerations.
- C Ranking and recommendations on key WID concerns regarding the project.

The specialist will coordinate his/her assessment with the other consultants conducting prefeasibility studies, and will discuss the complementarity of the WID recommendations to those of the overall project.

Reports:

Work Plan: Specialist will present to the Bank a work program containing a schedule of activities to be performed during the consultancies.

WID Assessment: Specialist will prepare report on the relevant country conditions which will influence the participation of women and other gender issues of the specified project, as stated in the Activities section of these Terms of Reference.

Final Report: Summary of activities undertaken, accomplishments, conclusions and recommendations related to the performance of the Terms of Reference.

Duration:

Sixty consulting days with approximately one-half of this time spent in the country of the project, and the remaining time writing the report, having discussions and presenting findings to IDB staff and country representatives.

**TERMS OF REFERENCE:
WID CONSULTANT/TRAINING DESIGN SPECIALIST**

Qualifications:

Requires extensive experience (at least 5 years) in the evaluation and design of specific activities related to training programs and/or Women in Development (WID) projects, particularly in the Latin American region. Must have at least two years of experience in the development of WID activities, such as promotion and selection criteria, building private sector linkages, curriculum and/or materials development for women, inter-institutional cooperation and multiservice delivery programs. Must have significant experience in the planning of training activities, including the cost, sequencing and technical assistance required during project implementation. Must have excellent writing and presentation skills. Requires at least M.A. in development studies, education, or social sciences. Must be professionally proficient in Spanish and English.

Activities:

The specialist will provide the project team with a feasibility analysis of specific activities to be included in the training project. These activities reflect the recommendations made in the Country WID Assessment, and the specialist's central responsibility is to determine how, when and where to incorporate the appropriate activities into the project design, given the country conditions. As part of the assignment, the specialist will develop the plan of operation for the specific WID activities, provide cost estimates, the sequencing of the activities, and the technical assistance requirements, including the terms of reference for the consultants. Additionally, the consultant must provide an analysis of the complementarity of these activities to the rest of the project, as well as a ranking of the importance of the specific activities. The specialist will work in coordination with the other project consultants. The specialist will prepare a report which must address the following points:

- C Analysis of the specific WID/gender concerns regarding the project.
- C Recommendations of project activities to address these concerns.
- C Design of project activities in response to the specific country conditions.
- C WID activities relationship to other project objectives and activities.
- C Priority ranking and sequencing of the WID activities.
- C Cost of specific WID/gender activities.
- C Monitoring and evaluation of WID targets.

Revisions will be undertaken as needed to incorporate the comments made by education specialists in the relevant regional division.

Reports:

Work Plan: Specialist will present to the Bank a work program containing a schedule of activities to be performed during the consultancy.

WID Feasibility Study: Specialist will prepare a report on specific project activities to achieve the WID recommendations of the WID Assessment, completing the above activities as stated in the Terms of Reference.

Final Report: Summary of activities undertaken, accomplishments, conclusions and recommendations related to the performance of the terms of reference.

Duration:

Sixty consulting days with approximately one-half of this time spent in the country of the project, and the remaining time writing the report, having discussions and presenting findings to IDB staff and country representatives.