

**REGIONAL POLICY DIALOGUE
PUBLIC POLICY MANAGEMENT AND TRANSPARENCY
NETWORK**

EVALUATION OF CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEMS

CASE STUDY: JAMAICA

FINAL REPORT
Submitted to the
INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
2002 DECEMBER
By
Hedy Isaacs

Table Of Contents

ACNOWLEDGEMENTS	4
ABBREVIATIONS	5
1. INTRODUCTORY REMARKS AND SCOPE OF THE WORK	6
2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	8
3. BACKGROUND	10
4. INSTITUTIONAL CONTEXT ANALYSIS.....	15
4.1 Analysis of Legal Context	15
4.2 Analysis of Other Contextual Elements.....	16
5. FUNCTIONAL ANALYSIS OF THE CIVIL SERVICE.....	23
5.1 Analysis of Quantitative Indicators of the CSS	23
5.2 Analysis by Subsystem.....	28
5.3 Organizational Analysis of Human Resources Function.....	39
5.4 Comparison with other analyses	39
6. CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM INDICES.....	40
6.1 Efficiency.....	40
6.2 Merit.....	41
6.3 Structural Consistency	41
6.4 Functional Capacity	41
6.5 Integrating Capacity.....	42
7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	43
7.1 Analysis of causal areas	43
7.2 Main Conclusions of the diagnostic study.....	44
7.3 Proposals for Improvement	44
LIST OF APPENDICES	46
LIST OF TABLES	47
APPENDIX 1	48
APPENDIX 2	50
APPENDIX 3	51
APPENDIX 4.....	52
APPENDIX 5.....	53
APPENDIX 6.....	54
APPENDIX 7	55
APPENDIX 8.....	56
APPENDIX 9	57
Table 1 - Valuations Of Critical Points.....	57
Table 2 - Descriptions Of Indices And Sub Indices	59
Table 3 - Summary of Indices derived for the CSS in Jamaica	60
Table 4 – Efficiency Index CSS Jamaica.....	61
Table 5 – Merit Index CSS Jamaica	62
Table 6 - Integrating Capacity Index CSS Jamaica	63
Table 7 - Structural Consistency [SC] Index and Strategic Coherence Sub Index CSS Jamaica	64
Table 8 –Structural Consistency Sub Index: Directive Consistency CSS Jamaica	65

Table 9 –Structural Consistency Sub Index Consistency of Processes CSS Jamaica	66
Table 10 - Functional Capacity (FC) Index and Competence Sub Index CSS Jamaica	67
Table 11 – Functional Capacity Sub Index Incentive Effectiveness CSS Jamaica	68
Table 12 – Functional Capacity Sub Index Flexibility CSS Jamaica	69
WORKS CONSULTED	70

ACNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was a project of a researcher at the University of the West Indies. Over a period of nine weeks the researcher met with approximately thirty-nine persons in Jamaica as well as consulted works extensively. The study benefited greatly from the collective input of persons, all of whom have extensive knowledge about the management of public employment and human resources and reflect a range of mainly internal, but also external clients and stakeholders of public service agencies. These persons provided material as well as shared their ideas. Dr. the Hon Carlton Davis, the Cabinet Secretary and Professor Edwin Jones, Professor of Public Administration at the University of the West Indies, and member of the Public Service Commission, were particularly supportive. I wish to express appreciation to all of these persons. A list of the names of these persons appears at Appendix 1.

The Inter-American Development Bank, Regional Policy Dialogue, Public Policy Management and Transparency Network, commissioned this project and provided a methodological framework, developed by Professor Francisco Longo. The application of this framework serves as a basis for comparative evaluation of civil service systems, thus fulfilling a major objective of the project.

ABBREVIATIONS

CSA	Civil Service Association
CSE Act	Civil Service Establishments Act
CSS	Civil Service Systems
EA	Executive Agencies
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GoJ	Government of Jamaica
HR	Human Resources
HRM	Human Resource Management
HRMIS	Human Resource Management Information System
JCF	Jamaica Constabulary Force
JEF	Jamaica Employers Federation
LRIDA	Labour Relations & Industrial Disputes Act
MDD	Manpower Development Division
MIND	Management Institute of National Development
MoEYC	Ministry of Education Youth and Culture
MoFAFT	Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Foreign Trade
MoFP	Ministry of Finance and Planning
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoLSS	Ministry of Labour and Social Security
MPS	Ministry of the Public Service
OECD	Organization of Economic Cooperation & Development
OPM	Office of the Prime Minister
OSC	Office of the Services Commissions
PIOJ	Planning Institute of Jamaica
PSC	Public Service Commission
PSEAP	Public Sector Employee Assistance Programme
PSMP	Public Sector Modernization Programme
STATIN	Statistical Institute of Jamaica
UWI	University of the West Indies Mona
WW	Westminster Whitehall model

1. INTRODUCTORY REMARKS AND SCOPE OF THE WORK

The systems for managing public employment and human resources (CSS) in Jamaica, in particular the management of public employment, first came under scrutiny in 1949. The institutional framework for managing public employment emerged as the result of a recommendation of a national commission of enquiry and the subsequent Mills Report (1949) (in Madden, E.R. January 2002, *The History of the Public Service Commission of Jamaica*, unpublished Office of the Services Commissions paper.) This report, stipulated that an independent body, to manage the employment function was needed. Specifically, this body would have the responsibility for the employment and removal of public officers, and for exercising disciplinary control. The Public Service Commission (PSC) Law, Cap.326, 1952, was an attempt by the government to regulate and manage public employment. The PSC was enshrined in the Jamaica Constitution, (Cap. IX 1962.) Four other Services Commissions were subsequently established, namely, the Police Service Commission, the Judicial Service Commission, the Municipal Service Commission and the Parish Councils Services Commission. The Office of the Services Commission (OSC) is the secretariat for the five Services Commissions. The management of human resources was formalized in the 1970s with the setting up of a central agency, The Ministry of the Public Service (MPS). The PSC and the MPS shared the task of managing public employment and human resources.

Since 1949, other diagnostic studies have been done that have examined aspects of the CSS. The corresponding reports have driven the CSS reform agenda. Current public sector modernization initiatives include the development of a human resources policy [a work in progress], the review of the Public Service Regulations and the PSC Human Resource (HR) delegations of functions. Some critics claim that these initiatives do not fully satisfy the requirements for a strategic approach to managing public employment and human resources, as an integrated approach to human resource management is required.

This study comprehensively examined institutional arrangements for the management of public employment and human resources in the central government agencies, how these arrangements work and the context of these arrangements. In other words, the study focused on the contexts, structures, practices and the internal and external relationships evident in the CSS of central government agencies. Of particular interest were the best practices. Central Government numerically constitutes the largest element of the public sector. The staff complement is approximately forty one thousand. The central government agencies, namely, ministries and departments, are under the control of ministers of government. One of these ministries has oversight for the local government system of governance. This ministry does not have responsibility for the management of human resources at the sub national level. “This responsibility still rests with the Municipal Service Commission” (James, B. Working Paper: Ministry of Local Government Community Development & Sport, *Delegation of Human Resource Management Functions*. November 29,2002.) Local Authorities, Statutory Bodies, Public Enterprises, the network of parastatals and eight executive agencies that were set up under the current public sector modernization programme, (PSMP), provide unique subsets of the public sector that may require independent evaluation. In this report, these entities are referred to for comparative purposes only.

The public sector in contemporary developing states, like Jamaica require the capacity to respond appropriately, to the fast pace of change in the new global order, as well as to the complex and multifaceted demands of citizenry. The Government of Jamaica (GoJ) recognizes the critical role of the public sector in achieving the country's development goals. The government, in particular the Prime Minister and the Cabinet Secretary have expressed their commitment to modernize the public sector. Many initiatives are underway. These include initiatives to improve the CS System. Government has also mandated the Service to create the conditions that facilitate economic growth and human development. The existence of a CS System that works efficiently and effectively is critical for the achievement of this mandate.

This study is unique: for two reasons: The study comprehensively examined the institutions and practices operating in the Jamaican CSS and did so, using quantitative and qualitative research. The study will enhance existing assessments about the management of public employment and human resources and inform policy concerned with the modernization of the CS System.

The objectives of the study:

The major foci of this effort to provide a detailed analysis of the CS System in Jamaica centered on contexts, structures, practices and relationships. The units of analysis were the institutional context and the operational context. The questions posed to the persons that were consulted, generally conformed to the thematic areas that were presented in Professor Francisco Longo's analytical framework and to the accompanying "general checklist" of critical points provided. In addition the analyst posed questions related to small country size, to determine the perceived relationship between this variable and the functioning of CSS in Jamaica. The overarching questions were:

- ⌘⌘ What historical, political-administrative, cultural, legal and socio-economic factors affect the institutional context of the CSS in Jamaica?
- ⌘⌘ What policies and practices [related to human resource planning, work organization, employment management, performance management, compensation management, development management, human and social relations management, as well as the human resources function organization], characterize the CSS in Jamaica?
- ⌘⌘ What CSS indices (relating to efficiency, merit, structural consistency, functional capacity and integrating capacity) accurately reflect the Jamaican setting?

2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. The Inter- American Development Bank, through its Regional Policy Dialogue, Public Policy Management and Transparency Network, commissioned this study of the evaluation of the civil service system (CSS) in Jamaica. The context for this evaluation was one of demonstrated commitment by the Government of Jamaica to developing a CS System that works. Since the establishment of the pioneer institution for managing public employment and human resources, efforts to improve the CSS in the central government agencies in Jamaica have been on going.
2. The researcher was engaged as a consultant to the Bank to undertake the evaluation of the CSS in Jamaica and was provided with a methodological framework, developed by Professor Francisco Longo that offered quantitative as well as qualitative criteria for evaluation. This framework will ultimately be used for comparative evaluation of civil service systems in general. The framework guided the research undertaking and the subsequent report. The report has seven sections. Section 1 outlines the scope of the work. Section 2 provides a synopsis of the conclusions and recommendations. Section 3, locates the Jamaican CSS in its historical, political-administrative context. In Section 4, the legal, socio-cultural and economic factors that influence the CSS are analyzed, together with the links between other factors unique to the setting, namely: country size, personalism and human resource constraints. Section 5 offers a functional analysis of the CSS, using select World Bank indicators of governance. In Section 6 the CSS Indices relating to efficiency, merit, structural consistency, functional capacity and integrating capacity, constructed to reflect the Jamaican setting, are explicated. Conclusions and recommendations are presented in Section 7. Over a period of nine weeks the researcher consulted with approximately thirty-nine (39) persons, consulted documented sources extensively and analyzed the existing CSS in order to develop recommendations.
3. Contemporary HRM practice has shown that a clearly articulated and coherent organizational strategy for HRM that has the commitment of all stakeholders is one of the pre-requisites for a CSS that is efficient. An integrated HRM system, organizing the HR function in a manner that gives managers the autonomy to take HR decisions, and functional flexibility are also required. One outcome of the efficient management of public employment and human resource management is staff optimization. This is facilitated by HR planning and the capacity to develop suitable profiles of competencies.
4. A major initiative to modernize the CSS is decentralization. The PSC in the circumstances no longer has solely a regulatory role but has more strategic roles of monitoring and evaluating the decentralization of employment management. The PSC is staffed by part-time professionals and is likely to require strengthening of its capacities to perform its new roles. The Prime Minister and the Cabinet Secretary have also articulated the government's vision for ongoing improvements for managing human capital in the administration. This vision is to be transformed into a coherent HR strategy that will require the commitment of all the stakeholders. The existing system of HRM is not however integrated. While limited decentralization facilitates decentralization of HR

decisions in some agencies, this is not supported by managerial or functional flexibility. The recommendations are made bearing in mind these limitations.

5. Articulate a coherent and explicit strategy for HRM that all the stakeholders commit to. (Recommendation 1)
6. Develop an integrated HRM system. This will facilitate structural consistency as well as functional capacity of the CSS. (Recommendation 2)
7. Institute HR planning that is supported by a reliable HR management information system. HR Planning will give direction to strategic HRM and facilitate staff optimization. (Recommendation 3)
8. Address staff optimization by making managerial practices more flexible, with the emphasis on functional flexibility, specifically, the development of suitable job profiles that emphasize competencies. (Recommendation 4)
9. Maintain the current emphasis on institutionalizing change management programs in central government agencies (Ministries) to facilitate commitment to and ownership of the changes envisioned. Extend these programs to Departments. (Recommendation 5)
10. Institutionalize induction programs in all central government agencies so as to encourage new values and attitudes that are necessary to support change. (Recommendation 6)
11. Strengthen the PSC's capacity by incorporating full-time members to provide on an ongoing basis, guidance and direction for undertaking its strategic roles of auditing, monitoring and evaluating HR delegations. (Recommendation 7)

3. BACKGROUND

The systems for managing public employment and human resources in Jamaica are in transition. These systems provide a stabilizing influence within central government and by implication, aid in the process of governance, even as they are undergoing significant changes. The vision of a coordinated CSS, which, is high on the GoJ's public sector reform agenda, and is being vigorously pursued, is juxtaposed to systems for managing public employment and human resources that are fragmented and operate within a tradition of centralized decision-making. The CSS presents apparent contradictions. These contradictions have been linked to the tensions in the political-administrative framework and culture that frame the CSS in Jamaica.

The influence of Jamaica's heritage of British institutions and culture has been pervasive. The country inherited a model of government and public administration, the Westminster-Whitehall (WW) model. This model has as its foundation certain basic tenets, namely, a competitive parliamentary system, an independent non-political judiciary, ministerial and cabinet responsibility and a central role for an apolitical civil service, "structured on a triad of principles, namely neutrality, anonymity, and impartiality" (Mills, G.E.1997: 5-7). These WW institutions have arguably been honed for decades in Britain and have worked with effect in the 'home-grown' setting. These institutions have not worked as well in the context to which they were transplanted. An examination of the requirement that civil servants be impartial, anonymous and neutral helps to clarify an inherent tension in the political-administrative framework. Non-partisanship is a desirable attribute in a civil servant. However the difficulty comes when the civil servant who is insulated from the politician is expected to contribute meaningfully to the policy making process, a contradiction in terms. Anonymity is also difficult to achieve in a small island state.

Inherited structures are hierarchical and characterized as having centers for centralized decision-making. Critics argue that this institutional form and practice may have served Jamaica well at a time when law and order were the national priorities. The tradition of centralized decision-making has sometimes proved to be dysfunctional. Contemporary public institutions need to exhibit flexibility and adapt to the new requirement for sustainable development. Current realities have implications for the effectiveness of the structures, practices and the attendant relationships for managing public employment and human resources.

The contemporary institutional framework for the CSS although characterized by a tradition of centralized decision-making, is also showing evidence of another emerging modality, which is decentralization. Collectively, the central agencies, namely, the PSC, the Ministry of Finance and Planning (MoFP) and the Cabinet Office, have responsibility for policy making. Individually, each of these agencies has responsibility for a different aspect of the CSS. Central agencies are supported at the line agency level by Human Resource Management Departments that have responsibility for operationalizing the policy. These line agency HRM Departments are integral components of Corporate Services and Administration Divisions.

Historically, the role of the PSC, the pioneer institution for the CSS in Jamaica, was solely regulatory. Recent reforms by government have resulted in the PSC, which, is supported by its secretariat, the Office of the Services Commissions (OSC), moving away from performing only

its initial regulatory role, to assume strategic roles in HRM: roles for HR auditing and monitoring. These new roles have been articulated in the PSC's Citizen's Charter (January 2002) Appendix 2, and in a document titled "Public Sector Modernization, Vision and Strategy 2010", issued by the Cabinet Office (2002: 42-43) Appendix 3. Agencies that have benefited from this modernization initiative are also cited in this document (2002:43). This comes on the heels of another PSC reform: Broad HR delegations to heads of designated Agencies of Government, namely, eight Executive agencies and four pilot ministries. Typically, an Accountability Agreement and Guidelines accompany the HR Delegation. The guidelines set out the values governing the delegation of functions and the behavior expectations. These values are: integrity, merit, fairness, transparency, equity, respect and accountability.

The first milestone in the development of the CSS occurred in 1949, the second occurred in 1973. At that time a central government agency, the Ministry of the Public Service (MPS), was set up, to establish relevant systems for managing specific HR functions that were not undertaken by the PSC. These functions included, training and development, implementing compensation and enhancing employee relations. In the 1980s, human resources planning, to be facilitated by the establishment of an HRM information system, became an added responsibility of the MPS. Since then, the MoFP has subsumed the Ministry of the Public Service. In the 2001-2002, sectoral budget presentation (MoFP, October 2001:1), the Minister of State in the MoFP focused on the HRM vision when he spoke of the challenges facing the Public Service Establishments Division of his Ministry: "Challenges facing the division include maintaining industrial harmony, recrafting conditions of service for employees to keep in line with modern practices, modernizing pensions legislation, monitoring the wage bill and developing human resources to meet the changing needs of society", (ibid).

The Cabinet Office provides the impulse for the current public sector modernization program that includes reforms to the existing CSS. Two critical elements of HRM are on the reform agenda of the Cabinet Office. These are the introduction of a system of performance management and the replacement or re-design of the existing HRMIS with a system that is technically reliable and will fully support other HRM subsystems, particularly employment management, development management, and compensation management in the entire public sector. The Cabinet Office also intends to "establish a Human Resource Development/Management Unit to address, co-ordinate and integrate central policy and HR management issues throughout the service" (Cabinet Office, 2002:43).

While the central agencies collectively provide direction to the line agencies, current reforms to the CSS are apparently striking a balance between centralized decision-making and local autonomy.

Political-Administrative Culture

Colonial political administrative culture is a principal force that has shaped the CSS in Jamaica. At the expatriate level the public servant combined political and administrative roles. Therefore political and administrative functions fused, as expatriates were offered considerable discretion and made nonsense of the politics administration dichotomy. "With decolonization came tension. A local political class was emerging and an administrative successor class had to be

prepared to take over from the colonial masters. Tensions between local and expatriate administrative functionaries followed usual class color dichotomy”, (testimonial). The implication of these tensions for the management of public employment and human resources, was the emphasis on the need to avoid political interference, in other words to insulate civil servants from politicians. Hence, an independent body, the PSC, staffed by professionals, was needed to engender trust and create space for viable institutional building of its secretariat, the Office of the Services Commissions (OSC). The Commissioners themselves are persons who have national presence, and a record of accountability. They serve the Commission on a part-time basis. Even though the PSC has generally maintained its reputation as a body that acts responsibly and with the highest integrity, “tensions persist, as Civil servants are anxious to follow due process while politicians are anxious to get policies and programs on the way”, (testimonial).

Tensions persist, as other institutions have emerged that in one way or another, have influenced the management of public employment and human resources. These institutions include statutory bodies, and state companies; staff unions/staff associations; special advisors to Ministers; the ubiquitous Commissions of Enquiry and political parties. Statutory bodies, state companies and a network of parastatal organizations have emerged in which the political class has had some freedom to intervene at different levels in HRM. A recent Walker Report [that was, only mentioned in testimonials, but was “not available”] apparently focused on the issue of significant disparities in the salaries payable to heads of some of these agencies, compared to salaries payable to central government employees at comparable levels in their organization hierarchy. These disparities have since been addressed: Ministry Paper No. 53 of 1999, entitled Statutory Corporations and Government Companies, (GoJ: October 25, 1999.)

The numbers of staff unions/ associations that negotiate on behalf of civil servants for salaries, benefits and conditions of service have grown to forty five (45) unions / associations representing thirty five bargaining units. Periodic negotiations with these unions/associations as well as government’s ability to pay, influence the salaries payable in the central government agencies.

Special advisors [a local advisory machinery] have emerged, which, have not supplanted the public HRM machinery but have influenced it. Currently every ministry has a special advisory core that guides policy and sometimes conflicts with the Civil Service. There is a view that the conditionalities of special advisors influence the morale of public agencies as “Advisors gain differential treatment, and influence policy. Advisors also influence salary and market value”(testimonial).

Commissions of Enquiry influence the CSS. These commissions resolve a range of problems including HR problems. Their functions are not only symbolic but they make recommendations to set standards. Political parties also affect the CSS by their policy priorities: The apparent shift from total reliance on centralized HRM decision-making to decentralized decision-making, which, has required changes in regulations, is a case in point.

Our political-administrative culture and the tensions that underpin it have historically, shaped our institutions for managing public employment and HR that have emerged and developed over time Correspondingly this culture has influenced HR practices and relationships. While

structures are changing and efforts at modernizing the CSS are taking place, these changes are taking place in a context where tension persists and where modernization initiatives represent corresponding changes in the distribution of power, and thus the process of change is constrained. While the institutional forms that frame the CSS may be changing, the related practices and the relationships are not changing in tandem, changes in practices and relationships are taking place more slowly. The existing legal framework also influences the CSS.

Legal Framework

Currently there are Acts and Regulations that address certain aspects of the CSS in Jamaica. These aspects include, conduct of public officers, integrity in public life, and the size of the central government. The single existing act that addresses the management of human resources comprehensively, relates specifically to executive agencies.

The PSC Law gives the PSC overall responsibility. The Public Service Regulations (1961) and the Staff Orders [developed by the MoFP] “govern the conduct of public servants, setting out how they should undertake activities in an honest and accountable manner. The Regulations and Staff Orders are both in the process of review to bring them in line with effective modern principles and practices”, (Cabinet Office 2002: 20). “On a wider policy level, the Staff Orders have been revised to address issues of employees’ activities and obligations outside the workplace, (ibid: 40).

Acts that address integrity in public life and specifically relate to public officers include, The Corruption Prevention Act that essentially sets out the provisions for eliminating corruption and The Contractor General’s Act (1985) that “provides a framework and institutions for the award and monitoring of contracts”(ibid: 20).

Avenues for redress exist in the event of alleged mal-administration. The Office of “the Public Defender who investigates and institutes proceedings regarding the allegations of mal-administration” (ibid: 20) has been established. The complaints over which the holder of this office presides, collectively serve as a barometer of how well the Citizen’s Charter, [a mechanism, that was introduced by the Prime Minister in 1994], is working. Although the Charter does not have a basis in either law or regulation, it is an initiative that focuses on the “the need for an improved public service delivery and performance right across the board. This is in keeping with the national goal of higher standards of conduct and a common acceptance of values by which the entire society can properly function.” (extract, Foreword by the Prime Minister “The Citizen’s Charter: Raising Standards of Service” published, 1994, by the Citizen’s Charter Unit, Office of the Prime Minister).

The Civil Service Establishments Act is the basis for containing the size of central government “to the level achieved after the downsizing exercise in 1992” (MoFP 2002:33). This Act is also being reformed to give delegated authorities to HR managers.

The Executive Agencies Act permits CEO’s direct control over the management of their human resources, dictates the implementation of performance management and incentives schemes and

the setting of performance targets. To this extent these agencies represent a unique subset of the public sector that is able to address HR issues in a more integrated manner. Executive agencies are also held to performance agreements.

The legal and regulatory frameworks for the CSS provide diverse regulations for different elements of the public sector. The central government agencies operate within regulatory and legal frameworks that require strict conformance to codes of conduct, and a certain level of administration. This framework does not address HRM in as integrated a manner.

4. INSTITUTIONAL CONTEXT ANALYSIS

4.1 Analysis of Legal Context

The legal context of the CSS in Jamaica is changing. While laws and regulations exist that centrally govern the conduct of public officers and the size of certain elements in the public sector, other elements, including the pilot group of central government agencies, and the executive agencies, have greater autonomy through HR delegations. The question may then be posed as to whether this change represents a paradigmatic shift: Replacing insulating the Civil Service [which is what the PSC is designed to do] with a new paradigm of bureaucratic control. A paradigmatic shift has implications for the CSS structures, practices and for relationships. Related issues concern the capacity of existing structures/agencies to manage this change, and the likely effects on efficiencies and accountabilities.

Existing structures/agencies for managing the change may require strengthening and possibly reform. The central agencies may also require enhanced capacities for monitoring and auditing agencies that have HR delegations. The members of the PSC serve on a part-time basis. Their new roles that result from the changing legal framework may require additional members that serve on a full time basis.

Regarding effects on efficiencies and accountabilities, the legal framework provides for an integrated approach to the management of public employment and human resources to select agencies, namely executive agencies. Central agencies have a legal framework that is diverse. Advocacy for a legal framework that allows for central control of the CSS, particularly for agencies that do not operate within strict performance parameters may arguably have some merit.

The Executive Agencies Act give executive agencies the power to reward based on an individual's contribution. It also provides these agencies with the power to generate funds. Executive agencies are outcome oriented, guided by performance parameters and performance agreements. Insights about the implication of this legal framework were gleaned from testimonials. Interviewees' comments have been paraphrased: There is evidence that 'agentification' has led to greater productivity and efficiency. Executive agencies meet their targets. There is however the counter argument, which, suggests that there is a role for central control of resources allocations, human and other resources, particularly in agencies that operate outside of strict performance parameters. The reason being, in the absence of central vision and control, respective agencies, will lose sight of "sensitivities regarding allocation of resources. Allocation, [it is argued] is now far removed from the urgency of situations and inefficiencies occur" (testimonials). What is apparently being advocated here is a vision and a course of action leading to a more comprehensive legal framework, instead of diverse laws and regulations for different elements of the public sector, as the diversity is likely to affect accountabilities and efficiencies.

A view, which, is not explored in this report, but is pertinent, is whether there is need to revisit the philosophical question, whether business differs from government, given the current emphasis on agentification.

4.2 Analysis of Other Contextual Elements

The CSS is also influenced by economic and socio-cultural factors. Local perceptions about the functioning of government, the policy priorities of government, in particular the current and imminent reforms and the likely effects of the country's size on the functioning of CSS, also provide insights about the environment in which public employment and human resources are managed in Jamaica.

The Economy: According to the MoFP, the achievement of the GoJ's mandate for economic growth is predicated on improvement in the optimization of the cadre of human resources, attitudinal and structural change as well as the implementation of flexible work arrangements, (MoFP 2002: 1, summarized). Jamaica's economic policy mandates and economic performance influence the CSS, in terms of capacity of public sector personnel required to achieve policy mandates, as well as the appropriateness of structures, practices and relationships that constitute the CSS. A brief review of the economic contexts that have led to these imperatives is provided.

The country's policy mandates have shifted from leading and controlling economic activity. While the government has not relinquished its leadership role in the economy, it also recognizes the critical role of the private sector in sustaining economic growth and facilitates this. Since independence and up to 1980, the government had a leadership role in the economy. During that period, the economy was on a steady growth path mainly because of inflows of foreign investments for mining, and manufacturing. With the rise in world oil prices and the destabilizing effect on world economies, Jamaica's economy also took a down turn. Foreign inflows were limited and in an effort to regain economic stability the country resorted to borrowing from international lending agencies. Reliance on borrowing and conformance to certain structural adjustment loan program conditionalities led to reduction in social programs, downsizing of the public sector and an existing debt burden of significant proportions. Debt servicing, the largest component of government expenditure was expected to amount to J\$115.7 billion in 2001(PIOJ 2002:6). The 'weakening' of the financial sector in Jamaica has exacerbated these negative impacts.

Current economic policy mandates emphasize economic growth. The public sector is expected to play leadership as well as facilitator roles in order that the country achieves this mandate. Policy emphases that hinge on public sector performance are that the sector "lead the growth process in the economy and create a stimulating environment when private sector growth appears to be stagnant" (MoFP, 2002:1). Modernization initiatives are expected to drive the necessary structural and attitudinal change in the public sector so that the economic mandate may be achieved. "A concomitant improvement in the optimization of the cadre of human resources", (MoFP 2002: 1) is also needed. MoFP views the proposed "implementation of flexible work arrangements and the creation of executive agencies" (MoFP 2002:1) as steps in the right direction. Speaking directly to the performance of public enterprises the MoFP has advocated that public entities engender confidence of various publics and interest groups, through a variety of ways including, stricter compliance of internal controls and greater transparency and accountability. These imminent changes in structures and practices and internal and external relationships will in all likelihood affect the CSS.

Jamaica's economy is small and open and therefore readily affected by changes in the international economy. According to the Planning Institute of Jamaica, in its publication, *Economic and Social Survey, Jamaica 2001*, the economic slowdown in the United States, the events of September 11th together with 'internal shocks' " had a dampening effect on output growth, (PIOJ 2002: Overview). In spite of these 'shocks' to the economy in "2001, economic performance was highlighted by the second consecutive year of real growth in Gross Domestic Product (GDP). The incidence of poverty declined by 2 per cent and the rate of unemployment by .5 percent," (ibid). Economic growth is the mandate for the way forward. Effective management of human capital, in a context of appropriate structures, practices and relationships, is likely to result in timely, efficient and effective responses by the public sector to the needs of the economy.

Socio-Cultural Factors: This section focuses on two important elements, namely the labor market and the attitudes in the society both of which affect the CSS. The labor market has become increasingly competitive, there are limited stocks of human capital, increasing unemployment and the existence of a labor market information system that is still at an embryonic stage. A positive feature is that the life long learning paradigm has apparently taken hold and employees are investing in themselves.

Events in the global economy have affected the labor market in Jamaica. "Advances in technology and liberalization internationally have led to increased competition in the Jamaican labor market, thereby making it more challenging to gain employment locally" (PIOJ February, 2002: 11, Issue number 4, in *Economic Update & Outlook October-December 2001*, Volume 6 No. 3). The decline in the global economy has also affected the domestic economy and the job market. It has been argued that global competition is "diminishing job security. The best defense is to prepare the labor force for the new reality with education and training that allow them to find jobs as markets evolve;continuing education and training for workers and management can no longer be reserved for school years but must be a continuing process within a well-functioning labor market" (Haque, Badrul. 1998:86). Haque also advocates the development of "effective systems to make use of the skills distribution that already exists through the creation of job banks and job-matching, in collaboration with business, unions and government, so as to raise productivity" (ibid: 90). The Ministry of Labor in Jamaica is currently developing a Labor market information system. At this stage of development the system provides only basic information.

The labor market is also affected by migration. Professionals are the largest occupational group to migrate, (PIOJ 2002: 20.9, in *Economic and Social Survey 2001*). There are also inflows of professionals. Data available on work permits granted indicate that of a total of two thousand eight hundred and seventy eight (2,878) work permits granted in 2001, two thousand two hundred and eighty four (2,284) of these were granted in the professional, technical, administrative and management categories. A similar trend was apparent in the previous year (ibid 2002: 21.)

Government needs to be well endowed with adequate quality and quantity of staff. The existing labor market has implications for the CSS. The main implication for the CSS is the need to formalize a human resource planning sub system that is supported by a human resource

management information system that provides timely and reliable information and facilitates the reduction of deficits in the central government. This need is even more urgent in the absence of a fully functioning labor market information system.

The stereotypic view of the attitudes of Jamaican workers is that they are conditioned by historical circumstances. Workers display what Mills, G.E. (1973:5) refers to as authoritarian submissive attitudes, that stymie innovativeness and creativity and lead to over reliance on centers of centralized decision-making. He also asserts that there is a lack of trust and transparency. These attitudes have implications for the CSS. Modernization initiatives have to be carefully managed. Modernization initiatives run counter to traditional approaches and are likely to meet with some resistance. Against this background, change has to be carefully managed. Those who have responsibility for managing public employment and HR, recognizing these limitations, need to institutionalize change management programs to facilitate the modernization process. At the institutional level, the labor market affects the CSS. At the individual level the attitudes that individuals bring to the work place also influence how public employment and HR are managed.

Local Perceptions: Persistent concerns relate to government's size, capacity, lack of a customer-centered orientation, and lack of transparency. Although these concerns may well be "exaggerated statements" what is apparent is that there is room for improvement in the way that government functions. It is evident, from government's initiatives, which, include the institutionalization of administrative reforms, the current public sector modernization program and imminent enhancements to the reform agenda, that the GoJ recognizes that ongoing improvement to the administration is necessary.

According to the 'Report of Committee of Advisors on Government Structure,' (1992: 4) concerns about the functioning of government have "largely centered around the over-concentration of decision-making which consigned the rest of the community to a largely peripheral role in the management of affairs; the low quality of the Civil Service; the over-bureaucratization of its methods of work leading to a compliance rather than a service orientation in its dealings with the public. In general, the impression was conveyed of an over-manned, slow, lumbering bureaucracy characterized by low morale, partly because of unsatisfactory salaries and other conditions of service, inadequate training, and a certain amount of political interference in the exercise of its functions" (ibid).

There is still the perception that government is too big. In fact government is the largest employer. The staff complement of the entire public sector is 97,434. (MoFP: Public Service Establishment Division, July 24, 2002). There are those who argue that the public sector needs to be 'lean and mean and to deliver more with less'. A counter argument might be that the complex and multifaceted demands of the citizens require capable persons in adequate numbers.

There apparently is some justification for the perception that the wheels of government grind slowly and that agencies work by the book rather than being customer focused. To accept these sweeping statements as being representative of all government agencies is to negate the efforts at modernization that are taking place in the public sector and the central government in particular. "In the Survey Department matters are dealt with within a six week, rather than a six month period," (Presentation made by an official from the Reform Unit in the Office of the Prime

Minister to the National Consultation on Public Sector Reform that took place at the Jamaica Conference Center, July 2002). Attendees at this National Consultation were also told that “the Statistical Institute of Jamaica (STATIN), had recently surveyed 16,000 persons regarding the quality of service that government agencies offered, with an 86% positive response and 14% negative”.

The establishment of executive agencies that operate within strict performance parameters and are entrepreneurial in orientation may help to eliminate the negative perception about the public sector. The entrepreneurial orientation may also dispel the strongly held view that the public service is rule bound rather than customer focused. There are also documented cases of agencies other than executive agencies, that provide services in an efficient and effective manner. Stories like these are not generally told.

There is also the perception that government agencies lack transparency in their operations. Accessing documented information about agency operations is not always easy. There are apparently gradations of openness that are attached to documented information. Access often depends on a need to know basis that is determined by the agency or the individual in possession of the information. A contributory factor is a deep-seated lack of trust that permeates the society and often dictates relationships, both internal and external to agencies. Internally, the transparency issue manifests itself in a number of ways: an official who is taking up a new job, removes all the files from the computer in office leaving no information for the replacement. A public official may also keep information ‘close to his/ her chest’ making it difficult for those persons whom he/she supervises to make decisions or to take action, necessitating decisions being taken at the supervisor’s level. The perceived lack of transparency tends to concretize the view that all are corrupt.

Perceptions about the functioning of government and in particular the central government agencies cannot be taken as applying to all agencies carte blanc. These perceptions do point to certain weaknesses manifested by government agencies, the weaknesses being more evident in some agencies than in others. Local perceptions about public agencies have not gone unnoticed by the GoJ. The institutionalization of a reform agenda that takes account of weaknesses is a positive step that has been taken by government. The reform effort is a comprehensive one that addresses, certain aspects of the CSS among other areas. In the section that follows, we will examine current and imminent reforms, paying particular attention to reforms that affect or are likely to affect the management of public employment and human resources.

Current and Imminent Reforms

Successive reform efforts in Jamaica have addressed different aspects of HRM, among other areas. The overarching HRM reform themes that have currency are HR decentralization and the role and status of the human resource cadre. Imminent reform will focus on rationalizing HRM and on taking a more integrated approach to the management of human resources.

Reforms to the Jamaican Civil Service were formalized under the Administrative Reform Program (ARP) in 1965. ARP I was initiated as a result of the United Nations Report on Public Administration (o/c the BULL Report, 1965). This report contained recommendations regarding the strengthening of the Public Service Commission and broadening its mandate to become a

Civil Service Department that would deal with other aspects of human resource management, namely 'establishment', training and the classification of posts. The report led in 1973 to the setting up of the Ministry of the Public Service (MPS) that sought to address human resource management in a systematic way. Under the aegis of MPS various training institutions were set up that were dedicated to the development of civil servants. The report also led to the development of a Permanent Secretary's Board to provide global management and advocacy for change, as a corporate body, as well as to provide a corporate perspective to Cabinet.

The foci of the ARP II initiated in 1988 were new accounting systems and HRMIS. The latter is still a prototype and not a production model. ARP II also included a model for improvement in HRM, largely delegation. Consequently aspects of the Staff Orders, including the granting of leave, were delegated by MPS to line agencies. Other reports produced during 1991-92 focused, among other things on the locus of leadership for reform efforts and on the issue of a policy void. Related recommendations were: that reform should be driven by the Prime Minister, a Policy Analysis and Review Unit (PARU) be set up in the Prime Minister's Office to address the policy void, the Cabinet Secretary be the head of the Civil Service, and the appropriate Secretariat be set up to support the Cabinet Office. PARU is in effect, a formal strategy to ensure that there is cross consultation on policy issues, that citizens participate in the policy process, and that sub-committees are developed to support the policy analysis and review process. Currently the Human Resource, Economic Development, Infrastructure and Land and Environment Committees are in place to facilitate citizen participation in the policy process.

Components of the current Public Sector Modernization Program (PSMP), have involved the decentralization of HRM; providing a higher profile for the HRM function, including employing persons competitively to fill positions, creating senior level HRM positions, providing relevant training, and "examining a more integrated approach to HRM".

Four central government agencies have HR delegations, namely, the Ministry of Local Government, the Office of the Cabinet, the Prime Minister's Office and the Ministry of Education. Interestingly, decentralization is also at work within other line agencies. The Ministry of Health has set up four Regional Health Authorities, each one headed by a Director who is in effect a business manager and has full control over the Authority's HR. Executive agencies also have full control over their HR ("the PSC has given these agencies freedom with HRM," (testimonial).

A higher profile for HR has been achieved partly because of a modernization initiative that has positioned personnel in the HR cadre in more strategic positions within the organization hierarchy: Currently, a Senior Director of Human Resource Management typically heads the HR Department and is a member of a Ministry's senior management team. The institutionalization of corporate planning is also a component of current reform that is linked to the HR. Heads of HRM Departments report to the Director of Corporate Services. HRM personnel in leadership positions have more strategic roles.

Imminent reforms that "aim to integrate HRM" are aspects of a public service reform vision that has been articulated by the government, (in a draft document from the Cabinet Office titled, "Public Sector Modernization Vision and Strategy 2010", that was issued at the National

Consultation on reform, July 2002:). The emphasis is on coordinating and building on earlier reforms, with citizen participation, achieve the vision of a “an open and impartial Public Service, which puts the public’s interests first, and in which valued and respected professionals deliver high quality services efficiently and effectively” (Cabinet Office 2002:1). Improving the Jamaican Public Service is considered to be a pre-requisite for achieving the vision and national goals for sustainable development, (ibid, paraphrased). The key strategic objectives for public service reform, articulated in the document are: “To confirm the role and core functions of government; To improve the ways in which Jamaica is governed, through sharing the exercise of power and increasing the participation in decision-making; To promote effective management, through appropriate mechanisms, that expressly reflects government’s priorities; To re-affirm the values of the Public Service, stressing integrity, objectivity and accountability; To deliver high quality services to users at reasonable cost ;To deliver high quality policy advice to government; To secure performance improvements through the establishment of a performance culture in the public service; To value public servants and make sure that they are both motivated and properly equipped o meet the challenges; To manage all the resources in the public sector to achieve best value for money in the delivery of services”.

Imminent reform will “target areas of policy, organizational structures, systems, human resources, technology and the legal framework” (Cabinet Office, 2002:4-6). HR priorities articulated include: developing human resource policies within the framework of corporate plans, developing a performance culture that is based on performance standards and pay for performance, developing, in collaboration with Staff Associations, human resources in the public sector to facilitate professionalism, and in particular the development of leadership abilities. A human resource management information system that provides timely and reliable information to “ facilitate costing of services and other critical HR functions such as manpower and succession planning, pensions and benefits management and management of incentive schemes linked to higher performance requirements” (Cabinet Office, 2002:54) is also envisaged. The Cabinet Secretary is to be the locus of policy making on HRM. This will be achieved by “the pulling together of everything to do with HRM into the Cabinet Office, other than classification, compensation and wage negotiations. MoFP will retain these three functions. Executive Agencies is the way forward. The pre-conditions for establishing these agencies being, clear targets of performance standards, existing human resource policies and procedures, pay for performance/incentive pay basis,” (testimonials: 2002). Imminent reforms will in all likelihood affect the CSS, in particular, structures, practices and internal and external relationships.

Size:

Jamaica does not conform to certain indicators of ‘smallness’ namely, population and area (World Bank Atlas in Baker 1992:30). The scale of bureaucracy [all public sector entities are included] relative to the population, ninety seven thousand, four hundred and thirty four over two point six million, (97,434/2.6 million) cannot be categorized as small. In any event, the definitions of ‘smallness’, are conflicting and the validity of existing definitions are still being examined. Contradictory views also exist about the impact of scale on administrative performance. A strongly argued view is that small size can be a constraint when a country has limited skilled competent human capital, and therefore small reserve of capacity, has low

adaptability to change, low productivity among others. It is also argued that small size may lead to personalism.

In a relatively small country like Jamaica, the public sector faces resource constraints. The country has the challenging task of maintaining a critical mass of personnel particularly in the professional and technical areas. Such personnel are often offered employment opportunities overseas that are more lucrative than comparable positions in country. The brain drain is still an issue in Jamaica, particular in the health and education sectors. “Deficits exist in the health sector and in the supply of science and language teachers”(testimonial).

In terms of personalism, there is the perception that a “certain amount of political interference in the exercise of the public sector’s functions prevails”. Apparently, there is sometimes pressure on civil servants to move ahead with programs, or to make certain decisions, while the civil servants emphasize due process: “Pressures arise when political accountabilities conflict with public servants’ observance of due process,”(testimonial). These pressures are arguably more pronounced in central government agencies where ministers of government have to interact with agency heads. “Conflict is inevitable as ministers have political accountability but are impotent in the administrative sphere.” A commonly held view is that “small society problems are profound”. “In small societies, informal forces are at work that play a role in decision-making”. “Small society problems, especially the inappropriate use of influence plays a big role, by coloring the qualitative assessment of individual’s performance. Performance evaluation is linked to capacity, capability and the utilization of individuals for the satisfaction of the organization as well the individuals’ satisfaction. Satisfied individuals usually contribute most to organizations,” (testimonial). A counter view is: “there is influence, but employees’ as well as managers’ professionalism reduces this, even when persons with power wish to push them to do otherwise” (testimonial). According to Baker (1992:17), in small states it is impractical to separate personality from function, since officials have to interact with their constituents as neighbors, relatives and friends to a much higher degree than in a large country”.

The CS system in Jamaica is influenced by many factors: political-administrative culture, economic and socio-cultural contexts, legal framework, local perceptions, reforms and small size.

5. FUNCTIONAL ANALYSIS OF THE CIVIL SERVICE

Interviews and consultations with individual experts and two panels of experts, with extensive knowledge about the CSS in Jamaica, documentary review and the application of select 'quantitative indicators of governance,' provided the bases for the functional analysis of the CSS. The checklist of ninety three (93) critical points (Appendix 4), provided in the Longo methodological framework, as well as country specific questions introduced by the researcher to elicit responses about the impact of country size and its likely influence on the CSS were the bases for enquiry. All 93 check listed statements were posed as questions and the responses were analyzed. Based on the application of an analysis scale to the seven HRM subsystems, values and corresponding weights were assigned to each critical point.

Opinions were gathered mainly from internal as well as external experts. These experts included executives and other public officials responsible for the CSS, a member of the PSC cum academic, union leadership and advisors to central government agencies. The testimonials of these experts have been incorporated into the analysis that follows, in order to explicate or reinforce the themes and issues that emerged. The panels addressed the management of compensation and employment management and followed the same format. Subsequent contact with panel members was necessary in order to clarify issues.

Documents reviewed included the Jamaica Constitution (Order in Council), 1962, laws, regulations, agency reports, diagnostic studies, ministry papers, and relevant texts. The absence, incompleteness or unavailability of verifiable data in general posed a challenge in terms of obtaining eight of the nineteen indicators. As a result, indicators 6-8 and 14-18 were therefore not used for purposes of this analysis. Disaggregated data for central government, local government and other elements in the public sector was not readily available. In those circumstances, the measures for the public sector as a whole were used as the bases for deriving the indicators. The indicators provided measures of professionalism of the civil service, fiscal weight of public employment, civil service incentives and civil service employment.

5.1 Analysis of Quantitative Indicators of the CSS

Overall these measures indicate that

- ⌘⌘ The incidence of political appointees is low in the central government in Jamaican;*
- ⌘⌘ Government expenditure on the public sector wage bill is likely to be a burden on the economy;*
- ⌘⌘ Public sector pay is not necessarily a disincentive to persons wishing to pursue a career: [This statement has to be taken with caution in the absence of baseline comparison with the private sector as a whole or specific elements within the private sector].*
- ⌘⌘ Education, Health and Police components of the public sector may require further development*
- ⌘⌘ The incidence of industrial conflict within the public sector is apparently declining.*

Professionalism of the Civil Service:

- ⌘⌘ Rate of Political Appointments in the Central Government: .083%*

This indicator is a measure of the incidence of political appointees. The source of data was The Civil Service Establishments Act (General) Order, 2001. Less than (1%) [34/41,098] of the positions in the central government is explicitly provided by political criteria, namely, Ambassadors, High Commissioners or other “principal representative of Jamaica, in countries other than Jamaica”, and Advisors to Ministers of government.

There are approximately thirty four such positions: Approximately seventeen, ambassadorial and other posts of principal representative abroad (The Civil Service Establishments Act (General) Order, 2001: 265-273). There is an Advisor in each of the seventeen government ministries. There are forty one thousand and ninety eight (41,098) positions in the central government, (The Civil Service Establishments Act (General) Order, 2001: xi)

The Prime Minister has the legal right under Section 128 of the Jamaica Constitution (Order in Council) 1962 to make the employment decisions regarding Jamaica’s principal representatives abroad. Advisors to government ministers “hold office at the pleasure of the Minister. They are not appointed by the PSC,” (interview 2002). The Prime Minister also assigns Permanent Secretaries, but these persons are appointed by the PSC. The holders of the posts are generally professionals and career civil servants and are neither perceived as, nor are political appointees.

This measure indicates that the central Government of Jamaica is more professional than politicized. In all likelihood the PSC’s efforts to insulate the civil servant from political influence and to maintain its own integrity are contributory factors.

Fiscal Weight of Public Employment

Wage bill of the public sector as a percentage of GDP (current prices): 12.7%

Wage bill of the central government as a percentage of GDP: 10.5%

Wage Bill of the public sector as a percentage of total public expenditure: 19.4%

Wage bill of the central government as a percentage of total expenditure: 15.9%

The resulting ratio [public sector wage bill as a percentage of GDP] can vary between 5%-25% depending on the extent of the involvement of the state in the economy. High percentage numbers indicate that the government’s wage bill may burden the economy.

Using the MoFP, Jamaica Memorandum on the Budget 2002-03, (Chap.1 pg.7) and the Statistical Institute of Jamaica [STATIN], 2002: 12-13, (in National Income and Product 2001) as the main data sources, *the measure derived using GDP constant (1986) prices is 213.6% [J\$ 42,588.2 million / J\$ 19,940.2 million]. The measure seems suspect and was therefore not used for purposes of the analysis. However, using GDP at current prices for 2001 (\$334.7b), the percentage is 12.7% [J\$42,588.2 / J\$334,700.0].*

Using the MoFP, Jamaica Memorandum on the Budget 2002-3, (Chap.1 pg.7) and the Planning Institute of Jamaica’s (PIOJ) Economic and Social Survey (2002: 6.4) as the main data sources, *the measure derived for the wage bill of central government as a percentage of GDP is 10.5% [J\$35,163.8 million / J\$ 334.7b).*

The wage bill for the public sector and the central government respectively, represents non-repayable recurrent expenditure and in addition, does not reflect the total compensation package.

Non-monetary benefits, which, include training, subsidized meals, transportation, housing and non-contributory pension are costly. Were these benefits to be factored into the wage bill then it is likely to be significantly higher. Bearing this in mind, both measures suggest that the wage bill may be a burden on the economy.

The data sources used for deriving the measure of the wage bill as a percentage of total expenditure were the MoFP, (Jamaica Memorandum on the Budget 2002-03, Chap.1 pg.7) and STATIN (2002: ix) in National Income and Product 2001, *the measure derived for the wage bill of the public sector/total expenditure was 19.4% [J\$42,588.2 billion/ J\$219.8 billion]*. Another source (MOFP, Jamaica Memorandum on the Budget 2002-03 April 18, 2002, Expenditure Outturn Statistics- FY 2001/02) indicates that the wage bill represents a substantial percentage of recurrent expenditure: 37%.

Using the PIOJ, (Economic and Social Survey 2002: 6.4) and STATIN (2002:ix) in National Income and Product 2001, *the measure derived for the wage bill of central government / total expenditure was 15.9% [J\$35,163.8 /J\$219.8 billion]*.

Using the OECD/ EU comparators of 10% as the basis for comparison, both measures of 19.4% and 15.9 % are high. All the measures of the fiscal weight of public employment suggest that the governmental wage bill is a load on the economy.

Civil Service Incentives

≈≈ *Vertical Compression of Wages ratio 1:15*

≈≈ *Average Government Wage to Per Capita GDP: 78.4*

‘Civil Service Incentives’ collectively provide an indication of the internal equity of the compensation structure. They also provide a measure of the relationship between wages paid in the public sector and elsewhere. The measures provided here relate to indicators 4 and 5 stated above, as verifiable data required for baseline comparisons between the public and private sectors (measures 6-8) were unavailable. Measures were derived using STATIN and the MoFP as the data sources. The measures also relate to public sector rather than central government [“data for the central government was unavailable’ according to a MoFP Establishments Division source].

Vertical Compression of Wages measured the difference between the total pay received by the employees at the top wage level and those at the lowest level of the wage scale. The resulting ratio was examined against the range 1:7 to 1:20. [In the absence of information regarding the number of persons receiving salaries at the highest and lowest levels the OECD’s measure of wage compression, which is a more accurate measure, was not used.]

Using data from a MoFP, Establishments Division (interview, July 24,2002), data regarding highest and lowest levels of salary, a ratio of highest salary to the lowest in the general government salary scale was arrived at. *The ratio of the highest salary J\$ 2.85mn-3.55mn to the lowest J\$204,600-231505, is 1:15.* This ratio is within the range and suggests that the compensation structure is relatively equitable and does not undermine incentives for civil servants to pursue their career.

Average Governmental Pay / GDP per Capita (Indicator 5), measures the extent to which general government employees are satisfied with their pay. Using STATIN data (2002: 13) regarding GDP per capita, and MoFP data regarding average salary in the public sector (interview 2002: July 24), *a measure, 78.4 [J\$600,000 / J\$7,654]*, was derived. Measured on the scale 0-100 the ratio suggests that government wages are high enough to support public employees. From statistics provided in the joint PIOJ/ STATIN publication, 'Jamaica Survey of Living Conditions, 2001' one could generalize that public employees are reasonably satisfied with their wages and salaries, given the minimum required for a reference family and adult equivalent poverty line. "The adult-equivalent poverty line increased to \$44,208.2 in 2001 while the minimum required for a reference family of five (two adults and three children) was \$ 167,083.1, (2002:28) Government of Jamaica (Go J) has maintained a policy of wage restraint. The percentage increase in wages has remained in single digits (4%) since 1996. This is unlike earlier years when double-digit increases were made. With elections imminent it is claimed that bargaining units in the public sector will 'use the run up period' to the elections as an opportune time to agitate for greater increases [Testimonials summarized.]

Indicators 6: - 8: Documented data regarding average salary representative of the entire finance and manufacturing sectors respectively or an average for the private sector as a whole, was unavailable. The Jamaica Employers Federation (JEF) sources: JEF Wage, Salary & Benefits Survey for Supervisory, Clerical & hourly Rated Employees 2001; JEF Salary & Benefits Survey for Executive & Managerial Staff 2000 provided detailed information regarding salaries in a sample of occupational groups. The JEF (2000:viii) cited limitations to obtaining information about the private sector: A major limitation was non-participation and the confidential nature of salaries particularly at the management level. "The issue of compensation of managers and executives continues to be a sensitive one, consequently the reaction to the request to participate was to a great extent negative." Reference to the "wage scandal that occurred earlier in the year in the public sector" (ibid), was cited as a major reason for non- participation (ibid). Since the investigation into these salary disparities, the government has strengthened the mechanisms for monitoring public enterprises and the network of parastatals, in keeping with MoFP, Ministry Paper 53, 1999.

Civil Service Employee Indicators

- ∞∞ Total number of public employees as a percentage of the total population: 3.72%*
- ∞∞ Total number of central government employees as a percentage of total population: 1.57%*
- ∞∞ Total number of central government employees as a percentage of the employed labor force:4.4%*
- ∞∞ Total number of public employees in Education Sector as a % of total pop: 1.1%*
- ∞∞ Total number of public employees in Health Sector as a % of total pop: .4%*
- ∞∞ Total number of public employees in Police Sector as a % of total pop: .48%*
- ∞∞ Total number of public employees in Public Companies as a % of total pop: .81 %*

The assumption that underpins these measures is that generally, "an excessive percentage number would reflect an inefficient management of public employment with more or less nepotistic displays. A very low number would show an insufficient development of the public

sector considered overall” (IADB TOR 2002:65). The figure ranges from 0-100. The measures derived suggest insufficient development of the public sector.

A measure of total public employees to total population of 3.72% [97,468 / 2,621,110] is low in a range of 0-100. There is also a relatively low proportion of central government workers relative to total population. A measure of the total central government employees to total population is 1.57% [41,098/ 2,621,110] and as a percentage of the total employed labor force, is 4.4% [41,098/942,400, (STATIN, The Labor Force 2001: ii).

1.1% (27541/ 2,621,110) of total public employees work in the education sector. This figure is low, indicating a need to develop the sector further. It may be instructive to balance the quantitative measure with the national education and training policy and budget. In 2001, the education sector received the largest allocation totaling \$ 19.9 billion. This allocation represented 10.8% of budgeted expenditure and was part of a deliberate policy of the Go J in its efforts to “provide opportunities for the development of the country’s social capital (PIOJ 2002: 22.1) publication, Economic & Social Survey 2001. This allocation “must be seen in light of the GoJ’s commitment to increase the allocation to the sector, to 15.0 percent of its national budget by 2005, (ibid: 22.2). Allocations of this magnitude are in keeping with goals of the government that include the provision of universal education, adequate capacity and infrastructure in the sector.

Health sector employees represent only .4% of population [10,771/2,621,100]. The figure suggests an insufficiently developed sector. The health sector workforce figure that was used to derive this measure excludes staff at the four Regional Health Authorities. These entities are semi- autonomous and were set up as part of the MoH’s initiative to decentralize the management of health care delivery. These are relatively new agencies. A review needs to be done to determine whether the combined staff would make a significant difference in terms of adequate development of the sector. (Data about current staff complement of the respective Authorities was not readily available.)

The measure of the total number of employees in the police sector relative to the population is .48% [12,600/2,621,100]. (The source of data for the size of the JCF is the MoFP Establishments Division, typewritten statement indicating size of different components of the public sector dated July 24,2002). Given the incidence of crime and the ratio of police to citizenry, the sector is apparently insufficiently developed. The incidence of crime reported in 2001 was 33,595, with eighty percent cleared up (PIOJ 2002: 24.2) “The ratio of police to citizenry was 1:366 citizens. If all vacancies were to be filled the ratio would be 1: 307”(ibid). While reported crime rates have declined by 14.3 percent the “incidence of murder rose by 28.4 percent making the total number of murders 1139”(ibid). The Jamaica Constabulary Force (JCF) is undergoing a modernization process and has developed programs to improve crime prevention and detection. This program may ameliorate the present situation, in spite of the ‘leaness’ of the JCF. The continued development of the police sector is apparently warranted.

The measure of total number of public employees in public companies, as a percentage of the population is .81%: [21,282/ 2,621,100.] According to the MoFP, Establishments Division, the data source, the total number of persons ---12,600, includes staff in statutory bodies, public

enterprises and public companies. This figure is low [in a range of 0-100], and arguably is cause for developing the sector further. While these agencies collectively, have an important role in facilitating economic growth, further development of the sector would come in the wake of the rationalization of the number of existing entities in the sector, efforts to improve the accountabilities of the entities (by the enactment of the Public Bodies Management and Accountabilities Act 2001), regularizing compensation packages, putting in place mechanisms to facilitate monitoring and corporate governance. It is claimed that these entities lead to the creation of parallel personnel systems that affect the morale of staff in the central government agencies as well as market value. The quantitative indicators need to be weighed in the balance with the realities of the context.

Other Indicators

⌘⌘ *The number of man-hours lost from labor conflicts in the administration is declining, the implication being, that the industrial relations climate is relatively stable.*

⌘⌘ *In 2001 man-hours lost were 35. In 2000, this figure was 37.*

Data required for deriving the indicators that measure the technical level of the central government, horizontal compression of wages, staff turnover and absenteeism, was “unavailable” / “not maintained” and apparently does not exist.

There were limitations in calculating the indicator that measures working hours lost due to labor conflict/total hours of economic activity lost. No published data exists that disaggregates the hours of economic activity lost from working hours lost. ‘Man-days lost’ is the only measure available. The data available reflects: “work stoppages for which there is sufficient information available to calculate man-days lost” (MoLSS 2002:16), the implication being that data provided may not reflect the total number of man-hours actually lost. ‘Man-days lost’ is not disaggregated by sector within central government, negating that level of analysis. It is apparent that *the number of man-hours lost from labor conflicts in the administration is declining. In 2001 man-hours lost were 35. In 2000, this figure was 37. The total number of man-hours lost at the national level, show a similar trend. In 2001 the number of man-hours lost from labor conflicts were 13,178 and in 2000 the hours lost were 22,580.* Data sources were MoLSS (2002:16) and MoFP Industrial Relations Division (consultation, August 8, 2002).

Unavailability and incompleteness of data were major limitations to deriving the indicators. The other challenge, is applying these indicators meaningfully. The indicators of the professionalism of the civil service, fiscal weight of public employment, civil service incentives, civil service employee indicators and other indicators provided are likely to be meaningful to the extent that they are explicated against the background of their unique contexts.

⌘⌘ *The indicators overall suggest professionalism is emphasized in the CSS in Jamaica. Indicators also suggest that in spite of the ‘weight of fiscal employment’ that further development of key sub sectors including health, education and the police is likely to enhance efficiency.*

5.2 Analysis by Subsystem

Human Resource Planning

≪≪ *The institutional framework for the human resource planning subsystem is still at an embryonic stage, and this makes strategic coherence of HRM policies and practices difficult. The human resource management information system (HRMIS) that provides the basis for HR planning has limited applicability in terms of proactively facilitating an effective CSS. Corporate planning is the overarching planning framework. Corporate plans driven by national priorities drive the budget process. The GoJ recognizes the objectives and tasks of the HR planning subsystem, and has articulated its intent to address this deficit under the aegis of the public sector modernization initiative. Currently, the resources and technical capacity required to implement HRMIS are apparently lacking.*

The strategic coherence of different HRM policies and practices is constrained because of the absence of formalized HR planning. Main themes raised in the testimonials reflected the awareness of the strategic importance of HR planning in managing public employment and human resources and in particular of attendant processes facilitated by HRMIS. The recognition that HRP processes need to be adequately developed, the effects of the inadequacies of HR planning and the HRMIS and the ownership of HRMIS: HRMIS provides “information to the Cabinet Office to facilitate HRM”. The system, “established in 1996, [is] still a prototype; and has limitations. The prototype software [is] stretched to the limit. [The] system gives basic information about staff, [but] cannot indicate HR needs” (testimonials).

Certain limitations concerning the available technical capacity in ministries and resources required to implement HRMIS were also mentioned. “There are 500 computers and 34 sites or entities. Entities have dial-up access but there is a lack of technical expertise on-site”. “I could not access information [as a result] no forecasts were done”.

There is also the issue of ‘ownership’ of HRMIS by the line agencies and the implication that acquiring the necessary technical capacity and attitudes necessary for using new technology has to be seen as part of a process of change that is taking place: “HRMIS was centrally owned and managed, but was not at the local level” [until relatively recently].

The Go J has recognized these limitations and has indicated its intent to address the deficit. In the interim, corporate planning is the overarching planning framework. “Corporate plans that are driven by national priorities drive the budget process. From corporate plans flow operational plans. The latter are based on available funds vis a vis priorities that are articulated in the Prime Minister’s Budget and Throne Speeches, the Government’s manifesto and sectoral ministers’ speeches” (Testimonials). HR managers do have bases for indicative HR planning that an ‘up and running’ HRMIS would facilitate.

The existence of a formalized well developed HR planning sub system with the necessary linkages with other HR subsystems would guide and facilitate a strategic approach to the management of public employment and HR in Jamaica. This approach would benefit internal as well as external stakeholders. HR planning would complement the current institutionalized corporate planning efforts, avoid surpluses and deficits that currently occur, and provide on an ongoing basis, the number and quality of personnel, necessary to facilitate the government’s

priorities of economic growth and sustainable development. Funding for this critical prerequisite for HR planning, the capacity to manage the system as well as training for the users is critical.

Organization of Labor

Because the expertise for job description writing resides primarily in the central agency, MoFP, this limits the development of the organization of labor process throughout the CSS. Generally job descriptions written by management analysts are accurate and incorporate inputs from line managers. Job descriptions focus on technical specializations, less so on personal profiles. This focus has implications for employment management, and development management. While technical skills, education and knowledge requirements are important it is often the personal competencies that underpin effective job performance.

The stated purpose of organization of labor is to “define for persons working to a common objective, discrete functions,” (testimonial). This system is not generally linked to HR planning. Requests from central government agencies are made to MoFP, the central agency with a team of management analysts responsible for job description development. [Certain agencies, including MoH and MoE, with Planning Units provide their own resources for job description writing]. Essentially, job descriptions include the role and core functions of the job, required skills, working conditions, qualifications and experience. See sample Job Description questionnaire and Job description at Appendix 5 and Appendix 6.

The development of the processes that make up the organization of labor subsystem “is inadequate as expertise is primarily within the Management Services Division of the MoFP” (testimonial). Job descriptions follow management criteria and are generally accurate when done by trained analysts. In terms of precision, job descriptions for management tend to be broader. Lower down the hierarchy, job descriptions are prescriptive. A job description generally emphasizes tasks. The competency requirements in job descriptions, learning and behavioral capacities, and personality traits are generally not stressed. General classification and hierarchical structure of positions follow rational criteria and are adapted for each organizational environment. The profile of skills does not generally go beyond university degree or technical specialization requirements. Personal skills profile needs to be elaborated further.

Periodic reviews of job descriptions are not routinely done. Review is generally done when agencies are expanding and reorganizing and request new positions or reclassification of positions. Generally line managers (Heads of Departments) are required to indicate performance requirements and supervisors make inputs in the job description questionnaire.

Employment Management

The current emphasis on professionalism and merit in the employment management subsystem of the Jamaican CSS has a firm basis in the subsystem’s interconnection to the organization of labor subsystem, and to the major role that job descriptions play in the processes of management of job assignment, mobility management and departure management. Recruitment is competitive and the representative nature of the selection committees, their independence, professionalism and technical competence, help to minimize abuse. The professionalism of the central government is reinforced by the

evident low incidence of political appointees, [measured by indicator 1]. Technical skills profiles are also used to facilitate the decision making process, which, is generally transparent. While not the norm, the influence of small size and “the intensity of relationships, can result in individuals being ‘side-lined’, that is not dismissal and discrete ways found to frustrate and rotate,” (testimonial). An element of the employment management subsystem that requires strengthening is the quality of induction. A formalized induction program is only evident in a handful of agencies. Databases to facilitate detection of staffing changes [staff turnover] and rate of absenteeism [absenteeism indices], are not maintained.

The policies and practices that guide this subsystem in the CSS in Jamaica leaves little doubt as to the complexity of the subsystem and the emphasis on professionalism that underpins it. The stated object of the employment management subsystem is to “recruit and develop persons to ensure that there are always suitably qualified and motivated staff,” [it is also] “the development of human resources to equip them to meet organizational objectives,” (testimonials). The subsystem is closely connected to the organization of labor subsystem: “Requirements are not arbitrary but relate to specific job description, technical competence and defined experience” (testimonial).

The main processes, namely the management of job assignment, mobility management and departure management, are formalized. Management of job assignment includes, recruitment, selection and induction. Induction is not as formalized in the CSS as are recruitment and selection. “ Recruitment is competitive, [there is a] rigorous selection process that includes interviews and sometimes examinations. There is very little political pressure. Contractual employees may come with some pressure, recommendations from politicians must conform to regulations” (testimonials). As the indicator measuring the incidence of politicization confirmed, the incidence of political appointees is low [approximately 1% due to rounding up]. No anti-discriminatory laws exist, but “abuse is minimized” as “good judgment generally prevails and the use of a representative panel of interviewers generally facilitates a balanced approach.” “The process is transparent” (testimonials). The jobs are generally openly and widely advertised in the press and elsewhere, and suitable persons are generally found. There are certain positions that are apparently difficult to fill, including “posts of ‘corporate planner, human resource planner, office manager” (testimonials). “Sometimes, the unusually high educational requirements and resource constraints [apparently limit the successful sourcing of suitable persons to fill posts]” (testimonial with elaboration). Skills profiles are used. These emphasize the technical specialization.

Selection bodies generally act independently and satisfy criteria for professionalism and technical soundness. Their decisions are usually sound, and “are based on careful, detailed check listed activity,” (testimonial).

Elements of this subsystem that require strengthening are induction, required databases, and the timely enforcement of sanctions when central government employees breach disciplinary codes. The main weakness of this subsystem is the inadequacy of the induction process. Only certain ministries, including, MoF&FT, MoE and the MoH have well developed induction programs. Databases of staff turnover and absenteeism “do not exist”. [This negated efforts to derive

related indicators--- absenteeism indices and measures of churn.] Disciplinary procedures are effective. It is the application of these procedures that are problematic, particularly when sanctions are not enforced in a timely manner.

The level of professionalism existing in the central government is evident not only in terms of the approaches to recruitment and selection, but also when there is a change in the political administration and the impact on jobs of a professional nature. A change in the administration does not result in significant change in jobs of a professional character. “Only personal assistants, advisors and special assistants change” (testimonial).

The issue of frequently vacant positions cannot be addressed only from a numerical perspective but must also be addressed from the perspective of the impact of the vacancy. Even when there are frequently few vacant positions of technical/specialists as occurs in the health sector, the effect of the few is likely to have a greater impact in a small developing country like Jamaica than they would in a large and more developed country.

Performance Management

≪≪ In the Jamaican CSS elements of a performance management system are in place. These elements are formalized primarily at the level of the Permanent Secretary (PS), the administrative head of a ministry, whose performance is judged against stipulated criteria set out in his/her respective performance contract. Performance guidelines collectively constitute an integral element of performance management and are generally developed during the corporate planning process. Another key element of the performance management subsystem is the performance appraisal instrument. Individual agencies including the Cabinet Office have devised instruments that provide a basis for performance planning, for comparing performance guidelines with results and for providing feedback. However there are concerns about the technical reliability and objectivity of the instruments in general use. These concerns have contributed to the impulse to address performance management holistically. A performance management and appraisal subsystem is envisaged for the CSS in Jamaica that “is based on a principle of setting individual goals and performance criteria linked to the organizational goals and objectives, development of performance measures, regular review, adjustment and feedback,” Office of the Prime Minister, February 5, 2001, draft document entitled “Performance management and appraisal system for the public service of Jamaica.

The stated objective of performance management, according to the persons consulted, is to “provide standards to facilitate individuals’ growth and development” [as well as] “rewards and sanctions” (testimonials). In the executive agency consulted there was evidence of the existence of a performance management system that was central to pay, productivity and development. The interconnections between these subsystems in the central government as the performance management subsystem is envisioned are in the developmental stage”. There is a vision for the improvement”; a “ working document relating to a performance management and appraisal system in Jamaica is in place” (testimonials).

“At the PS’s level a performance contract was introduced in 2000. Permanent Secretaries are evaluated by the Cabinet Secretary [who, is Head of the Civil Service]. The Performance

Contract is based on the PS's corporate plan. This forms his /her criteria for evaluation. There are also performance management indicators in place. PS's report twice per year" (testimonial). Performance management indicators are sometimes inadequate at other levels.

Managers in the ministries meet annually to decide on corporate plans. In the process they develop performance guidelines against which to measure results. There are quarterly reviews. However, throughout the management cycle, essential activities, namely, active follow-up, observation and support of staff's performance by providing resources or removing obstacles where necessary, are often not formalized.

In terms of instrumentation, managers generally conduct formal evaluations once per year. Emphasis is being placed on improving the technical soundness of the instruments that managers use as well as the frequency of appraisal. Performance appraisal instruments (Appendix 7) are not considered to be as reliable and objective as they might be and in the absence of clear performance standards personality traits are the bases for assessing performance. There is also the contention that the guidelines that accompany the instruments are not specific enough. By comparison the instruments developed in executive agencies (Appendix 8) and other agencies, including the University of the West Indies, have placed greater emphasis on instruments that appear more technically reliable and are linked to clear performance standards.

Overall, the desirability of formalizing performance management at all levels is recognized and is being addressed. The pace has been set at the leadership levels.

Management of Compensation

⌘⌘ In the CSS of the central government, compensation fulfils stated objectives [articulated in testimonials] of providing internal equity, attractiveness to retain staff and a 'decent living wage' [the latter, was confirmed by the indicator that measured the relationship between average salary in the public sector and the GDP per capita]. In terms of competitiveness to the private sector, GoJ has committed itself to bringing public sector pay in line with eighty percent of private sector pay. In terms of internal equity, there is evidence of salary structure design that is linked to work organization, job classification and job description, and operates within set parameters for periodic review. There is flexibility built in that accounts for market pressures for specified groups. Wage administration is centralized and wage decisions are generally transparent. The design of evolution mechanisms is not as clearly delineated. The introduction of incentive awards is envisaged as a component of a performance management system that is being developed (Cabinet Office: Draft "Performance management and appraisal system for the Public Service of Jamaica, February 5,2001,pp2).

The stated objectives of compensation management according to the testimonials are "equity", "[providing] a decent living wage" and "competitiveness to the private sector". Wage structure and policy operate within a two year parameter set by the MoFP, but there is flexibility built in that accounts for market pressure for specific groups, including teachers and nurses. "In terms of comparability of wages, the bottom is at market, the middle at market or below, the top is not as competitive" (testimonial). [Data to derive specific

indicators to verify this was unavailable or incomplete.] GoJ has however committed itself to bringing public sector wages in line with 80% of private sector wages. The issue is, whether there is the ability to pay, given the fiscal weight of public employment.

The perception is that generally, individuals are not dissatisfied with their wages, despite the decrease in the value of money and the increase of the consumer price index. Wages are applied uniformly in the central government. It is claimed that in the wider public sector, “there are too many positions for which wages are discretionary” (testimonial). The basis for the claim was the disparities that were identified in certain Statutory Boards and other public sector entities, including NIBJ and the BOJ in 1999. These disparities led to the rationalization of parastatals, the introduction of mechanisms for monitoring these agencies more closely and by implication, for tighter horizontal control of wages (Ministry Paper 53: 1999). Vertical compression of public sector wages in Jamaica falls within the stipulated range, (See Civil Service Incentive indicator discussed fully in this report).

There are no abusive practices to be found in wage decisions made regarding central government. The fixed pay structure that applies to central government employees does not apply to consultants and advisors to these agencies. “Consultants and advisors salaries are not included” (testimonial.).

In addition to the fixed pay structure there are benefits that include, loans to permanent staff, 20% duty free concession for traveling officers, contributory health schemes, transportation, and in some agencies day care centers. These benefits are not formally evaluated in terms of costs and benefits. This needs to be done.

An analysis of the existing non-contributory pension scheme raises issues of cost and adequacy. The pension scheme is a charge on the Consolidated Fund. An evaluation of the current scheme is being carried out. It is likely that consideration may be given to a contributory scheme. The adequacy of the pension scheme comes into question as “pension is not linked to the cost of living,” (testimonial). A cursory examination of the change in the consumer price index from 1997 to 2001 indicates that the cost of a basket of goods has moved from 1099.2 [in 1997] to 1459.9 [in 2001], (PIOJ, 2002, Economic and Social Survey Jamaica, unnumbered page entitled ‘Selected Economic & Social Indicators 1997-2001). Linking pension to the cost of living index is an issue that needs to be addressed.

Currently employees in central government are rewarded for long and meritorious service at Long Service Award ceremonies where the awardees usually receive certificates and medals. Efforts are being made to enhance the mechanisms for non-monetary recognition. These efforts are being initiated starting with the formalization of the relevant policy.

In summary, there is congruence and interconnection between the organization of labor and the compensation management sub-systems. This has provided the basis for a salary structure design that is transparent. A formalized performance management subsystem is expected to provide the information for variable payments.

Management Of Development

≪≪ *Putting in place appropriate policies and practices that result in the professional development of central government employees is a particularly challenging aspect of the CSS in Jamaica. In a context where “development is equated with continuous learning” (testimonial), the deliberate efforts of ministries and MoFP, the central agency with responsibility for the professional development of central government employees sometimes run counter to the demands of individual employees who are increasingly investing in themselves. Sometimes the precise development needs identified at the center that respond to national objectives clash with traditional needs identified by individual agencies. Although professionalism is emphasized in the implementation of promotion and training policies, this approach does not necessarily fully satisfy all the employees. Promotional opportunities are limited relative to the number of persons who are available or suited for promotion. Funding constraints limit the development opportunities. The result is that the expectations of some rather than all employees who consider themselves ready for promotion or professional development, are satisfied. MoFP has invested in the development of instruments for the analysis of training needs, as well as the assessment and evaluation of training, so as to enhance the professional development of central government employees.*

The stated purpose of the development management “is continuous learning, the new paradigm”. “Increasingly, individuals are investing in themselves” (testimonials). This is happening at a time when funds for development are limited. Apparently, there is sometimes dissonance created between the skills that are considered necessary to satisfy agencies’ objectives and the development focus of individual employees. With limited funds decisions have to be made to balance what is necessary and desirable with what is simply desirable. The current priority is apparently “the professional development of personnel in the medical and health areas” (testimonial).

Certain interconnections and processes are evident in the development management subsystem. There is interconnection with the employment management and the compensation management subsystems. Policy foci include succession planning as well as training. The Human Resource Management Committee chaired by the Minister of Education and which has representation from central government central and line agencies has responsibility to develop relevant policy and to institutionalize succession planning. The policy is being developed. “Succession plans exist for ninety percent of ministries of government, but these are not implemented” (testimonial). Apparently senior persons are sometimes retained on retirement. [This practice, arguably, has some merit---were many of these persons to leave the system entirely, important aspects of the institutional memory would in all likelihood be lost.]

Attempts to assess the effectiveness of the promotion policy did not lead to consensus about individuals’ satisfaction with their rate of promotion. In fact it was reported that 50% were satisfied with the policy and 50% were not. “Promotion criteria are in fact being refined for the general service” (testimonial). “There is no evidence of abuse in promotion practices.” It may however be argued that since only elements of performance management system are formalized, that this may limit the extent to which

individuals, based on their performance, may move upward freely without undue delays or feelings of demoralization. Horizontal careers are not formalized. There are however examples given of individuals who have moved laterally from technical to executive management positions. “Expectations are high as people are more qualified but posts are sometimes not available”; We are heading in the right direction where pay and posts harmonize with expectations. The succession plan will help”; “There are no alternatives to hierarchical careers and some career civil servants feel ‘put-upon’ when contract officers enter the organization and take up positions. This has led to resignations or low morale” (testimonials).

Training quality--Employees generally receive adequate on-the-job training and development from the organization. These training and development efforts, in all likelihood, facilitate upward mobility and support. Resource constraints exist. There is need to strengthen the MoFP training budget. It is likely that the extent to which all employees benefit may be limited given the funding constraints.

Training management is facilitated by the administration of training needs analysis. MoFP received help from the UWI with developing instruments for training needs analysis, training needs assessment, evaluation and impact evaluation. The needs analysis instrument is currently being tested. Training is generally therefore based on needs identified on an agency by agency basis and the needs identified tend to be traditional and sometimes based on the individual employee’s demand. Training evaluation is being formalized to give a sense of results and costs.

There is an obvious vision and effort to reform HRM and Training policy, the instruments, and their application.

Management of Human and Social Relations

≠≠ Human and social relations management in the Jamaican CSS is perceived as fulfilling its purpose when managers encourage a culture of concern [my emphasis]. Managers require personal competencies to do this. Innovative approaches to managing the organizational climate that encourage staff and improve their satisfaction sometimes clash with traditional civil service culture that tends not to encourage the use of specific communication instruments that “reinforce employees’ involvement and feelings of being valued,” (testimonial) . The OSC in its HRM auditing capacity, the Staff Associations /Unions and the changing dynamic from a ‘ personnel culture’ to HRM, collectively contribute to providing an informal assessment of the labor climate, in the absence of formalized techniques. The traditional approach to labor relations management is apparently gradually changing from being adversarial to one of accommodation. Social policies and practices exist in the Jamaican CSS and provide benefits and assistance to government employees. One of these initiatives, the Public Sector Assistance Program constitutes a best practice.

The stated object according to testimonials is “understanding the social person, and this is at the core of HRM”. The management of human and social relations also involves “motivating and understanding behavior”. Other testimonials refer to this HR subsystem as a priority for

successful HRM. Critical attitudes and behaviors are required by managers in order to manage these relations. There is little correlation between academic brilliance and effective management. There are increasingly more persons with degrees in the public sector, [yet] this has not meant that there is more effective management. Human and social relations management requires “tolerance, humility, earned respect, and effective communication skills” (summary of testimonials). There is a perception that a culture of concern [my emphasis] needs to permeate organizations.

In terms of relationships with other sub systems, human social and relationships, management “cuts across the grain of HRM and is necessary for understanding the benefits package” (testimonial).

The processes involved, in particular the management of the organizational climate, present certain weaknesses. It is claimed that the culture of the Civil Service is one that does not encourage the use of specific communication instruments to reinforce employee involvement and feelings of being valued. “There are no reliable instruments for evaluating the organizational climate”. The organization climate is apparently contingent on the organization leadership and the extent to which the leadership encourages a culture of concern [my emphasis]. Generally, staff meetings are not required nor are they necessarily regular. The regularity of meeting is contingent on the leadership/managers. It is also claimed that the current system of communications does not always work well. “Circulars are not necessarily seen by all employees that need to see them, nor are discussions always reported effectively”. All of these mechanisms have the potential to facilitate understanding of the organizational climate. Labor relations management is premised on established practice for dealing with salary and conditions of service negotiations. The CSA, other Associations and unions negotiate with the MoFP. Negotiation strategies are generally reactive.

Social policies management address specific needs. A major initiative is the Public Sector Employee Assistance Program (PSEAP). This program operates within a confidential framework. The program is staffed by trained and accredited counselors, and promotes wellness and support of government employees. The Manpower Development Division (MDD) of Mo FP and Mo H jointly provide counseling and referrals for persons experiencing personal problems. “Problems include but are not limited to stress, financial and legal difficulties, alcohol and drug abuse, interpersonal relations, changes in the organization”, (PSEAP Bulletin published by MDD & Mo H, undated). It is claimed that benefits are inadequate: Collectively, education, housing, transportation, and healthcare, are more costly to Go J the higher up the hierarchy one goes, yet it is argued that they do not constitute an excessive cost to government.

While there are no formalized techniques for assessing morale, reform initiatives in terms of the OSC’s new auditing and monitoring roles as well as the efforts of Staff Associations (unions), contribute to providing an informal assessment of the organizational climate. “Five years ago, the OSC was operating on automatic pilot. OSC did not know what was happening on the ground. Now with the auditing function OSC has a better feel [for what is going on]” (testimonial). Reports from unions to the OSC give some indication of the morale so that improvements to HRM policies and practices are experientially driven. The ‘personnel culture’

is changing to HR management. Shortages in HR have tended to be “dealt with reactively and centrally rather than proactively”, (testimonial).

The management of conflict turns on three issues: the degree of conflict, the existing power relations and the regulatory framework. The degree of conflict is not excessive. The consensus is that with the private sector downsizing, and the recognition by public sector workers that public sector jobs no longer provide security of tenure, that bargaining groups are reluctant to take industrial action. In terms of the balance of power, it is claimed that in the central government, “power resides in numbers. PSC insulates persons in the central government. Ninety percent (90%) of the public sector is ‘spoken for’ [by unions]. There is no ballot required for representation to take effect. Although many constituents are fearful to complain, their union or association will do this on their behalf. In certain parastatals that are politicized, power is weighted on the side of management” [testimonials summarized].

The existing regulatory framework at the macro level [LRIDA, Staff Orders and the Public Service Regulations] guides conflict resolution policy and practice. At the agency level there is no documented grievance procedure for central government. There is a disciplinary procedure that is effective when sanctions are imposed quickly.

Priority is being placed on health and safety within central government agencies. Proposed legislation will expand coverage to all entities including public sector entities.

The social and human relations management subsystem embraces a broad reach of elements that address leadership, communication, behavioral, welfare and health and safety issues.

The Human Resources Function Organization

≪≪ Generally, managers are adequately trained and developed for the task of managing the individuals under their supervision. Their decision- making roles are likely to be constrained when decisions are taken centrally. While Directors’ sense of responsibility was not in question, views were split regarding the adequacy of managerial capacity, in particular the personal competencies of some individuals at this level. The central agencies responsible for the CSS were perceived to add value when they performed strategic HR roles, namely monitoring and evaluation.

Funds permitting, managers are generally adequately trained to perform their managerial functions. These managers also have enough leeway to manage depending on whether decisions are made centrally or not. Directors conduct themselves responsibly. Views were however split on the capacity of some of these individuals to manage. While all managers usually are highly trained and educated the personnel competencies, attitudes, behaviors and interpersonal competencies, of some of these directors require enhancement (testimonials summarized). The new, auditing and monitoring roles of the OSC and other central agencies responsible for the CSS are perceived as desirable. These roles “facilitate better understanding of what is happening ‘on the ground’ in terms of HRM” (testimonial).

5.3 Organizational Analysis of Human Resources Function

The organizational design of the CSS in Jamaica is framed within the British model that is based on recruitment systems. This model places emphasis on professionalism and the insulation of those responsible for the management of employment from political influence. The organizational design has also incorporated elements from the systems management model. Aspects of this model are integrated while other aspects are fragmented.

The organizational design of the CSS in Jamaica is complex. The internal cultural context, which, is underpinned by a legacy of distrust, the propensity to centralize decisions and information, and intense relationships due to small country size, is adapting to democratization of society and the need for accountability and transparency.

There is fragmentation of certain HR responsibilities while others remain unified. There is also evidence of centralization of decision-making as well as decentralization of decisions. Fragmentation and unification are juxtaposed to centralization and decentralization of decision-making.

While this design may preserve professionalism and allow for flexibility and responsiveness to change, it operates outside of the strategic HR planning framework and is not likely to be as efficient as it might be.

There are some dysfunctions in the areas of the organization of labor (structures and positions), employment management and performance management that are likely to affect efficiency: Analysis of the Organization of Labor indicates there is reliance on “task specification that introduces rigidity in the allocation of work” and emphasis on formal education and qualifications to the exclusion of competencies. These dysfunctions in this subsystem inform the employment management function. The dysfunction related to the performance management subsystem is the absence of direct links between performance, performance evaluation and rewards.

5.4 Comparison with other analyses

Comparison with other analyses suggests the need for reforms in the following areas:

- ⌘ Continuing the efforts to replace the “personnel culture” with HRM
- ⌘ Continue the process of decentralization and ensuring that the expertise exists in the agencies and departments to develop competencies
- ⌘ Improving the functional flexibility by introducing more decentralized competency based mechanisms for recruitment and selection

6. CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM INDICES

The institutional diagnostic study of the CSS in Jamaica focused on five indices. Two of the indices Structural consistency and Functional capacity are divided into three sub indices. Descriptions of the indices and sub indices appear in Table 2. The indices and sub indices are listed:

Index **(E) Efficiency**

Index **(M) Merit**

Index **(SC) Structural consistency,**

Sub Indices (STC) Strategic coherence,(DC) Directive consistency, (CP) Consistency of processes

Index **(FC) Functional capacity**

Sub indices (COM) Competency, (IE) Incentive effectiveness, (FL) Flexibility

Index **(IC) Integrating capacity.**

The researcher constructed indices and sub indices using the valuations of the critical points as the bases. For a list of these valuations and the corresponding number of the critical points to which these values relate see Table 1. The sum of the valuations for an index, were divided by the number of critical points related to the index to get the (RV). To find the value corresponding to each index (IV) in the CSS in Jamaica the RV was compared with the index's maximum reference value (MRV) [a value provided in the framework] multiplied by twenty: $RV \times 20 / MRV = IV$. The value corresponding to each sub index (VS) was found using the formula $RV \times 10 / MRV = VS$. The VS corresponding to each index was "grouped and added and taking 20 as the maximum for each index, the value of each IV was calculated for each case" (Longo F. 2002: pp 72.) The final maximum value of each index, 20, provided a basis for comparing the IV of the respective indices relative to the CSS in Jamaica.

Overall the index that compared most favorably with the final maximum index value was Merit (IV) 15.85 Efficiency was least favorable by comparison with an (IV) of 5.85. Integrating capacity (IV) 11.41 indicates apparent limitations in terms of the capacity of the CSS to facilitate empowerment and to reduce conflict. These values correlate with the qualitative analysis of the CSS in Jamaica. Table 3 provides a summary of the indices in the CSS in Jamaica and their corresponding values, Tables 4-12 present individual tables reflecting each of the five indices and the process for deriving the respective values.

6.1 Efficiency

This index (IV) 5.85 evaluated the "degree of optimization of the investment in the human capital detectable in the CS system, as well as the alignment with the fiscal policy and relevant reference markets" Longo, F. 2002:69). This index is connected to thirteen critical points. These critical points reflect elements in the CSS that require strengthening. The areas include HR planning and its adequacy, in terms of the reliability of HR information system, mechanisms to facilitate HR planning, the evidence of surpluses and deficits in personnel, as well as policies that allow for optimization of staff and correct distribution of resources; By linking deployment issues to specified indicators, this provided evidence of components of the public sector that

apparently require further development. Other critical points measured by the Efficiency Index were the overall cost of public employment relative to the economy, evidence of cost benefit evaluations of non-monetary benefits and of training, and the adequacy of pension, social care and benefits. All of these elements are being addressed in either the context of the current public sector reform effort or as a component of reform vision articulated in the draft White Paper on reform issued by the Cabinet Office June 2002.

6.2 Merit

This index (IV) 15.8 evaluated the degree to which the CSS in Jamaica “incorporates through various policies and practices, guarantees of principles of professionalism, which protect against arbitrariness, politicization, and rent seeking. It is related to thirteen critical points”, (Longo, F. 2002: 62). These critical points concern the effectiveness of employment management, and evidence of abuse or politicization in wage decisions. The latter is not the norm in the central government, as wage and employment decisions are generally transparent. Professionalism is generally preserved in the employment subsystem.

6.3 Structural Consistency

This index (IV 9.43) was used to evaluate “the solidity and systemic integration of the CSS, giving attention to the degree to which all the basic structural elements that the CSS must have are present.” (Longo, F 2002:70). The sub indices, namely: Strategic coherence (VS:) 4 measured congruence of policies and practices in the CSS and the G o J’s priorities. Directive consistency (VS:) 4.72 measured the relationship between central agency executives and line agency managers with responsibility for HR; Consistency of processes (CP = VS) 4.17, sub index measured the capacity of basic processes to sustain an integrated CSS. Collectively, these sub indices are linked to twenty-nine critical points that reflected elements of HR Planning, Work organization, and Performance management. HR planning and performance management are subsystems of the CSS that are to be developed and formalized. They therefore have limited applicability in the current scheme of things. They are connected in a very limited way to the other subsystems.

6.4 Functional Capacity

This index (IV 10.15), evaluated the “capacity of the analyzed system to influence behavior effectively, while promoting the development of conduct and work performance suited to the organization’s priorities and aimed at improving public services” (Longo, F. 2002:70). Collectively the three sub indices, namely Competency (COM=VS) 6.13 [which, evaluated factors that drive the provision of public sector skills needs], Incentive effectiveness (IE =VS) 4.00 [that evaluated impulses for productivity learning and service quality] and Flexibility (FL=VS) 5.04 [that measured the extent to which “policies and practices analyzed facilitated adaptation”], are related to forty one critical points.

The results of the competency measure suggests that while individuals may have adequate technical skills, that the public sector may be better served if in matching these employees to tasks, emphasis was placed on these employees’ personal competencies as this balance of technical and personal competencies is likely to enhance productivity. This sub index also

measured the quality of the selection and recruitment processes and the adequacy of training in the CSS in Jamaica's central government agencies. Incentive effectiveness evaluated elements in several sub systems, namely work organization, employment management, performance management and development management and their likely effects on productivity. Flexibility in the design of roles, job descriptions, and job profiles, mechanisms that allow for mobility, including classification of roles by salary, alternatives to hierarchical careers, whether these allow for progression and are supported by relevant training. While horizontal careers are not formalized, this has not precluded lateral movement by individuals at high levels in terms of their status. Managers' job descriptions are designed in a manner that allow for innovations. At lower levels in the hierarchy the job descriptions are prescriptive.

6.5 Integrating Capacity

The Integrating capacity index (IV) 11.41, evaluated the "effectiveness with which the CSS seemed able to ensure the harmonization of the expectations and interests of different players (management, employees and other interest groups), increasing the feeling of ownership and reducing conflict. It is connected to nineteen critical points" (Longo, F. 2002: 70).

The critical points covered a range of issues related to employment, performance, compensation and social and human relations management. While weaknesses emerged in the areas of induction, performance management, and communications mechanisms to facilitate knowledge of people's needs, there were also strengths identified. These include, mechanisms for open recruitment that are transparent and encourage values of equity and fairness, a level of satisfaction with contributions versus rewards, a stable labor relations climate that is becoming more accommodating and less adversarial.

Overall, the use of the indices and sub indices as tools to evaluate the CSS complemented the outcomes of the functional analysis as well as reinforced aspects of the functional analysis of the CSS in Jamaica. These results enhance the validity of the methodology.

7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Analysis of causal areas

- ✎✎ Organizational strategy: The effective management of public employment and HR in the administration analyzed is a stated priority of the GoJ. Although a vision for comprehensive HRM has been articulated, this has not been transformed into a coherent and explicit strategy for HRM. This transformation will require the commitment of all the stakeholders, namely, the political directorate, HR managers, unions, executives, managers and staff. (i) Articulate a coherent and explicit strategy for HRM that all the stakeholders commit to.

- ✎✎ The HRM system: Elements of a HRM system exists. (i) Develop an integrated HRM system. In the absence of an integrated HRM system the efficiency of the CSS suffers. Efficiency [the value of the efficiency index] in the CSS is approximately twenty five percent of its potential value. This suggests a likely need for HR planning and staff optimization. (ii) Develop a HR planning subsystem that is supported by a HR management information system. HR Planning will give direction to strategic HRM and facilitate staff optimization. (iii) Address staff optimization at the line agency and central agency levels. Staff optimization is likely to require functional flexibility at the line agency level and the development of necessary expertise to facilitate more decentralized, competency based mechanisms for recruitment and selection. Matching persons to jobs is currently undertaken with professionalism in the CSS in Jamaica. A key tool required for this process is the job description that is prepared by an expert and accurately reflects the educational qualifications, tasks, and the technical knowledge and skills required for the job. Contemporary HRM practice places emphasis on competencies that help an individual to perform a job successfully. Competencies include interpersonal effectiveness, learning and behavioral capacities and problem solving. Competencies together with technical skills are considered to be better predictors of successful job performance rather than reliance on technical skills alone. (iv) In keeping with contemporary HRM practices develop suitable profiles that emphasize competencies. The optimization of resources is likely to require suitable job profiles that incorporate competencies and technical skills, to facilitate the process. It is desirable that the profiles are developed within the framework of policies for HRM and HR planning. These policies and related programs and practices, will aid the structural consistency within the CSS as well as its functional capacity.

- ✎✎ Factors in the Context: The influences from the unique culture and the intensity of relationships because of small size are some of the considerations to be taken into account when policies, structures, practices and relationships differ from established norms. (i) Current emphasis on institutionalizing change management programs is desirable to facilitate commitment to and ownership of the changes envisioned. (ii) By institutionalizing induction programs in all central government agencies this is also likely to encourage new values and attitudes that are necessary to support change. (iii) A strengthened PSC that incorporates full time members [in addition to the part-time

members that currently exist] would enhance its capacity to undertake its strategic roles of auditing, monitoring and evaluating [changes taking place].

7.2 Main Conclusions of the diagnostic study

The GoJ has demonstrated its commitment to developing a CSS that works. Since the milestone in 1949 that led to the setting up of the PSC, and subsequent incorporation of other central agencies to give policy direction to the CSS, efforts to improve the management of public employment and human resources in the central government agencies in Jamaica have been on going. In keeping with contemporary HRM practice, current initiatives to modernize the CSS have included decentralization. The government has also articulated its vision for improving HRM structures and practices. This vision is being transformed into a coherent HR strategy that will require the commitment of all the stakeholders.

The hallmarks of the organizational design for the CSS in the central government of Jamaica are its emphases on professionalism and on insulating the persons responsible for the employment management function from political influence. Decentralization is an apparent shift that replaces insulation from political control with bureaucratic control.

This paradigmatic shift is occurring without the benefit of an integrated HRM system that incorporates all of the HRM sub systems, namely, *human resource planning, work organization, employment management, *performance management, compensation management, development management, human and social relations management. The design and development of the planning and performance management subsystems are elements of the vision for reforming the CSS. In the absence of an integrated HRM system the efficiency of the CSS has apparently suffered. Improving efficiency will in all likelihood depend on staff optimization and on human resource planning that is supported by a reliable HR management information system. In keeping with contemporary HRM practices, there is a need to make managerial practices more flexible, with an emphasis on functional flexibility and the development of suitable profiles that emphasize competencies. The optimization of resources is likely to require suitable job profiles that incorporate competencies and technical skills, to facilitate the process.

7.3 Proposals for Improvement

- ⌘⌘ Articulate a coherent and explicit strategy for HRM that all the stakeholders commit to.
- ⌘⌘ Develop an integrated HRM system.
- ⌘⌘ Institute HR planning that is supported by a reliable HR management information system. HR Planning will give direction to strategic HRM and facilitate staff optimization.
- ⌘⌘ Address staff optimization by making managerial practices more flexible, with the emphasis on suitable job profiles that emphasize competencies.
- ⌘⌘ Maintain current emphasis on institutionalizing change management programs in central government agencies to facilitate commitment to and ownership of the changes envisioned. These programs to be set up in departments as well as ministries.
- ⌘⌘ Institutionalize induction programs in all central government agencies so as to encourage new values and attitudes that are necessary to support change.

☞ Strengthen the PSC's capacity by incorporating full time members to provide on an ongoing basis, guidance and direction for undertaking its strategic roles of monitoring and evaluating changes taking place.

LIST OF APPENDICES

1. List of Interviewees /Panelists
2. Office of the Services Commissions: Public Service Commission Citizen’s Charter (Brochure)
3. Draft White Paper on Public Sector Modernization Vision and Strategy 2010 (Brochure)
1. Critical Points
5. OPM (Cabinet Office) Job Description Questionnaire
6. Job Advertisement Ministry of Health
7. Performance Evaluation Report forms [Central Government evaluation instruments that are in general use: ‘Annual Performance Report Form’ and ‘Public and Support Services’ Form P14]
8. MIND Performance Review (Part 1): Management Competencies. [Sample of an Executive agency’s instrument for assessing performance]
9. Tables

LIST OF TABLES

1. Valuations of the Critical Points
2. Descriptions of Indices and Sub Indices
3. Summary of Values Corresponding to Indices derived for the CSS in Jamaica
4. Efficiency Index CSS Jamaica
5. Merit Index CSS Jamaica
6. Integrating Capacity Index CSS Jamaica
7. Structural Consistency (SC) Index & Strategic Coherence Sub Index CSS Jamaica
8. SC Index: Directive Consistency Sub Index CSS Jamaica
9. SC Index:: Consistency of Processes Sub Index CSS Jamaica
10. Functional Capacity (FC) Index & Competence Sub Index CSS Jamaica
11. FC Index: Incentive Effectiveness Sub Index CSS Jamaica
12. FC Index: Flexibility Sub Index CSS Jamaica

APPENDIX 1

LIST OF PERSONS CONSULTED

The Jamaica Civil Service Association

Mr. Wayne Jones, President

Ministry of Education, Youth and Culture

Mrs. Paulette Morgan- Senior Director, Human Resources Management & Administration

Mr. Jasper Lawrence- Regional Director, Region IV

Mr. Errol Levy, Regional Director, Region 1

Management Institute for National Development

Mrs. Maria Jones, CEO

Ministry of Finance and Planning

Mrs. Patricia Richardson, Deputy financial Secretary, Public Service Establishment Division

Mrs. Carol Jones, Deputy Financial Secretary, Public Enterprise Division

Mr. Dennis Townsend, Head, Compensation Unit

Mrs. Hyacinth Ainsworth, Head, Superannuation Unit

Mrs. Cecile Claire, Head, Conditions of Service Unit

Mrs. Sharon Callen, Director Management Services Unit,(MDB)

Ms. Michelle Diaz, Director, Planning and Research (MDB)

Mrs. Judith Maloney, Principal Director, Management Development Branch (MDB)

Mr. Errol Miller, Director Industrial Relations

Mrs. Hinds-Brown, Senior Director, Compensation Unit

Mr. Denzil Plummer, Senior Director, Human Resources Management Information System

Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Foreign Trade

Ambassador Stafford Neil, Permanent Secretary

Mrs. Beverly Harrison, Director, Human Resources Management

Ministry of Health

Dr. Marjorie Holding-Cobham, Director, Policy Planning & Development

Mr. Lloyd Maxwell, Director, Human Resources & Corporate Services Division

Mrs. Leurice Brown, Director, Human Resources Management & Development

Mr. Owen Belvett, Director, Regional Health Authority

Ministry of Labour and Social Security

The Hon. Anthony Irons, O.J. C.D. Senior Advisor

Mr. Gresford Smith, Director, Industrial Relations Services

Mr. Derrick Jackson, Assistant Director, Industrial Safety Division

Ministry of National Security

Mrs. Roslyn McKenzie, Director of Human Resources Management

Office of the Prime Minister

Mr. George Briggs, Head, Public Sector Reform Unit

Mrs. Carol Royes, Director, Performance Management Unit

Office of the Cabinet

Dr. Hon. Carlton Davis, Cabinet Secretary

Ms. Kirby L. Clarke, Director, Information Systems & Special Projects

Office of the Services Commissions

Mr. Earl Madden, Retired Chief Personnel Officer

Mr. Charles Jones, Chief Personnel Officer

Mrs. Joan Mudahy, Deputy Chief Personnel Officer

Ms. Lois Parkes, Deputy Chief Personnel Officer

University of the West Indies

Professor Edwin Jones, Prof. Public Administration

Mrs. Deborah Belle-Smythe, Senior Registrar, Appointments

Solicitor General

Dr. Kenneth Rattray, Senior Consultant Advisor to the Government /former Solicitor General

Members of the Public

Mrs. Yvonne Walters

Mrs. Marie Slyfield, (Both retired recently from the public service)

APPENDIX 2

Office of the Services Commissions: Public Service Commission Citizen's Charter (Brochure)

To Be Sent Under Separate Cover

APPENDIX 3

Draft White Paper on Public Sector Modernization Vision and Strategy 2010 (Brochure)

To Be Sent Under Separate Cover

APPENDIX 4

Critical Points

To Be Sent Under Separate Cover

APPENDIX 5

OPM (Cabinet Office) Job Description Questionnaire

To Be Sent Under Separate Cover

APPENDIX 6

Job Advertisement Ministry of Health

To Be Sent Under Separate Cover

APPENDIX 7

Performance Evaluation Report forms [Central Government evaluation instruments that are in general use: 'Annual Performance Report Form' and 'Public and Support Services' Form P14]

To Be Sent Under Separate Cover

APPENDIX 8

MIND Performance Review (Part 1): Management Competencies. [Sample of an Executive agency's instrument for assessing performance]

To Be Sent Under Separate Cover

APPENDIX 9

Table 1 - Valuations of Critical Points

Subsystems	Critical Points	Indices or Sub Indices	Valuation
PLANNING	1	STC, CP	2, 2
	2	STC	9
	3	STC, FL	2,2
	4	CP	3
	5	E	3
	6	E	6
	7	E	3
	8	E	2
	9	COM	6
	10	DC	2
	11	STC	3
ORGANNIZATION OF LABOR	12	CP	6
	13	FL	12
	14	CP	3
	15	FL	6
	16	FL, IE	2,2
	17	CP	3
	18	COM	3
	19	COM	2
	20	COM	4
	21	COM	6
	22	FL	2
	23	DC	3
	MANAGEMENT OF EMPLOYMENT	24	M, COM
25		M	12
26		M	15
27		M, IC	12,12
28		COM	6
29		COM	6
30		M, COM	6,9
31		M, COM	12, 12
32		M, COM	12
33		IC	2
34		COM	2
35		FL	9
36		E	2
37		IE	2
38		M	8
39	IE, FL	6,4	
40	FL	6	
41	E	6	
PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT	42	STC, IE	6,2
	43	IE	2
	44	IE,IC	4,1
	45	DC, IE	2,2
	46	IE	3
	47	CO, IE	1,2
	48	IC	2
	49	DC	2

COMPENSATION MANAGEMENT	50	STC	8
	51	IC, IE	6,3
	52	IC	6
	53	FL	6
	54	COM	9, 9
	55	IE	8, 8
	56	CP	6
	57	E	DATA NOT AVAILABLE
	58	IE	6
	59	CP	9
	60	M	6
	61	CP	3
	62	E	1
	63	E	3
64	IE	2	
DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT	65	IC	6
	66	CP	2
	67	IE	6
	68	M	8
	69	FL	4
	70	FL	2
	71	COM	6
	72	COM	3
	73	FL	3
	74	CP	2
	75	STC,E	3, 3
76	CP, E	2, 2	
HUMAN AND SOCIAL RELATIONS	77	IC	2
	78	IC	2
	79	IC	3
	80	CP	2
	81	IC	2
	82	CP, IC	6, 9
	83	IC	6
	84	IC	9
	85	IC	3
	86	IC	12
	87	IC	8
88	IC	3	
89	E, IC	4,3	
THE HUMAN RESOURCES FUNCTION ORGANIZATION	90	DC	6
	91	DC	3
	92	DC	9
	93	DC	6

INDEX 1. (E) EFFICIENCY

INDEX 2. (M) MERIT

INDEX 3. (SC) STRUCTURAL CONSISTENCY

SUB INDICES STC, DC, CP

INDEX 4. (FC) FUNCTIONAL CAPACITY

SUB INDICES COM, IE, FL

INDEX 5. (IC) INTEGRATIVE CAPACITY

Table 2 - Descriptions Of Indices And Sub Indices

INDEX/ SUB INDEX	DESCRIPTION
(E) Efficiency	This index evaluates the degree of optimization of the investment in human capital detectable in the CSS, as well as the alignment with the scale of the fiscal policy and its reference markets. It is related to 13 critical points
(M) Merit	This index evaluates the degree in which the CS system incorporates guarantees of the use of professionalism criteria in its different policies and practices, protecting them from abuse, politicization and corruption. It is related to 10 critical points
(SC) Structural consistency	This index evaluates the solidity and systemic integration of the CS, giving attention to the degree to which all the basic structural elements, that a system of public employment and human resources management must have, are present. It is divided in three sub indices: (STC) Strategic Coherence: this values the degree in which the different employment and human resource management policies and practices are linked to the strategic governmental priorities. (DC) Directive Consistency includes valuations of the level of development of the directive function in the CSS with special attention to the relationship between the central techno-structure and the line directives and (CP) Consistency of processes: this sub index values the degree of development and integration in the analyzed area, of the basic processes that sustain an integrated employment and the HRM system.
(FC) Functional Capacity	This index evaluates the capacity of the analyzed CSS to influence public employees behavior effectively, promoting the development of work conduct that suits the organization’s priorities and aimed at improving the public services. It is divided into three sub indices: (COM) Competency: This incorporates the evaluation of those personnel policies and practices that most directly affect the design supply, development and stimulus of employees abilities and tend to ensure the provision of the key skills that the public system needs (IE) Incentive effectiveness: this sub index measures the degree to which the personnel management policies and practices incorporate positive stimuli for productivity, learning and service quality (FL) Flexibility measures the degree that the analyzed policies and practices incorporate guidelines that facilitate the adaptation to change, overcoming bureaucratic rigidity and alignment to flexible tendencies that characterize the actual directions of personnel management
(IC) Integrating Capacity	This index evaluates the effectiveness with which the CSS seems able to ensure the harmonization of the expectations and interests of different players (management, employees and other interest groups), increasing the feeling of ownership and reducing conflict. It is related to 19 critical points

Source: Inter-American Development Bank
Regional Policy Dialogue

Longo, Francisco. (2002)
Analytical Framework for Evaluating Civil Service Systems
Appendix 4

Table 3 - Summary of Indices derived for the CSS in Jamaica

SUMMARY OF INDICES

INDEX	IV	FINAL MAXIMUM VALUE OF INDEX
EFFICIENCY	5.85	20
MERIT	15.85	20
STRUCTURAL CONSISTENCY	9.43	20
FUNCTIONAL CAPACITY	10.15	20
INTEGRATING CAPACITY	11.41	20
TOTAL		100

Table 4 – Efficiency Index CSS Jamaica

EFFICIENCY

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	IV
5	3				
6	6				
7	3				
8	2				
36	2				
41	6				
56	Does not appear to be linked to E on checklist				
57	NO DATA				
62	1				
63	3				
75	3				
76	2				
89	4	35	2.7	9.23	5.85

RV X 20 /MRV =IV = 5.85

E = IV = 5.85

Table 5 – Merit Index CSS Jamaica

MERIT

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	IV
24	12				
25	12				
26	15				
27	12				
30	6				
31	12				
32	12				
38	8				
60	6				
68	8				
		103	10.3	13	15.85

RV X 20 /MRV =IV = 15.85

M = IV = 15.85

Table 6 - Integrating Capacity Index CSS Jamaica

INTEGRATING CAPACITY

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	IV
27	12				
33	2				
44	1				
48	2				
51	6				
52	6				
65	6				
77	2				
78	2				
79	3				
81	2				
82	9				
83	6				
84	9				
85	3				
86	12				
87	8				
88	3				
89	3	97	5.1	8.94	11.41

RV X 20 /MRV =IV = 11.41

IC =IV =11.41

Table 7 - Structural Consistency [SC] Index and Strategic Coherence Sub Index CSS Jamaica

**STRUCTURAL CONSISTENCY [SC]
INDEX**

Structural Consistency [SC] Index: IV = 9.43

SC Sub Index: Strategic Coherence VS = 4.00

SC Sub Index: Directive Consistency VS = 4.72

SC Sub Index: Consistency of the Processes VS = 4.17

Total 12. 89

SC =IV = 12. 89 [sum of VSs] x 20 \ [sum of MRVs] 27.32 = 9.43

SC Sub Index Strategic Coherence (STC)

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	VS
1	1				
2	9				
3	2				
11	3				
42	2				
50	8				
75	3				
		28	4	10	4.00

RV x 10/ MRV= VS = 4.00

STC= VS = 4.00

Table 8 –Structural Consistency Sub Index: Directive Consistency CSS Jamaica

STRUCTURAL CONSISTENCY [SC]

Sub Index Directive Consistency (DC)

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	VS
10	2				
23	3				
45	2				
49	2				
90	6				
91	3				
92	9				
93	6				
		33	4.13	8.75	4.72

RV X 10 / MRV= VS = 4.72

DC=VS= 4.72

Table 9 –Structural Consistency Sub Index Consistency of Processes CSS Jamaica

STRUCTURAL CONSISTENCY [SC]

Sub Index Consistency of the Processes (CP)

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	VS
1	2				
4	3				
12	6				
14	3				
17	3				
47	1				
56	6				
59	9				
61	3				
66	2				
74	2				
76	2				
80	2				
82	6				
		50	3.57	8.57	4.17

RV x 10 / MRV =VS =4.17

CP = VS =4.17

Table 10 - Functional Capacity (FC) Index and Competence Sub Index CSS Jamaica

FUNCTIONAL CAPACITY INDEX

Functional Capacity [FC] Index: IV = 10.15

FC Sub Index: Competence VS = 6.13

FC Sub Index: Incentive Effectiveness VS= 4.00

FC Sub Index: Flexibility VS= 5.04

Total 15.17

IV = 15.17 [sum of VSs] x 20 \ [sum of MRVs] 29.88 = 10.15

FC Sub Index Competence (COM)

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	VS
9	6				
18	3				
19	2				
20	4				
21	6				
24	12				
28	6				
29	6				
30	9				
31	12				
32	12				
34	2				
54	9				
71	6				
72	3				
		98	6.53	10.66	6.13

RV x 10 / MRV =VS = 6.13

COM =VS =6.13

Table 11 – Functional Capacity Sub Index Incentive Effectiveness CSS Jamaica

FUNCTIONAL CAPACITY (FC)

Sub Index Incentive Effectiveness (I E)

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	VS
16	2				
37	2				
39	6				
42	6				
43	2				
44	4				
45	2				
46	3				
47	2				
51	3				
55	8				
58	6				
64	2				
67	6				
		54	3.86	9.64	4.00

RV x 10 / MRV = VS = 4.00
IE = VS = 4.00

Table 12 – Functional Capacity Sub Index Flexibility CSS Jamaica

FUNCTIONAL CAPACITY

Sub Index Flexibility (FL)

CP	VALUES	TOTAL	RV	MRV	VS
3	2				
13	12				
15	6				
16	2				
22	2				
35	9				
39	4				
40	6				
53	6				
69	4				
70	2				
73	3				
		58	4.83	9.58	5.04

RV x 10 / MRV = VS = 5.04

FL = VS = 5.04

WORKS CONSULTED

Baker, Randall (1992) *Public Administration: In Small and Island States* Kumarian Press Inc. : Connecticut

Balsom, R. (April 2001) *Human Resource Management Information System, Human Resource Policy and Procedure Review* prepared for the Cabinet Office, Kingston: Jamaica

Bekke, Hans A. G. M./ Perry, James L./ Toonen, Theo A. J. (1996) *Civil Service Systems – In Comparative Perspective* Indiana University Press

Cabinet Office August 20,1997) *Corporate Planning Manuel* Cabinet Office. Kingston: Jamaica

Cabinet Office (Draft White Paper June 2002). *Public Sector Modernization Vision and Strategy 2010* Cabinet Office. Kingston: Jamaica

Cabinet Office (2000) *Permanent Secretary's Performance Agreement Proforma 2000* Cabinet Office. Kingston: Jamaica

Government of Jamaica (August 31,2002). *Corporate Planning Guide and Template*. Kingston: Jamaica

Labour Relations and Industrial Relations Act, 8th April 1975 Government of Jamaica

Mills, Gladstone E. (1990). *A Reader in Public Policy and Administration*. Institute of Social and Economic Research. Kingston: Jamaica

Office of the Services Commissions (March 29, 2000). *Delegations of Functions Under the Public Service Regulations (1961) OSC Delegation / Agreement*. Office of the Services Commissions. Kingston: Jamaica

Fordham, J. (April 2001) *Human Resource Management Information Systems (HRMIS) Evaluation and Review*. Canadian Executive Services

Jamaica Constitution Order in Council, 1962: Statutory Instruments 1962. No.1550 Caribbean and North Atlantic Territories. Government of Jamaica. Kingston; Jamaica.

Jamaica Employers Federation (2001) *Wage, Salary & Benefits Survey for Supervisory, Clerical & Hourly Rated Employees 2001*. JEF. Kingston: Jamaica

Jamaica Employers Federation (2000) *Salary & Benefits Survey for Executive & Managerial Staff 2000*. JEF. Kingston: Jamaica

James, B. Working Paper: *Ministry of Local Government Community Development and Sport: Delegation of Human Resource Management Functions*. Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Local Government Community and Sport, November 29,2002.

Madden, Earl R. (January 2002) *The History of the Public Service Commission of Jamaica* unpublished, Office of the Services Commissions. Kingston: Jamaica

Mills, Gladstone E. (1973) *The Environment of Commonwealth Caribbean Bureaucracies* Extract from the International Review of Administrative Sciences, Vol. XXXIX, No. 1, pp. 2 - 12

Mills, Gladstone E. (1997) *Westminster Style Democracy : The Jamaican Experience* Grace Kennedy Foundation. Kingston: Jamaica

Ministry of Finance and Planning (January 1996) *Handbook on Government's Financial Administration and Guidelines to Functions Delegated by the Ministry of Finance and Planning* MoFP. Kingston: Jamaica

Ministry of Finance and Planning (April 2002) *Jamaica Public Sector Entities Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for the Year Ending March 2003* MoFP. Kingston: Jamaica

Ministry of Health Regional Health Authority *Human Resources Policy & Procedures Grievance & Disciplinary Procedures Disciplinary Code* undated. Kingston: Jamaica

Ministry of Labour and Social Security (2002) *Statistical Bulletin 2001* MoLSS) Kingston: Jamaica

Nettleford, Rex ed. (1989) *Jamaica in Independence : Essays on the Early Years* Heinemann Caribbean: Kingston

Office of the Services Commissions Pamphlet (2000) *Delegation Under the Public Public Service Regulations (1961)* Kingston: Jamaica

Patterson, P. J. Prime Minister (October 25, 1999) *Ministry Paper No. 53 of 1999 Statutory Corporations and Government Companies* Kingston: Jamaica

Planning Institute of Jamaica (April 2002) *Economic and Social Survey Jamaica 2001* PIOJ Kingston: Jamaica

Planning Institute of Jamaica (2002) *Economic Update & Outlook Labour Market Information Newsletter Vol. 6 No. 3 October – December 2001* PIOJ Kingston: Jamaica

Planning Institute Of Jamaica (2001) *Jamaica Human Development Report 2000* PIOJ Kingston: Jamaica

Planning Institute of Jamaica / The Statistical Institute of Jamaica (April 2002) *Jamaica Survey of Living Conditions 2001* PIOJ / STATIN Kingston: Jamaica

Planning Institute of Jamaica (2001) *The Labor Market Information News Letter of Jamaica*. Issue Number 41, February 2002 pp11 in Economic update & Outlook PIOJ Kingston: Jamaica

Statistical Institute of Jamaica (2002) *National Income and Product 2001* STATIN [Kingston, Jamaica]

Statistical Institute of Jamaica (2002) *The Labour Force 2001* STATIN Kingston: Jamaica

The Civil Service Establishments Act (General) Order 2001. Ministry of Finance & Planning. Kingston: Jamaica

The National Health Services Act,(1997).Government of Jamaica. Kingston: Jamaica

World Bank (April 2002) *World Development Indicators 2002* The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank Washington, D.C.